

Accreditation of Study Programmes Assessment Report

Institution: The University of European Political and Economic Studies (USPEE) "Constantin Stere", Republic of Moldova

Study programme: Business Law (Master)

Assessment committee:

Dr Mihai Floroiu (Chair) — Professor, Head of Legal Studies Department, Faculty of Legal, Social and Political Sciences,

"Dunarea de Jos" University of Galati, Romania

Dr Aušra Raulickyte — Adviser to the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Moldova

Ms Stela Buiuc — Deputy Director, Centre for Legal Approximation, Ministry of Justice, Moldova; PhD Student,

Law Department, State University of Moldova

Coordinator: Tiia Bach, Estonian Quality Agency for Higher and Vocational Education, Estonia

Dates of the assessment visit: May 25, 2015

Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA: 7 July 2015

Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation: 21 July 2015

Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 3 votes in favour and 0 votes against.

Date: 24 August 2015



I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development		х	
Teaching and learning	x		
Teaching staff		x	
Students		х	
Resources	х		

General introduction:

The University of European Political and Economic Studies "Constantin Stere" is a private higher education institution, the successor of the Institute of Political Studies and International Relations (IPSIR) founded on 28 July 1997. In 2007, IPSIR was re-organized into European Political and Economic Studies (USPEE) with the mission to provide higher education in law, economics, international relations, political science, and ecology. The university has, therefore, 4 faculties: the Faculty of Economics; the Faculty of Ecology and Environmental Protection; the Faculty of International Relations and Political Science; and the Faculty of Law. The Faculty of Law is providing programmes in law at Bachelor's (Cycle I, license), Master's level (Cycle II) and Doctoral level (Cycle III).

The professional Master programme "Business Law", which is being evaluated, is a programme with the duration of 1.5 years and volume of 90 ECTS, conducted in the form of full-time studies.



The Committee was asked to assess the conformity of the Master study programme in Business Law to Moldovan legislation and to national and international standards in five assessment areas: study programme and its development; teaching and learning; staff; students; and resources. The Committee would like to thank the representatives of the University for open discussions during the visit as well as for the Self-Evaluation Report which was clear and well written, containing all the necessary annexes.

Comments:

Study programme development: The University and the Faculty of Law have strategic development plans and action plans; yet, the action plan should be more detailed and not simply reflecting the usual activities of the units, but also support reaching concrete aims and objectives of the strategic development plan of both the university and the Faculty. The structure of the Master programme is such that there are no optional disciplines and it is therefore not in full compliance with requirements foreseen in the Framework Plan approved by Order of the Ministry of Education. There should be better understanding among the lecturers teaching on the programme, what the objectives and outcomes of the study programme are. The meetings provided evidences that the student workload of independent work is not clearly regulated and is not meeting the requirement of 90 ECTS credits. Internship is not well linked with the study programme objectives, since some of the students are allowed to perform internship in the institutions not related directly with law. The content and learning outcomes of the programme are not fully internationally comparable: the programme is not supporting the development of research skills, and some learning outcomes are not directly related with the content of the disciplines nor supported by the studies and internship. The majority of lecturers do not include the sources of other than Romanian and Russian literature in their course programmes. There also seems to be no clear logic of distinction between the fundamental and specialised disciplines of the study programme. The development of the study programme, in general, takes into consideration the needs of the labour market. And it is very positive that the university has created a Consultative Council, which is comprised by main employers and which provides proposals related with organization of the study process. But it should be noted that these employers represent only a very specific segment of the labour market. Foreign language skills of students need to be improved considerably in order to allow and encourage them to continue studies in foreign countries. This applies also to teaching staff, amongst which only some speak foreign languages.

Teaching and learning process: The organisation of studies and internships are well regulated. The internal regulations related to the study process are available on the university's website. Teachers use a variety of interactive teaching methods and students get feedback from teachers on the results of the assessment. Unlike in other institutions the Committee members visited, the grades for the examinations were sufficiently varied and not all had excellent results. However, not all students' internship places are directly related with the field of law and thus the university should establish cooperation relations with the key public authorities described in the curriculum for the internship purposes. The materials that are used in the teaching process should be more up-dated and diverse. Likewise, students should be involved in research activities much more and the quality of the Master thesis need to be improved.



Although the university has cooperation agreements with the representatives of the labour market, cooperation should be extended beyond the enterprises which are founded by the university or are affiliated to the university, for example with public authorities which, are important for the learning outcomes of the MA programme.

Staff: Although the teaching staff seems to fulfil the requirements, one of the full-time staff members does not have a PhD degree and only a few have had real international experiences. Foreign teaching staff is not regularly involved in the implementation of the study programme. Despite the fact that a system for improvement of the skills of the teaching staff is put in place, the Committee could determine that many of the staff members lack motivation to go abroad, mainly because not all of them speak other foreign languages, apart from Russian. Also, a limited number of staff members have been actively involved in international networks.

Most of the conferences in which the staff has participated have been held in only Moldova or Romania, and during discussions with the teaching staff many of them did not demonstrate a clear understand of the concept of an international research database.

However, the fact that some of the teaching staff are also involved in practical legal activities related to the disciplines taught can be considered positive. Quite active participation on national level conferences is also commendable. Research activities are planned and monitored effectively. Additionally, from discussions with teaching staff and management of the university, a system of further developing the research activities is in place.

Students: The admission requirements are clear. However, the number of enrolled students is not stable and varies significantly which poses some threats to the sustainability of the MA programme. The foreign language skills could not be demonstrated by students. Students benefit of some career guidance and psychological counselling. However, the career guidance centre was not yet established and the focus is very much on the enterprises founded by or affiliated to the university without taking into consideration the labour market at the national level. The antiplagiarism soft exists, but the there is still need for more research oriented activities and a better quality of the Master thesis in terms of the used resources. Due to the small number of the graduates, the university manages to track the employment of its graduates and the alumni association facilitates the collection of the necessary data. The university has a Centre for mobility opportunities which is able to provide adequate advice for students. However, it seems that mobility opportunities for the students of the MA programme are not available currently and the university only plans to develop cooperation relations for developing mobility projects and offering joint diplomas for the MA students, particularly those enrolled for the MA programme in Business Law. Notwithstanding the positive employment rate, it is considered that the sustainability of the MA programme and its development could benefit by a greater openness of the programme to a larger segment of the labour market. The drop-out rates have increased in the last years and more effective measures are needed to address this issue.

Resources: Financial resources of the university are sufficient for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff. Also, the number of students and graduates in the Business Law programme on the one hand and budget of USPEE on the other indicate sustainability.



Investments into the material base have decreased starting from 2013, and it is recommended to consider spending more for the improvement of the material base. The university has the necessary and sufficient facilities for conducting studies. The Committee was impressed by the fact that several classrooms have interactive boards which are used by teaching staff and students.

The library has a sufficient number of study literature and specialised periodicals in law. However, there is no access to online databases (on-line access to universities' journals from different countries, books and other documents), and this shortcoming should be dealt with immediately. Also, teaching staff members make a confusion between international online databases and Google / other similar research engines.

Commendations:

- Teaching staff is involved also in practical activities in the field of law, even at management level of different relevant institutions (lawyers, judges).
- Participation in conferences, although many of them are at national level.
- Scientific production and a clear research plan for the 2014-2019 period.
- A well-functioning anti-plagiarism software is in place.
- Existence of a tracking mechanism of the graduates and an alumni association.
- Study process is facilitated by well-equipped classrooms, including usage of new technologies such, as interactive boards by teachers and students alike.

Recommendations:

- Since the study programme does not include optional disciplines, and is thus not in full compliance with requirements foreseen in the Framework Plan established by the Ministry of Education, it is recommended to ensure full compliance of the study program with the normative acts in force.
- It is recommended to involve more closely the teaching staff in discussions within the Chair on the objectives of the study programme and their role in achieving the objectives.
- It is recommended to ensure that students' workload of independent work is meeting the requirements of 90 ECTS credits by revising the teaching and learning methods and requirements and to ensure that students' internship is taking place only in the institutions directly related with the business law application.
- It is recommended to provide students with possibilities to learn foreign languages, to include in the programmes of disciplines obligatory materials in foreign languages (English/French) and to encourage students to continue doctoral level studies in foreign countries.



