



# Accreditation of Study Programmes Assessment Report

Institution: Free International University of Moldova, Republic of Moldova

**Study programme:** International and Institutional Law

#### **Assessment committee:**

Aalt Willem Heringa (Chair) – Professor of (Comparative) Constitutional and Administrative Law, Faculty of Law,

Maastricht University, Holland

Aušra Rauličkyte – Adviser to the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Moldova, Moldova

Aliis Liin – Legal Counsel, University of Tartu, Estonia

Stela Buiuc (student member) – PhD student in Law, State University of Moldova; Deputy Director, Centre for Legal

Approximation, Ministry of Justice, Moldova

Coordinator: Ms Tiia Bach, Assessment Coordinator, Estonian Quality Agency for Higher and Vocational Education, Estonia

Dates of the assessment visit: 21 May 2015

Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA: 6 July 2015

Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation: 21 July 2015

Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 4 votes in favour and 0 votes against.

Date: 09 September 2015



## I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development	Х		
Teaching and learning		X	
Teaching staff		X	
Students		X	
Resources		Х	

#### **General introduction:**

Free International University of Moldova (ULIM) is a private higher education institution, founded in 1992. Presently, ULIM has 7 faculties with educational and research missions: Law; Economical Sciences; Letters; Informatics and Engineering; History and International Relations; Psychology, Educational Sciences and Social Assistance; Biomedicine and Ecology. Studies in ULIM are organised at all 3 levels: Bachelor's (1<sup>st</sup> cycle), Master's (2<sup>nd</sup> cycle) and Doctoral (3<sup>rd</sup> cycle).

The university has, according to the Self-Evaluation Report, 6 study programmes in the field of law. At BA level, the Faculty of Law provides studies on one study programme – Law. The master level studies at the Faculty include the following authorised study programmes: International and Institutional Law; Business Law; Institutions of Constitutional Law and Administrative Law; Institutions of Private Law; Criminal Sciences. According to the information available on ULIM website, there is one more Master programme in law – Policy and Management of Security Services (intake scheduled for 2015/16). The Faculty of Law has two departments: Public Law Department and Private Law Department.



The professional master programme under evaluation – International and Institutional Law – is carried out by the Public Law Department. The programme is conducted in the form of full-time studies with the duration of 1.5 years and the volume of 90 ECTS.

#### **Comments:**

One of the aspects relevant here appears to the Committee that the programme under review is part of a larger institution, which as such has set procedures in place and can offer services for a great variety of students, and which may also cater for a building and library. As a university, a form of strategic planning is in place which is also conducive to a progress in policies and improvement. It is to be commended that the university has a clear vision of its development and understands the importance of strategic planning. The Strategic Development Plans for 2009-2014 exist, but there are no detailed Action Plans.

The master programme "International and Institutional Law" is authorised in accordance with the normative acts in force. Yet, there are no optional disciplines, although the programme provides two free choice disciplines. Therefore, the structure of the programme is not fully in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education.

In general, the title of the study programme – International and Institutional Law – is consistent with its content. However, since all the fundamental legal courses are on European law, it is not clear why European Law is not directly expressed in the title of the programme.

The studies, internship and development of master thesis in general support the achievement of the objectives of the study programme. It should be noted, however, that the student's independent work load is not clearly regulated, and internships are not by definition well linked with the study programme objectives, namely it is not guaranteed or regulated that students perform their internship in institutions or departments of institutions related to international or European law or that tasks performed during an internship are conducive to the achievement of the study programme objectives.

There is a need for updating the website of ULIM and publishing more materials about the activities of the University to better communicate with the students and the society. It is very commendable that students themselves analyse the results of student feedback and propose the changes in the study programme and study management; however, feedback on a more regular basis from students should be collected and analysed by the faculty. A well-established system of taking the results of the feedback into account in study management development is not in place. More efforts should be made towards adequately equipping the library with up-to-date contemporary legal literature in foreign languages. More international and updated sources should be used in MA thesis.

Students are expected to work 300 hours for an internship (the work load per one week being 60 hours). That appears to the Committee not to be in accordance with rules and ECTS credits. 5 weeks for 10 ECTS do not really match and this ought to be remedied shortly. The institution has disputed this finding by referring to the framework plan. However, according to the self-evaluation report, which forms the basis of the



evaluation performed by the committee, it was clear that an internship counts for 300 hours for five weeks and 10 ects. No matter what, these data are contradictory or to say the least not clear and not well regulated and/or impossible to reconcile.