- Ensure that that more up-dated and diversified teaching materials are used in the courses of the programme.
- Establish cooperation relations with larger segment of the labour market for the internship purposes and with the key public authorities described in the curriculum (such as the Ministry of Economy, Finance and Agriculture) and ensure that all the internships places are related with and contribute to achieving the learning outcomes of the MA programme in Business Law.
- Encourage students' involvement in research activities and ensure that the MA theses are more research oriented and improve the quality of the Master theses in terms of the used resources.
- Encourage the finalisation of PhD studies of one full-time member staff in order to attain the legal threshold.
- More visiting professors should be included in the implementation of the programme foreign institutions and possibilities found to enhance the international experience of the university's own academic staff.
- Promote the MA programme and ensure its sustainability by considering the needs of a broader segment of the labour market.
- Improve the foreign language skills of its students and teaching staff.
- Establish the career guidance centre.
- Provide more mobility opportunities for its MA students.
- Undertake effective measures for reducing the high drop-out rate.
- It is recommended to ensure the access to online databases and legal journals for the teaching staff and students in shortest possible term.

II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	

Collected evidence:

- The University Strategic development plans for 2009-2014 and 2014-2019.
- The Faculty of Law strategic development plans for 2009-2014 and 2014 2019 and the Action Plan for 2015.
- The Chair's Strategic development plans for 2009-2011 and 2011-2016 and Operational plans for 2011-2012, 2012-2013, 2013-2014, 2014-2015
- Master's study programme "Business Law"
- Education Code of the Republic of Moldova (http://lex.justice.md/md/355156/)
- Order no. 455 of the Ministry of Education issued on June 3, 2011, establishing requirements for the master study plans



- "Business Law" Master level study programme and course descriptions
- Protocols of the Consultation Council (provided during the visit at the University)
- Information obtained during the interviews with the Rector of the University, Dean of the Faculty, the Head of Department, students, teaching staff, alumni and employers
- Information available in the Self-Evaluation Report of USPEE

General comments:

The university and the Faculty of Law have strategic development plans and action plans; yet, the action plan should be more detailed and not simply reflecting the usual activities of the units, but also support reaching concrete aims and objectives of the strategic development plan of both the university and the Faculty.

The structure of the Master programme is such that there are no optional disciplines and it is therefore not in full compliance with requirements foreseen in the Order of the Ministry of Education.

There should be better understanding among the lecturers teaching on the programme in terms of what the objectives and outcomes of the study programme are, and they should be able to explain how their courses, specifically, are facilitating the achievement of these objectives.

In general, the title of the study programme is consistent with its content. The meetings provided evidences that the student workload of independent work is not clearly regulated and is not meeting the requirement of 90 ECTS credits. During the meeting students informed that they are studying only 1-2 hours per day.

Internship is not well linked with the study programme objectives, since some of the students are allowed to perform internship in the institutions not related directly with law. Thus, not in all cases does internship support the achievement of the objectives of the study programme. The university should also contract more internship agreements with institutions related with the domain of business law.

The structure of the study programme is internationally comparable (studies, internship, master thesis), but the content and learning outcomes not fully: the programme is not supporting the development of research skills, and some learning outcomes are not directly related with the content of the disciplines nor supported by the studies and internship. The majority of lecturers do not include the sources of other than Romanian and Russian literature in their course programmes; however, to ensure a higher quality of the programme, a variety of information sources in different foreign languages should be used.



The study programme is based on fundamental and specialised disciplines, but there is no clear logic of distinction between those.

The development of the study programme, in general, takes into consideration the needs of the labour market. And it is very positive that the university has created a Consultative Council, which is comprised by main employers and which provides proposals related with organization of the study process. But it should be noted that these employers represent only a very specific segment of the labour market and in order to ensure higher competitiveness of the students it is necessary to reflect on the needs and cooperate with much larger number of possible employers.

Foreign language skills of students need to be improved considerably in order to allow and encourage them to continue studies in foreign countries. Also, teaching staff members should improve their foreign languages skills, other than Russian.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended to develop more detailed actions plans and ensure that the monitoring process of implementation of the action plans is in place and involves teaching staff, students and representatives of labour market.
- Since the study programme does not include optional disciplines, and is thus not in full compliance with requirements foreseen in the Order of the Ministry of Education, it is recommended to ensure full compliance of the study program with the normative acts in force and establish optional disciplines in the Education Plan.
- It is recommended to involve more closely the teaching staff in discussions within the Chair on the objectives of the study programme and their role in achieving the objectives.
- It is recommended to ensure that students' workload of independent work is meeting the requirements of 90 ECTS credits by revising the teaching and learning methods and requirements and to ensure that students' internship is taking place only in the institutions directly related with the business law application.
- Ensure that all learning outcomes are directly related with the content of the disciplines and supported by the studies and internship.
- Although information on labour market demands is received by the university in various ways, it is recommended to do it in a more systematic way, establishing constant channels of communication with broader number employers and social partners, reflecting needs of various business segments.
- It is recommended to provide students with possibilities to learn foreign languages, to include in the programmes of disciplines obligatory materials in foreign languages (English/French) and to encourage students to continue doctoral level studies in foreign countries.
- 1.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development



period.

Comments:

The University has strategic development plans for 2009-2014 and 2014-2019. The Faculty of Law has strategic development plans for 2009-2014 and 2014-2019, and the Action Plan for 2015. The Chair has the strategic development plans for 2009-2011 and 2011-2016 and operational plans for 2011-2012, 2012-2013, 2013-2014, 2014-2015. The Rector highlighted aims to ensure orientation to business needs, involvement of the university into drafting of laws, legal expertise, research development, improvement of quality, mobility, and internship. According to the Rector, the university sees itself as not a big institution, with clear focus on quality and implementing the kind of study programmes which are not implemented by the state universities. The strategic planning and monitoring, in general, are fulfilling their aims and do help to direct and plan institutional development.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended to develop more detailed actions plans, which will not simply reflect the usual activities of the units, but will support reaching concrete aims and objectives of the strategic development plan of the university and the Faculty of Law.
- It is also important to ensure that the monitoring process of implementation of the action plans is in place and involves teaching staff, students and representatives of labour market.

1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.

Comments:

The Master programme in Business Law is designed for 1.5 years of education (3 semesters). The programme is authorised in accordance with the normative acts in force. The Order No. 455 of the Ministry of Education on June 3, 2011, establishes requirements for the master study plans. It is required for the professional master programs (90 credits) to be structured in the following way: Master thesis (30 credits), Internship (10 credits), Fundamental disciplines (15-25 credits) and Specialized disciplines (25-35) among which up to 20% alternative disciplines. The structure of the Master programme in Business Law is as follows: Master thesis (30 credits); Internship (10 credits), Fundamental disciplines (20 credits), Specialized disciplines (30 credits). There are no optional disciplines, but the programme provides 3 free choice disciplines.

The Committee was informed that initially the MA programme included several optional disciplines, in accordance with the Framework Plan Approved by the legislation of the Republic of Moldova, but due to the fact that some of the optional disciplines were never chosen by the students these were excluded in order to include more competitive disciplines.

Yet, at the time of the visit to USPEE, the study programme did not fully comply with requirements foreseen in the Order of the Ministry of



Education.

Recommendation:

It is recommended to ensure full compliance of the study programme with the normative acts in force.

1.3. REQUIREMENT: The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.

Comments:

The Self-Assessment Report (p. 8) states that the study programme is comprised of 10 disciplines: Company Law (fundamental); Legal regulation of taxes (fundamental); International Commercial Contracts (fundamental); Peculiarities of the judicial process to resolve economic disputes (specialised); Telecommunications Law (specialised); Insolvency Law (specialised); Transportation Law (fundamental); Judicial control over judicial decisions (specialised); Tourism Law (specialised); Legal protection of consumer rights (specialised). The title of the study programme is consistent with its content.

1.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 9) informs that 1.5 years of education consists of two teaching semesters (10 or 15 weeks each), including internship and additionally the third semester of 15 weeks of research dedicated to the elaboration of master thesis. For each semester of studies a number of hours is allocated: 170 hours provided for the classes in the first semester; 70 hours of seminars and 670 hours of individual work; the second semester has 120 hours of lectures and 40 hours of seminars/900 hours individual activity. The third semester (writing of the master thesis) consists of total of 900 hours of individual activity.

The meetings provided sufficient evidences that the student workload of independent work is not clearly regulated, and as it was identified during the meeting with the teaching staff and students, the student workload of independent work is not meeting the requirement of 90 ECTS credits (25-30 hours per credit point). During the meeting students informed that they are studying 1-2 hours per day; lecturers do not have a clear understanding about how much time student's individual studies take. The Dean of the Faculty informed that the policy of the university is to organise studies in a way that students are not required to study outside the lectures and seminars.

The Committee was presented a copy of the list of places where the students had done their internship last year. On the basis of the list it can be concluded that the students are allowed to perform internship in institutions that are not related to business law. Thus, internship is part of



the study programme, but it is not well linked with the study programme objectives, since some of the students are allowed to perform internship in the institutions not related to the application of business law (prosecution system, courts, police, National anticorruption centre, etc.) and in these cases internship is not supporting the achievement of the objectives of the study programme. The University has internship agreements with various public institutions, but they are not related with the domain of business law. The studies, internship and development of master thesis do not support achievement of the objectives of the study programme in an effective way.

Recommendation:

• It is recommended to ensure that students' workload of independent work is meeting the requirements of 90 ECTS credits by revising the teaching and learning methods and requirements and to ensure that students' internship is taking place only in the institutions directly related with the business law application.

1.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 9) states that the objectives of the study programme are appropriate, clear, and precisely formulated, and that the purpose of the study programme corresponds to those set for the Law domain, to the National Qualifications Framework and the European Qualifications Framework. During the meetings it became clear that the structure of the study programme is internationally comparable (studies, internship, master thesis), but the content and learning outcomes not fully. The ECTS credits are not based on assessment of real students' workload. The EQF requires to develop research skills and to ensure the possibility to continue studies at the doctoral level. Unfortunately, the study programme does not include the development of research skills as one of the learning outcomes; it only includes an outcome such as "adapting scientific and practical results from other domain of law in the field of business law". The study programme provides a discipline on Juridical Methodology, but it is not obligatory. The programme also includes learning outcomes, such as "Evaluating proposals for the improvement of legislation on private law" and "identify elements of continuity and discontinuity in the evolution of national courts in the implementation of judicial reform", which are not directly related with the content of the disciplines nor supported by the studies and internship.

Speaking about learning outcomes related to knowledge, the study programme is orientated only toward acquiring the following knowledge: "Knowledge of the principles, elements and place of business law in the legal system, the circle of legal relations subjects of business law, system and method of work of companies, controls and application of legal responsibility in the conduct of business activity". Studies in Business Law are supposed to be based on various sources of information available in different foreign languages. The majority of lecturers do not include the sources of other than Romanian and Russian literature in their course programmes, which leads to closeness of the studies and does not support



the achievement of its objectives.

Recommendations:

- Ensure that all learning outcomes are directly related with the content of the disciplines and supported by the studies and internship.
- Ensure that teaching staff is including materials in English/French language as obligatory in programmes of the disciplines.

1.6. <u>REQUIREMENT</u> The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report and the interviews with the Dean, the students and teaching staff provided sufficient information to conclude that the objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme. The Dean explained that it is up to the teaching staff to decide, what should be taught for the bachelor level students and what for the master programme students. The teaching staff informed that they are not deciding by themselves, but the Chair is also discussing the curriculum of the disciplines and ensures that the objectives, content and learning outcomes of the BA and MA programmes are different.

1.7. REQUIREMENT: Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 10) informs that the content of the curriculum follows logical sequence and the principle that a discipline spreads over one semester; the subjects of the curriculum follows a logical order over the years of study so that the first semester provides three basic subjects and three specialties, and the second semester fundamental subjects and three specialized disciplines.

The master programme study plan, the course descriptions and the interviews with the teaching staff and the Head of the Department confirmed, indeed, that there is a logical succession of the courses of the study programme. The study programme is based on 4 fundamental courses: Law of commercial companies (5 credits, I semester), Legal framework for the tax duties (5 credits, I semester), International commercial contracts (5 credits, I semester), Transport law (5 credits, II semester), and 6 specialized courses: Particularities of legal process in solving economic litigations (5 credits, I semester); Telecommunications law (5 credits, I semester); Law of insolvency (5 credits, I semester); Judicial control of judgments (5 credits, II semester); Tourism law (5 credits, II semester); Legal protection of consumer rights (5 credits, II semester).

The internship is organized in the 2nd semester (10 credits) and the master thesis (30 credits) developed and defended in 3rd semester. The study programme does not provide optional courses, but provides 3 free choice disciplines: Judicial Methodology (5 credits); Legal regulation of market securities (5 credits); Principles applying ECHR into national law (5 credits). There is no clear logic of distinction between fundamental and specialised disciplines; for example, the discipline on Transport Law is fundamental and the disciplines on Telecommunication Law, Law of



Insolvency and Tourism Law are specialised. All these disciplines are very similar from the point of view of their domain and could be treated as specialised disciplines and included in the study programme as optional disciplines.

Recommendation:

• To make it clear which fundamental disciplines form the bases of the study programme, which specialised disciplines are supporting the study programme and how they are related with the fundamental ones.

1.8. REQUIREMENT: Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.

Comments:

The Self-Assessment Report (p. 8) provides information that "The study program provides in-depth knowledge in a specific domain: Business Law. Objectives and content of the study program are related to the national economy, labour market needs, with an emphasis on practical application disciplines. The high level of employability (75%) of the graduates proves that the labour market needs are taken into account."

The study plan and the interviews with the Rector, the Dean, head of Chair, students and teaching staff provided sufficient arguments that the development of the study programme, in general, takes into consideration the needs of the labour market. The concrete example of the revision of the discipline programme in order to include the part on the international arbitrage was presented by a lecturer. The University has created a Consultative Council, which is comprised by main employers and which provides proposals related with organisation of the study process. Unfortunately, the work of the Council is not very systematic, as we were provided very different information regarding its last meeting and issues during our discussions with the Rector, the Dean and with employers themselves. Students, employers and teaching staff talked about close links between the University and the labour market, which is reflected not only in organisation of studies (studies plan, internship, master thesis), but also in applying study and learning methods. Some employers are financially supporting the university by donating to the institution 2000-2500 EUR per month. Although the University and the Faculty are very closely cooperating with the employers, it should be noted that these employers represent only a very specific segment of the labour market. In order to ensure higher competitiveness of the students, it is necessary to reflect on the needs and cooperate with much larger number of possible employers. For example, during the meeting with employers, it was clearly stated that they are interested in the students who are able to work on the markets of Eastern European countries. Yet, it is important to keep in mind that Moldova recently signed the Association Agreement, which includes the Deep and Comprehensive Free Trade Area (DCFTA) between the EU and Republic of Moldova. The Agreement, which has created a new and closer political and economic relationship between the EU and Moldova, is applied since 1 September 2014. As economic cooperation with the EU countries is growing, there is also a labour market that needs to have such specialists in business law who are able to work with other European countries as well. Unfortunately, the study programme is not reflecting the needs of this group of business.



Recommendation:

• Although information on labour market demands is received by the university in various ways, it is recommended to do it in a more systematic way, establishing constant channels of communication with a larger number employers and social partners, reflecting needs of various business segments.

1.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews with the Rector and the Dean, students, teaching staff, alumni and employers provided sufficient arguments that the study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 10) informs that in order to better adapt to the market demands, the programme and the Faculty of Law aim to establish and develop collaborative relationships with external recipients and master students. Involving employers and the students requires their active participation in decision-making and is one of the essential elements of sustainability in substantiating University's strategic plans. The master students participate in the study programme development through their representatives in the Faculty Council, the Faculty Quality Committee and the University Senate. This allows the students to get involved directly to improve the content of the programme, which is discussed and approved at the Faculty Council, and the debates at the meetings offer an opportunity to express their views. Foreign partners are actively involved in the development, implementation and evaluation of the programme. In order to become better familiar with the professional the master students have acquired in the institutions in which they work, the Faculty maintains collegial consultations with the employers.

Recommendation:

• Although the Self-Evaluation Report and the interviews proved existence of communication with employers and receiving feedback from students, it is recommended to establish a more systematic approach to gathering feedback from a larger number of employers and social partners.

1.10. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

Comments:

The Self-Assessment Report (p. 11) states that the members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of the study programme and their



role in achieving these goals, and all teachers participate systematically in preparing methodical and scientific publications, in national and international scientific conferences and training courses in the country and abroad. The Dean of the Faculty explained that all information about the objectives is on the web-page of the University. However, lecturers were not able to describe the objectives and outcomes of the study programme and explain how their courses are facilitating the achievement of these objectives. They explained that each discipline has its own aims and by achieving these aims they contribute to the achievement of common aims of the programme. Representatives of teaching staff were mainly stressing the orientation of the studies toward practical skills development, interactive teaching methods and preparation of students for practical work.

Recommendation:

• It is recommended to involve more closely the teaching staff in discussions within the Chair on the objectives of the study programme and their role in achieving the objectives.

1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report (p.11) states that in accordance with the regulation on the organisation and conduct of Doctoral and Postdoctoral studies of 18 February 2008, the master students are provided with the opportunity to continue their studies in the third cycle – PhD, and the graduates may be enrolled in doctoral programme in "Private Law" at USPEE. The interviews with the Rector, the Dean and teaching staff confirmed that the study programme provides formal opportunities for further education at doctoral level. However, the implementation of these opportunities in reality is limited due to insufficient knowledge of foreign languages by the students, as it is an obligatory condition for being admitted to doctoral studies in the field of business law (obligatory exam for starting doctoral studies is Foreign language exam).

Recommendation:

- It is recommended to provide students with possibilities to learn foreign languages, to include in the programmes of disciplines obligatory materials in foreign languages and to encourage students to continue doctoral level studies in foreign countries;
- It is recommended to introduce in the programme a special course that would develop research skills useful for both master thesis and doctoral studies, as the research skills of the students appeared to be quite limited as was witnessed by the quality of the master thesis (not updated materials used, few resources and footnotes, etc.).



2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	x		

Collected evidence:

- Internal Regulation on the organisation of the MA studies approved by the Senate on 27.01.2011 (Annex A.3)
- Internal regulations related to the study process published on the university's web-site (http://www.uspee.md/university/normative-base.html)
- Decisions of the Quality Council (Annex B.4.3)
- Discipline fiches (Annex D.3)
- List of teachers who participated at the seminars on the Moodle platform and on the use of information technologies (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/Decanat_drept/Lista_cadrelor_didactice_participante_la_cursurile_de_instruire_Training_MOODLE_privind_utilizarea_tehnologiilor_moderne_de_predare.pdf)
- Internal regulation on the organization of internship approved by the Senate on 27 March 2014 (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/33.PDF).
- Programme for internships approved by the Senate on 29 August 2014 (Annex B.1.7)
- Cooperation agreements with employers (Annex A.20) and (http://www.uspee.md/ro/2015-02-22-14-36-43.html)
- List of conferences (Annex A.15)
- The Curriculum of the Business Law MA programme (Anne A.7)
- Master thesis (during the visit)
- Information obtained during the interviews and available in the Self-Evaluation Report

General comments:

The organisation of studies and internships are well regulated. The internal regulations related to the study process are available on the university's website. Interactive teaching methods are used, including with the help of interactive boards. Although the individual work of students is described in a rather formal way and does not contain a variety of activities, teaching staff could adequately explain various tasks for the individual work of the students and the used teaching methods. Students' internship is clearly and well organised, which was also confirmed by internship portfolios presented during the visit. However, not all internship places are directly related with the field of law and thus the university should establish cooperation relations with the key public authorities described in the curriculum for the internship purposes.

The teaching materials that are used in the teaching process should be more up-dated and diverse. Likewise, students should be involved in



research activities much more and the quality of the Master thesis need to be improved.

The university has cooperation agreements with the representatives of the labour market. However, such cooperation is rather focused on the enterprises which are founded by the university or are affiliated to the university and it seems that no measures are undertaken by the university to enhance the cooperation and extend the members of the Consultative Council (employers). The university does not have cooperation agreements with public authorities which, according to the curriculum, are important for the learning outcomes of the MA programme.

The assessment of the internship activity is done based on the criteria established by the Curriculum on the internship activity for the Master in Business Law. The students confirmed that they do get feedback from teachers on the results of the assessment if needed. Unlike in other institutions the Committee members visited, the grades for the examinations were sufficiently varied and not all had excellent results.

Recommendations:

- Ensure that that more up-dated and diversified teaching materials are used.
- Establish cooperation relations for the internship purposes with the key public authorities described in the curriculum (such as the Ministry of Economy, Finance and Agriculture) and ensure that all the internships places are related with and contribute to achieving the learning outcomes of the MA programme in Business Law.
- Ensure that systematic analyses of the learning outcomes are performed and that the results are taken into account for further development of the study programme and process.
- Cooperate with a larger segment of the labour market that could impact positively the development of the study programme and its learning outcomes.
- Encourage students' involvement in research activities, ensure that the MA theses are more research oriented and improve the quality of the Master theses in terms of the used resources.
- 2.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.

Comments:

The organisation of the study programme is regulated by a special internal act approved by the Senate on 27.01.2011 (Annex A.3). A positive aspect is that all the internal regulations related to the study process are available and published on the university's web-site (http://www.uspee.md/university/normative-base.html). Nevertheless, the study plan, its content and the timetable are not available on the



university's website. It is recommended that the university ensures more transparency of the MA programme and make the information available for the potential and enrolled students.

As can be seen from the decisions of the Quality Council, the study process is always a subject of its meetings (Annex B.4.3). Among the discussed issues were the introduction of special questionnaires for students, graduates and employers (2013) and publication of the results of the questionnaires (2014) on the university's website. However, the information on the questionnaires and their results is still not available on its website. The interviews with the management, teachers and students confirmed that there is a good dialog among them and that the students and teachers can come with proposals for improving the study process.

Recommendation:

• It is recommend that the university continues its efforts to ensure the transparency of the study process by publishing on its website the information related to the MA programme study plan, timetable, the developments introduced based on the feedback results, etc.

2.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, teamwork-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.

Comments:

The discipline fiches (Annex D.3) explain the objectives and the expected learning outcomes of each course of the MA programme. The individual work of students is described in a rather formalistic way and does not contain a variety of activities. The predominant methods are essays and papers on specific topics and presentation of the results during the seminars. In some cases, case studies, model of contracts and debates are mentioned. Nonetheless, during the interviews, the members of the teaching staff could explain adequately various tasks for the individual work of the students and the used teaching methods.

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 13) indicates that the university has very well equipped classrooms and laboratories that allow an interactive study process and this was confirmed during the visit, where computer classes and interactive boards were presented. It appears that not all teachers are using the interactive boards. However, all of them were subject to training on the use of information technologies in the teaching process and the students confirmed that the lecturers are using them during the classes.



Recommendation:

• It is recommended that the university continues its efforts to update and detail the individual work in the discipline fiches and further encourage the teaching staff to use the acquired technologies.

2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.

Comments:

The obligatory bibliography described in the discipline fiches does not contain the most recent materials. For some disciplines the most up-dated resources are dated from 2001, 2005, or 2008. Some of the recommended EU acts have been repealed and replaced by new legislation. The Committee was informed that at the beginning of each semester the head of department receives requests on the needed materials from the staff. Likewise, for some of the coursers, the teachers informed about the constant need to update the materials due to frequent legislative amendments (for example, tax law). Although the university claims that study materials are annually revised and renewed, the recommended bibliography and the resources that are used for the MA thesis indicate that the materials are not sufficiently up-dated and not sufficient foreign materials are used/recommended.

Recommendation:

- The university is recommended to undertake more measures for ensuring that more up-dated and diversified materials are used for the MA programme.
- 2.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.

Comments:

The internship is organised pursuant to the Internal regulation on the organisation of internship approved by the Senate on 27 March 2014 (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/33.PDF). The regulation is applicable to both Bachelor and Master students. The internship is also organised in accordance with the Programme approved by the Senate on 29 August 2014; it establishes the concept, purpose, objective, rights and obligations, content, assessment procedure, etc. of the internships for the Bachelor and Master studies. (Annex



B.1.7)

Being a private institution, the university has to organise the internships itself and to identify on its own the partner organisations/institutions that would accept its students for the internship. The regulation provides that by 20th of September of each year, the university has to identify and to conclude/renew the cooperation agreements with the organisations and institutions that can offer such internship possibilities. The Dean is responsible for the organisation of the internship process at the faculty level and each department appoints a responsible person for the organisation of the internships. (Annex B.1.5)

The internship portfolio must comprise: a) an agenda which describes the rights and obligations, the timetable, the summary of the performed activities, etc.; b) a notebook, and c) the report on the internship activities. (Annex B.1.6) There is a model of these documents and they are required by the Curriculum for the internship in Master studies of Business Law (Annex B.1.7). The internship portfolios presented during the visit confirmed that the requested documents are submitted and are part of the portfolio.

2.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.

Comments:

As mentioned above, the internship can be organised only on the basis of the cooperation agreements that the university has with relevant organisations and institutions. According to the cooperation agreements, the partner institutions accept students of the university to perform their internships in exchange of the payment of the work of the internship coordinator within the institution. Annex A.20 (Cooperation agreements with employers) provides examples of such agreements with central public authorities (National Anticorruption Centre and Customs Service), a series of private companies, most of them being founded by or affiliated to the university, and local public authorities. The website of the university lists a number of other cooperation agreements with central public authorities and judicial bodies, such as Supreme Council of Magistrates, Supreme Court of Justice, Constitutional Court, Ministry of Justice, Bar Association, Chamber of Commerce and Industry, etc. (http://www.uspee.md/ro/2015-02-22-14-36-43.html). The Curriculum describes the expected outcomes of the internships organised in various institutions: Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Finance, Courts, private institutions and clearly establish the assessment criteria. Nevertheless, cooperation agreements with key authorities described in the curriculum of the internship for Master studies in Business Law, such as Ministry of Economy, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Agriculture, could not be found and were not among the provided documents and, therefore, it



is not clear how the internships are organised by the university in these institutions, which seems to be the main interest groups according to the curriculum. Thus, it is recommended to conclude such agreements in order to accomplish the expected learning outcomes established by the Curriculum. The university has informed that the negotiation process for concluding such agreements has been launched, which is acknowledged by the assessment committee as a clear positive step for implementing the recommendation.

According to the information provided by the university during the visit with regard to the internship places for the last year, it appears that some of the internships were not related to the learning outcomes of the MA study programme (i.e. Ministry of Internal Affairs, Anti-Corruption Centre, courts, prosecutors' office, etc.)

Recommendation:

• The university is recommended to establish cooperation relations for the internship purposes with the key public authorities described in the curriculum (such as the Ministry of Economy, Finance and Agriculture) and to ensure that all the internships are related with and contribute to achieving the learning outcomes of the MA programme in Business Law.

2.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.

Comments:

The learning outcomes are assessed for each course in compliance with the provision of the Internal regulation for the organisation of the Master studies, which describes the methods of evaluation, including the master thesis (Annex A.3). The assessment of the internship activity is done based on the criteria established by the Curriculum on the internship activity for the Master in Business Law. The students confirmed that they do get feedback from teachers on the results of the assessment if needed. Unlike in other institutions the Committee members visited, the grades for the examinations were sufficiently varied and not all had excellent results.

2.7. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.

Comments:

USPEE is complying with the general regulation issued by the Ministry of Education stipulating recognition of prior competencies in IT and linguistic areas. Prior learning is in theory recognized, as per point IV of the Regulation regarding the master studies, it is stipulated that



graduates of other domains than law at BA level can be admitted to the master programmes in USPEE, provided they prove the existence of 30 ECTS for compensating studies. There was no evidence, however, that any student had requested this. There was no proof of previous work experience being transformed into ECTS. Also, the management of the university explained that there were no cases of recognition of prior learning experience for the MA programme or Faculty of Law Bachelor Programme, but informed about a case related to International Relations Master programme where the prior learning from a German university was recognized. As far as the recognition of the prior work experience the university can apply a simplified procedure for the internships, when the students are already employed in a field related to the MA programme.

2.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are undertaken.

Comments:

There was no clear evidence that would argue that systematic analysis of the learning outcomes are performed. The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 14) describes that the feedback from students allows early detection of the problems related to the teaching and learning process.

From discussions at the visit, the Committee learned that USPEE's intention was to pay more attention to how to evaluate the quality of supervision of teaching and learning outcomes. Also, an anonymous survey was conducted among students and teachers in order to see what measures are needed to be taken. Also, at the visit the Committee learned that the achievement of learning outcomes is discussed at teaching staff meetings, as it is stipulated in the Quality Reports for 2012 and 2013.

However, the most recent reports on quality available date from 2013 and 2012 and, despite the fact that they mention that they were evaluation activities of the learning outcomes (Annexes G.1 - G.1 2001, 2002, 2003), these report do not specify concretely how this analysis was performed and what were the results of their implementation, apart from changing the curriculum in 2012. Additionally, the Strategic (2014-2018) and Operational (2014-2015) plans of the Law School contain only generic mentions about this process, without any concrete references and without implementation reports showing how these assessment and analysis of learning outcomes were made effective.

Recommendation:

• The university is recommended to ensure that systematic analysis of the learning outcomes are performed and necessary improvements of the study programme and process are made. It is thus recommended that the university goes beyond the formal fulfilment of the criterion by really implementing the processes established throughout its own regulations and strategies.



2.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is high.

Comments:

The university offers, to some extent, opportunities for the students to participate in national and international conferences. One internal conference was organized in 2013 and two conferences – one international and another with international participation – were organised in 2015 for the Master and PhD students. Nonetheless, only one conference out of the three tackled subjects related to the field of studies (a special compartment for the Private law department). (Annex A.15)

The involvement of the students in research activities is limited and is rather focused on the Master thesis. The quality of the Master thesis has space for improvement in terms of the used resources, which are not sufficiently up-dated and diverse. Nevertheless, the teachers informed about some measures aimed at encouraging students' research activity by means of the individual work and by joint publications (teachers and MA students) in the journals of the university.

The supervision process of the seminar papers, individual work and master thesis is well described by the internal acts and seems to be adequate. The Committee learned that the number of supervised students per teacher does not exceed 5, which can be considered reasonable.

Recommendation:

• The university is recommended to undertake further steps in encouraging students' involvement in research activities and in supervising is such a way that the quality of the Master thesis in terms of the used resources is improved and the thesis are more research oriented.



3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		х	

Collected evidence:

- Annex B.3.1: Information about teaching staff teaching the MA programme
- Annex D.5: General information about teaching staff
- Annex regarding the number of enrolled students
- Annex B3.2: The Plan of Continuous Education of teaching staff
- Annex B2.1: List of instruction courses offered for teaching staff
- Annex B1.1: Strategic Plans of the Faculty of Law
- Annex A.10: Information about enrolment and graduation numbers of students in 2010-2015
- Annex A.18: Cooperation agreements with foreign universities
- Annex D.6: Information about teaching staff and the CVs of staff members
- Annex B3.3: Participation of teaching staff in national and international conferences
- Annex A.11: Scientific Research Plans of the Chair of Public Law and Chair of Private Law

General comments:

One of the full-time staff members is in the 3rd year of his PhD studies but does not have a PhD degree yet, and only a few have had real international experiences.

Foreign teaching staff is not regularly involved in the implementation of the study programme. Public lectures given by foreign academics cannot be considered as their participation in this particular MA programme. Also, students would like to have a stronger presence and impact of foreign academics.

Despite the fact that a system for improvement of the skills of the teaching staff is put in place, the Committee could determine that many of the staff members lack motivation to go abroad, mainly because not all of them speak other foreign languages, apart from Russian. Also, a limited number of staff members have been actively involved in international networks and speak foreign languages

Most of the conferences in which the staff has participated have been held in only Moldova or Romania, and during discussions with the teaching staff many of them did not demonstrate a clear understanding of the concept of an international research database, in most cases, as the evaluation Committee also saw in other institutions that confusions were made between those databases and Google/Scribd/other internet search engines.



However, the fact that some of the teaching staff are also involved in practical legal activities related to the disciplines taught can be considered positive and, at the same time, provided there are no significant involvement of the same individuals in the other MA programmes of USPEE, or in the BA programmes in law, this should assure the needed consistency to the teaching process. Quite active participation on national level conferences is also commendable. Research activities are planned and monitored effectively. Additionally, from discussions with teaching staff and management of the university, a system of further developing the research activities is in place.

Considering all those facts, as well as the general findings from the Self-Evaluation Report and provided annexes, as well as the data gathered at the visit, the general assumption based on evidences provided is that this criterion is partially compliant to requirements.

Commendations:

- Teaching staff is involved also in practical activities in the field of law, even at management level of different relevant institutions (lawyers, judges).
- Participation in conferences, although many of them are at national level.
- Scientific production and a clear research plan for the 2014-2019 period.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended to encourage the finalisation of PhD studies of one full-time member staff in order to attain the legal threshold.
- It is recommended to regularly involve visiting professors from foreign higher education institutions in the teaching of the programme.
- Encourage and provide opportunities for the academic staff to gain more international experience in terms of their involvement in international networks, participation in seminars, etc.
- 3.1.<u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.

Comments:

The total number of teaching staff delivering this MA programme is 13. Out of those, according to Annex B.3.1, 11 are employed full time (85%). However, out of the 11 full-time staff, one has not got a PhD degree yet, being only a PhD student. Therefore, the total amount of full-staff holding a PhD degree is only 91%.



Recommendation:

- Finalisation of PhD studies by one full-time member staff in order to attain the legal threshold.
- 3.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.

Comments:

The average age of the teaching staff is around 50 years, with the oldest member of the teaching staff being 75 and the youngest 32. As 5 members of the teaching staff are under 40 years and other 5 are under 58, the sustainability of the programme can be ensured on the medium term. However, some intake of younger researchers within the programme is recommendable.

3.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at MA level.

Comments:

The qualification of the teaching staff is adequate for the disciplines taught, despite the fact that one of the academics has not got a PhD degree yet. In terms of workload and supervised students, it appears from the annex regarding the number of enrolled students in 2014 that the 13 members of the academic staff had to supervise a total of 31 students (24 students enrolled in 2014 and the 7 from the ones enrolled in 2013 who graduated in 2015), thus the supervision workload being around 3 students per one member of teaching staff. At the visit it was confirmed that most of the academics involved in this study programme are not fully involved in other programmes in Law (BA and MA), assuring thus a maximum total workload of 3-5 students per teaching staff member, which is a rather good figure.

3.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching methods.

Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report stipulates that USPEE has a strategic plan for the continuous improvement of teaching (Annex B3.2). Also, the fact that most of the teaching staff members are involved in practicing legal activities in the field similar to disciplines taught is a positive trait, as they can combine the practical experience with their teaching activities.

From annex B2.1 it results that all members of the teaching staff attended the psycho-pedagogical courses and obtained the relevant



certificates. In theory, these courses aim at developing different competences, such as teaching competences, skills on how to deal with students' problems and also on how to develop research competences.

From annex on details regarding the teaching staff and the CVs provided it can be seen that some of the members of the academic staff attended various training sessions abroad, although the total number of staff doing that is rather low. However, one member of the teaching staff obtained a second PhD degree in France in 2013 (PLOTNIC Olesea), while another got her second PhD degree in 2010 (GRECU Raisa). At the visit, evidences of their real participation at these sessions (certificates of attendance, diplomas, etc.) were presented.

3.5. <u>REQUIREMENT</u>: The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.

Comments:

According to Annex B 2.1, there is an effective development system and Annex 3.2 stipulates the existence of a strategic plan for the continuous improvement of teaching, thus ensuring coherent staff development methods. Also, Annex B.1.1 presents different strategic documents and plans that stipulate the fact that continuous improvement of the staff is one of the issues the institution is concerned with, and it has been decided to motivate members of the teaching staff through promotion policies which take into account their the work at the department level and the degree of their improvement.

3.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.

Comments:

The Report stipulated that there are visiting professors from foreign institutions. However, no annexes or information during the visit were presented to clearly certify that foreign teaching staff is regularly involved in the implementation of the study programme. Though the students mentioned that some public lectures have been given by foreign academic from a university in the USA. Despite that, students requested a stronger presence and impact of foreign academics than presently.

Recommendation:

- It is recommended to regularly involve visiting professors from foreign higher education institutions in the teaching of the programme.
- 3.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.



Comments:

From the annex on general data about the teaching staff it appears that at least two of the teaching staff members developed their skills at foreign institutions (AVORNIC Gheorghe and PLOTNIC Olesea). At the same time, Annex A.18 contains a list of several HEIs that concluded cooperation agreements with USPEE for staff and student mobility.

Despite the fact that during the visit, the management of the institution mentioned the fact that a system for teaching staff improvement is put in place, the Committee could determine that many of the members of the teaching staff lack motivation to go abroad, mainly because not all of them speak other foreign languages, apart from Russian. Hopefully, in the future, if the joint study programme with an US university will be established, academic staff from this MA programme will be more determined to go abroad.

At the visit, some questions about international networks were raised and, apart from the former Rector (AVORNIC Gheorghe), GRECU Rais and PLOTNIC Olesea, other staff members have not been actively involved in international networks.

Despite the formal compliance, most of the conferences in which the staff has participated were held in Moldova or Romania and during discussions with the teaching staff, many of them were not able to understand the concept of an international research database, associating such tools with general search engines such as Google or Scribd.

Recommendation:

• Encourage and provide opportunities for the academic staff to gain more international experience in terms of their involvement in international networks, participation in seminars, etc.

3.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.

Comments:

From the Self-Evaluation Report and Annex B3.3, it is evident that the members of teaching staff have attended various conferences in Moldova and abroad (mostly in Romania, but also in Greece, Russian Federation, and Switzerland), which have led to the publication of their research papers. However, there is a question regarding the impact and the relevance of those papers, as members of teaching staff are not clear about the concept of foreign database and do not use them, confusing them with general search engines on the internet, as stated above under criterion 3.4.

At the visit, the management of the university and the teaching staff confirmed some participation and involvement in research projects.

3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.



Comments:

The Report states that the research activity of each member of the academic staff is planned and monitored, as every year each staff member has to fill in an individual work plan, presenting tangible results in research, which becomes part of the Department's annual plan. The real achievements of such results are being monitored by the head of the Department, based on reports and evidences provided by each member of the teaching staff. Annex A.11 contains elements that justify these statements in the Report (scientific research plan of the Department of private and public law for the period of 2014-2019 and the decision of the Head of the Department of Private Law for the appointment of a responsible person).

Also, at the visit, clear evidences of these evaluations were made available, showing that, at least formally, the research activities are planned and monitored effectively. Additionally, from discussions with teaching staff and management of the university, a system of further developing the research activities is in place, as a Research Consortium to organise research activities and doctoral studies was created by USPEE with the Academy of Sciences of Moldova and the Public Administration Academy of Moldova, thus aiming towards advanced research in the fields of law and administration.

4. STUDENTS	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		х	

Collected evidence:

- Internal Regulation on the organization of Master studies, approved by the Senate on 27.01.2011
- Internal Oder no 34P of 06.06.2014 on the methodology of the admission process for the 1st and 2nd cycle, period 2014-2015 (Annex B.4.1)
- Number of enrolled and graduated students (Annex A.10)
- internal act approved by the Senate on 3 October 2013 regulating the activity of the Center for professional orientation and continuous studies (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/44.PDF)
- Regulation on student and academic staff mobility approved by the Senate on 27 March 2014 (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/21.PDF)
- Cooperation agreements with foreign universities (during the visit and www.uspee.md)
- Cooperation agreements with Moldovan universities (Annex A.19)



- Summer School on European Integration and Human Rights during the period 14-25 July 2015 (Annex B.4.2)
- Composition of the Council for Quality Assurance (Annex B.4.3)
- Internal Regulation of 30 March 2012 on students' representation and activity (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/42.PDF)
- Composition of the university's senate placed on the university's web-site (http://www.uspee.md/university/university-senate.html)
- The operational procedure for academic fraud and plagiarism among Bachelor, Master and PhD students approved by the Senate on 31 August 2013
- Declaration on the originality of the thesis approved as Annex to the Operational Procedure for academic fraud and plagiarism among Bachelor, Master and PhD students. (Annex B.4.4)
- Register of graduates' employment (during the visit)
- Internal regulation on the Alumni association approved by the Senate on 3 October 2013 (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/36.PDF)
- Cooperation agreement with juridical persons, with central and local public administration bodies (Annex 20)
- Information obtained during the visit and available in the Self-Evaluation Report

General comments:

The admission requirements are clear. However, the number of enrolled students is not stable and varies significantly which pose some threats to the sustainability of the MA programme. Due to the small number of students, it appears that there is no real selection process and all the applicants are enrolled. The foreign language skills could not be demonstrated by students. Students benefit of some career guidance and psychological counselling. However, the career guidance centre was not yet established and the focus is very much on the enterprises founded by or affiliated to the university without taking into consideration the labour market at the national level. The anti-plagiarism soft exists, but the there is still need for more research oriented activities and a better quality of the Master thesis in terms of the used resources. Due to the small number of the graduates, the university manages to track the employment of its graduates and the alumni association facilitates the collection of the necessary data. The university has a Centre for mobility opportunities which is able to provide adequate advice for students. However, it seems that mobility opportunities for the students of the MA programme are not available currently and the university only plans to develop cooperation relations for developing mobility projects and offering joint diplomas for the MA students, particularly those enrolled for the MA programme in Business Law. The employment rate of the graduates is about 77% which is a good aspect. Notwithstanding the positive employment rate, it is considered that the sustainability of the MA programme and its development could benefit by a greater openness of the programme to a larger segment of the labour market. The drop-out rates have increased in the last years and more effective measures are needed to address this issue.



Commendations:

- A well-functioning anti-plagiarism software is in place.
- Existence of a tracking mechanism of the graduates and an alumni association.

Recommendations:

- Promote the MA programme and ensure its sustainability by considering the needs of a broader part of the labour market.
- Improve the foreign language skills of its students.
- Establish the career guidance centre as envisaged by its internal act.
- Ensure that the career guidance covers a broader spectrum of the labour market, outside the segment covered by the entities affiliated to the university.
- Provide more mobility opportunities for its MA students, encourage students' participation and establish cooperation relations with a broader range of universities, including prestigious universities from EU member states.
- Undertake effective measures for reducing the high drop-out rate.

4.1.<u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.

Comments:

The admission process for the MA programme is organised based on the criteria established by the Government Decision 1455 of 24.12.2007 on the organisation of Master studies, Internal Regulation on the organisation of Master studies approved by the Senate on 27.01.2011 and Internal Oder no 34P of 06.06.2014 on the methodology of the admission process for the 1st and 2nd cycle, period 2014-2015. The number of available student places is established by the Ministry of Education and for the year 2014, 65 places were available for all MA programmes of USPEE. The university decides how to distribute these places per each MA programme. According to Annex 10, which presents the numbers of admitted and graduated students and of those who have interrupted their studies, it appears that the MA in Business Law is the most attractive for the students and more stable than other programmes, as the student groups are organised each year since 2010. The smaller tuition fee and the quality of the teaching staff were mentioned by the students among the main reasons for applying for the MA programme. According to the management of the university, there are no plans to develop a bigger university and the focus will be maintained on the quality of the study process. Nevertheless, taking into account the substantial variations in numbers of the enrolled students (the numbers from 2009 to 2014 vary from 9 to 25), the sustainability of the programme is under some risk. For example, for the previous admission year 2013-2015, only 12 students were enrolled; only 7 of them graduated (which is about 58%) and 5 abandoned their studies. The rate of the number of applicants compared to the number of enrolled students is not known. However, due to the small number of students, it appears that there is no real



selection process and all the applicants are enrolled.

As a standard requirement of the admission process, the applicants are subject to an assessment of a foreign language. Although the university claims that during the past 5 years English languages courses have been organised for both students and teaching staff, foreign language skills were not demonstrated by the students the Committee met.

Recommendation:

• The university is recommended to consider implementing measures for ensuring the interest of potential students in the MA programme and its sustainability and improve the foreign language skills of its students.

4.2.<u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.

Comments:

The university has established a Centre for Mobility Opportunities. The University has informed that the Centre also provides guidance for students; however, the name clearly indicates that the Centre is involved with promoting programmes and possibilities for students in terms of mobility and not career guidance, which are two different things. If the Centre, indeed, provides both services, this should be included in the name of the Centre. Currently, the university does not have a specialised unit dealing with career guidance for students, although there is an internal act approved by the Senate on 3 October 2013 regulating the activity of the Centre for Professional Orientation and Continuous Studies

(http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/44.PDF). Some career orientation is ensured by the teachers and the management of the university. The focus of career guidance is segmented and mainly oriented towards the various enterprises and lawyer's office which are founded by/affiliated to the university (such as Vector-tur, customs broker, insurance broker, translation office, lawyer's office, etc.).

Psychological counselling is provided by the Director of the Centre for mobility opportunities, who is a graduate of the Faculty of Psychology and has therefore the necessary skills and knowledge for offering such service.

Recommendation:



• The university is recommended to establish a Career guidance centre as envisaged by its internal act and to ensure that the career guidance covers a broader spectrum of the labour market, outside the segment covered by the entities affiliated to the university.

4.3. REQUIREMENT: Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.

Comments:

The university provides certain opportunities for student mobility. Such opportunities and the conditions for participation are regulated by an internal act – Regulation on student and academic staff mobility approved by the Senate on 27 March 2014. The guidance is ensured by the Centre for mobility opportunities.

The university has about 15 cooperation agreements with universities from Romania, Ukraine, Bulgaria, Spain, Russian Federation, USA, etc. However, not all of them are related to the field of law. The areas of cooperation include joint research activities, organising conferences, training of the teaching staff, and exchange of students – Bachelor and/or Master studies. The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 19) presents the results of cooperation activities and according to the available information it can be concluded that the activities are focused mainly on three universities from Russian Federation, the USA and Greece. Most of the students are enrolled in the joint study programme with the university in Russia (about 40-60 students each year). The cooperation with the Academy of European Public Law in Greece is focused on the summer schools, where 9 to 40 students participate each year; there has been a significant increase in participation during the last and current year of study. Keiser University in the USA hosts annually, since the last academic year (2013-2014), about 10 students; however it seems that only Bachelor students can benefit from this programme. Nevertheless, the Committee was informed about the future plans to provide mobility and joint diplomas for MA programme with Keiser University.

During the visit, the staff of the Centre for mobility opportunities also informed about cooperation with Girne American University in the northern part of Cyprus. The university, in cooperation with the Academy of European Public Law in Greece, hosted a Summer School on European Integration and Human Rights during the period 14-25 July 2015 with students from Moldova, Ukraine and Russian Federation. The Summer School was organised under Jean Monnet Programme, funded by EU. (Annex B.4.2)

The university has three cooperation agreements with other universities in Moldova: the State University of Moldova, University of the Academy of Science, and Free International University (Annex A.19). However, the focus of the cooperation is military training, research activities, internships, etc. and not students' mobility. During the visit, the plan to develop some cooperation with the Academy for Public



Administration with regard to PhD studies was mentioned by the management.

Recommendation:

• The university is recommended to provide more mobility opportunities for its MA students and those enrolled for the MA in Business Law. It is also recommended that the university establishes cooperation relations with more universities, including prestigious universities from EU member states.

4.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in student mobility is stable or growing.

Comments:

No students of the MA programme have participated in mobility projects and programmes. Some examples of applications for the MA studies concern fields which are not related to law. The students were aware of the Centre for mobility opportunities and informed about the mobility of some Bachelor students' experience in universities in Armenia and Ukraine. However, students' awareness was rather vague and no clear understanding could be obtained about the specific mobility opportunities for the MA programme.

Recommendation:

• The university is recommended to encourage students to participate in mobility programmes related to the field of law.

4.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education institution.

Comments:

Students are involved in decision-making processes at different levels: 26% are students' representatives in Senate, 20% in the Quality Council and the Committee for Quality Assurance, 20% in the Faculty of Law Council (information from the Report, p. 19). By the decision of the Senate, the composition of the Council for Quality Assurance was approved and 2 out of 7 members are students' representatives – one of them a PhD student. (Annex B.4.3). There is also an internal Regulation of 30 March 2012 on students' representation and activity which describes the level of representations and the correspondent duties (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/42.PDF). The provisions established by the internal acts are implemented accordingly. For example, the students' senate must have 8 members and the composition of the university's senate placed on the university's web-site lists 8 student representatives. (http://www.uspee.md/university/un



senate.html). During the visit, the students also informed about some proposals made by them which were taken into consideration by the university management.

4.6. REQUIREMENT: A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.

Comments:

The university has in place a system for preventing and detecting academic fraud. The operational procedure for academic fraud and plagiarism among Bachelor, Master and PhD students was approved by the Senate on 31 August 2013. It describes in detail what kind of behaviour is considered to be academic fraud and plagiarism and what measures and procedures are applied in such cases. The act regulates the use of special software for the detection of plagiarism and the students' consent for such checking is presumed when the work is presented to the scientific coordinator. Students must fill in a Declaration accompanying the Bachelor/Master thesis certifying the originality of the work. The model of the Declaration is approved by Senate as an Annex to the Operational Procedure for academic fraud and plagiarism among Bachelor, Master and PhD students. (Annex B.4.4)

During the visit the Committee was informed that not only the Bachelor and Master theses are checked, but also the scientific articles that are published by the university. The teachers also informed that MA students rarely cheat during exams and that there are no cases of expulsion for such reasons.

Commendation:

• A well-functioning anti-plagiarism software is in place.

Recommendation:

- Raising awareness about the risks and implications of plagiarism. This could be a part of the research development skills module recommended to be implemented under point 1.11. Also, this could be an item of the agenda of the Research Consortium mentioned under point 3.9.
- 4.7. <u>REQUIREMENT</u>: Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates' employment and is monitoring the evolution of graduates' career.



Comments:

The university has in place a tracking mechanism which consists of a register of graduates' employment and is updated regularly. Likewise, there is an academic community of the graduates "ALUMNI", which facilitates the contact with the graduates. The organisation's activity is regulated by an act approved by the Senate on 3 October 2013 (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/regulamente/36.PDF). It envisages a mechanism for registering, record keeping and advising of its members. (Annex B.4.6) The register of the graduates was presented on-site and it contained sufficiently detailed information about the graduates' employment and their contact details. Due to the small number of MA students, the university explained that it is easy to maintain contact with the graduates. The secretary of the Law Faculty is responsible for collecting and keeping the records.

Commendation:

- Existence of a tracking mechanism of the graduates and an alumni association.
- 4.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the programme.

Comments:

Based on the data presented by the university (Self-Evaluation Report, p. 20), the employment rate of the graduates of the MA programme in Business Law is 77% (out of 44 graduates), the unemployment rate constitutes 16% and 7% are employed in areas other than that of the study programme. The information provided by the university in the Report reveals that the graduates are usually hired as legal advisers, administrators, legal assistants, lawyers, attorneys. This was confirmed by the register of the graduates' employment presented on-site. The employers' representatives whom the Committee met spoke highly of the competences of the graduates. Nevertheless, it appears that the main focus of the university for the employment of its graduates is on the enterprises founded by/affiliated to the university.

Recommendation:

• In order to ensure the sustainability of the MA programme, the university is recommended to consider the needs of a broader segment of the labour market, not only those founded by the university.



4.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.

Comments:

The Internal act on the organisation of Master studies, cycle II, approved by the Senate on 27 January 2011 (Annex B.4.1) regulates the monitoring system of academic progress which consists of the evaluation of individual work, current assessments during the study process, the final examinations and the public hearing of the Master thesis.

The number of students that left the studies was 5 during the period of 2012-2014 (out 24 who enrolled) and 5 during the period of 2013-2015 (out of 12 students who enrolled), constituting a rate of the drop-out 20% and 41% respectively. The numbers have increased compared to the previous years, during the period of 2010-2013, when the drop-out rate was 0. The university claims that it has undertaken measures to deal with the high drop-out rate by discussing this issue in the Senate, individually with students and organising classes after 17.30 in order to allow the students to combine their work with their studies. An important issue for the university related to the study process and drop-outs is the absenteeism. It is required that the students shall be present in at least 2/3 of the classes in order to be admitted to the final exam. However, it seems that absenteeism is a present phenomenon and the university still needs to implement further measures to address this issue.

Recommendation:

• Taking into account the high drop-out rate and the measures implemented by the university, it is recommended that more efforts be made for ensuring that these measures are effective and the drop-out numbers reduced.

5. RESOURCES	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to	does not conform to
		requirements	requirements
mark with 'X'	x		

Collected evidence:

- The University Strategic development plans for 2009-2014 and 2014-2019.
- The Faculty Strategic development plans for 2009-2014 and 2014 2019 and the Action Plan for 2015.
- The Chair Strategic development plans for 2009-2011 and 2011-2016 and Operational plans for 2011-2012, 2012-2013, 2013-2014, 2014-



2015

- Information obtained during the interviews with the Rector of the University, Dean of the Faculty, the Head of Department, students, teaching staff, alumni and employers
- Information available in the Self-Assessment Report of USPEE
- Annexes of the Self-Assessment Report (B 5.1. Financial resources, B 5.2. The general plan of the University campus, B 4.7. Contract of medical services; A 10 Table 2 The number of students 2010-2015)

General comments:

In the opinion of the Committee, the financial resources of the university are sufficient for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff. Also, the number of students and graduates in the Business Law programme on the one hand and budget of USPEE on the other indicate sustainability.

The income from student fees has increased during the past years in connection with increase in student numbers. During the last three years, USPEE has increased spending for publications and organisation of forums and scientific conferences. Yet, investments for the material base have decreased starting from 2013, and it is recommended to consider spending more for the improvement of the material base.

The university has the necessary and sufficient facilities for conducting studies. The Committee was impressed by the fact that several classrooms have interactive boards which are used by teaching staff and students.

The library has a sufficient number of study literature and specialised periodicals in law. However, there is no access to online databases (on-line access to universities' journals from different countries, books and other documents), and this is a very serious shortcoming.

The university has in place the Moodle platform, but, as the Committee was informed, it is still under implementation.

Commendation:

• Study process is facilitated by well-equipped classrooms, including usage of new technologies such, as interactive boards by teachers and students alike.

Recommendations:

- It is recommended that the university continues its efforts to implement the Moodle platform swiftly and efficiently.
- It is recommended to ensure the access to online databases for the teaching staff and students in the shortest possible term.

5.1. REQUIREMENT: The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies,



development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.

Comments:

The university has provided information about its financial resources (Appendix 5.1), showing the various sources of income and expenditures. The meetings at the university and the provided information confirmed that the incomes of the university are diversified coming from students' payments, loan founders, projects, and lease. In 2014-2015, the majority of expenses have been on salaries (about 65% of total expenditures), but also for publications (about 13,4%), and organisation of forums and scientific conferences (about 13,2%). Investments for material base have decreasing from 119,740 MDL in 2013 to 64,618 MDL in 2014.

In general, the financial resources of USPEE are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff. During the meetings sufficient information was provided, confirming that the university is foreseeing finances for the self-development of teaching staff, participation at the conferences, publishing of the lecturers and students' publications and buying books for the library.

5.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.

Comments:

Trends in the number of students and graduates in the Business Law programme has been as follows: 2010/2012 - 9/9; 2011/2013 - 9/9; 2012/2014 - 24/19; 2013/2015 - 12/7; 2014/2016 - 25/...- (Annex A10 Table 2). As payments of students are the main source of income, the increase in the numbers of I, II and III cycle students has resulted in the increase of budget of USPEE during the last 5 years - the total amount of income from 2010-2011 (2 328 274 MDL) having increased considerably by 2014-2015 (6 147 757 MDL), while the income from the tuition fees of the Master students in Business Law constitutes 9,5% of that amount.

During the last three years, USPEE has increased spending for publications and organization of forums and scientific conferences. Investments for the material base have decreased starting from 2013. In 2014-2015, incomes only from the master programme students (581 000 MDL) are fully covering the salaries of all the teaching staff (528 948 MDL), so spending for the improvement of the material base (62 618 86 MDL) could be increased.

It can be concluded on the basis of the information above that the number of students and graduates in the Business Law programme on the one hand and budget of USPEE on the other indicate sustainability.

5.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students



independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).

Comments:

The university has the necessary and sufficient facilities for conducting studies, including classrooms with projectors, computer classes with access to Internet, a library with computers and space for independent work of students. The whole university campus provides free Wi-Fi with the capacity of 200 mb/sec.

For the Master studies, in particular, the classrooms and laboratories have the necessary equipment for simulation of trials, for example audio and video recording possibilities, TV, and interactive whiteboards.

5.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by upto-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.

Comments:

As also indicated in 5.3, the university demonstrated proofs of using modern information technology solutions, for instance interactive whiteboards. The university has in place the Moodle platform, but, as the Committee was informed, it is still under implementation. This was confirmed by students who had limited knowledge about Moodle and about the courses placed there by teachers. In 2013 a training seminar organized for the academic staff the Moodle platform for about 40 participants. was on (http://www.uspee.md/images/materiale29.03.14/Decanat drept/Lista cadrelor didactice participante la cursurile de instruire Training M OODLE privind utilizarea tehnologiilor moderne de predare.pdf)

Recommendation:

• It is recommended that the university continues its efforts to implement the Moodle platform swiftly and efficiently.

5.5. REQUIREMENT: The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.

Comments:

USPEE has the capacity to accommodate virtually all students in the dormitory from the polling day at their request. Students confirmed that they have one of the best dormitories in Chisinau, which is also warm in wintertime, as told by the management, and they are satisfied with all the conditions provided.



Access to health services for MA students is ensured via medical point established at the University and the contract with the Clinic Pro-Sano regarding services for students. The visit to the University confirmed this information.

5.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.

Comments:

It was confirmed during the visit that the university library includes materials in the areas of Legal Sciences, Political Science, Economics, and Environmental Sciences. The books for the educational process at the Faculty of Law consist of 2331 titles and 3682 copies respectively. Each subject in the curriculum is provided in average with 5-7 academic study materials. Students and teachers have free access to periodicals of the university: newspaper "Law"; The National Law Journal; scientific journal Moldoscopie; Scientific Journal of Education, Spirituality and Ecological Culture, and others. According to the Self-Evaluation Report, the library is systematically updated with book collection and specialized literature in Law study programmes and is filled with new titles from Moldova as well as abroad, but, although the university claims that study materials are annually revised and renewed, and despite the fact that the self-evaluation report states that the library has a sufficient number of literature and specialized periodicals in law, the recommended bibliography and the resources that are used for the master thesis indicate that those materials are not sufficiently up-dated and not sufficient foreign materials are used/recommended. In the library, students may use three reading rooms (117 seats), equipped with a number of computers connected to the Internet. However, USPEE library does not have the access to online databases (on-line access to universities journals from different countries, books and other documents), and this is a very serious shortcoming.

Recommendation:

• It is recommended to ensure the access to online databases for the teaching staff and students in shortest possible term.