Also, all agreements with regard to internship have been signed with national (Moldovan) organizations and most students have their internships in places which are more related to judicial, law enforcement fields and not to international law.

The average grades for exams are very, unrealistically high (9.14); the current grading system does not conform to the ECTS grading scale.

The analysis of learning outcomes should take place on a regular basis and the outcome of analyses used for improving the achievement of learning outcomes. Presently, there is no system in place of gathering feedback from the students about the satisfaction with the quality of supervision of the thesis. Research skills of both the students and teaching staff should be increased; students should be more actively involved in research-related activities. Teaching staff should be more oriented towards research; at the moment there is lack of such orientation.

There is a good balance between the distribution of full-time teaching staff by age and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensuring the sustainability of the study programme; also, the qualification of teaching staff is sufficient and adequate. However, staff size (4 full-time academic staff members out of 9 teaching on the programme) is indeed very limited and appears not to be in balance with the breadth and depth of the programme which focuses on both international and European law. The small number also poses a risk from the perspective of building a true academic culture in the institution and guaranteeing full expertise and knowledge to be present in all domains of the programme.

It became evident that no visiting lecturers were involved in teaching the master programme under assessment.

Only a very limited number of teaching staff has developed their skills at foreign higher education institutions and no staff member on the MA programme has participated in international networks, despite the fact that the majority of the teaching staff knows foreign languages, which is very positive and helpful.

There was no clear evidence of the involvement of teaching staff in national and international research projects and participation in national and international conferences. The University itself is organising numerous conferences and forums and in 2014 passed the scientific accreditation. Yet, participation both in national and international research projects and conferences must be increased in number and scope.

It is commendable that the university has a functioning system in place for students' career and psychological counselling, and that sufficient systems are used for detecting plagiarism. Also, students are adequately informed about various mobility opportunities. There is still a need to encourage the MA students even more to apply for and benefit from the mobility programmes provided by ULIM. The medium-term plans to offer joint diplomas with universities from EU countries is a clear step in that direction. The university is planning to make more efforts to obtain better information about the labour market and to ensure that this information is related to the objectives and learning outcomes of the MA programme. The programme and the University have to focus on links with international labour markets and national employers with



international and European aspects. This is needed to become a centre of international and European law for students, staff and society, providing the expertise and research and being a focal point for all stakeholders and students.

The number of students on the programme is rather small and declining, which is worrying but which is obviously a general trend in many institutions. There is also some concern regarding budgetary data about the budget for years 2010 up until 2014. A matter of concern is that the revenues have declined. Personnel expenditure has gone up; yet, the percentage of staff in the 2014 budget of 41,2% is according to international standards rather low. Although the university has a spacious and beautiful library, the collection of literature concerning international (and European) law should be updated and expanded, and more financial resources need to be found for this.

For the present programme one of the weaknesses is the size of the staff and the students and therefore the resources. That is specifically an issue in the domain of International and Institutional Law where international competition exists and international benchmarking is relevant and international collaboration and exchange and linguistic capabilities are necessary and indispensable. Moldovan students and society are not well served with below level programmes.

#### Commendations:

- The programme has a specific focus and has taken many steps to build and structure its proper place.
- It is commendable that students themselves have taken responsibility for analysing the feedback and proposing changes in the programme and study management based on the results of feedback.
- The majority of the teaching staff and students knows foreign languages and uses books in English/French for teaching/learning purposes.
- The eagerness of the teaching staff in applying new and more interactive teaching methods and sharing experience among each other is commendable and worthy to set as an example to other universities.
- The university has a functioning system for career counselling and orientation as well as psychological counselling for students.
- The university has a Centre for International Cooperation responsible for students' mobility and runs a web-page.
- A functioning system is in place for detection and prevention of academic fraud.
- The master program is run in a relatively well equipped and well organised building with lecture halls, a spacious library and other facilities.

#### Recommendations



- It is recommended to finalize and adopt the Strategic Development Plan for 2015-2019 of the University and develop detailed Actions Plans, which will not simply reflect the usual activities of the units, but will support reaching concrete aims and SMART objectives of the Strategic Development Plan. It is recommended to consider revising the title of the study programme in order to reflect in a more direct way the content of the study programme and make it easily understandable for possible students and representatives of labour market. The title "International and Institutional Law" does not reflect what the programme entails, for instance EU law. The title "international and institutional" is double since international law encompasses institutions and organisations but does not necessarily embrace EU law. The name "institutional law" seems to be redundant and confusing. Furthermore, the committee has indicated in the report that the substance of the courses in the programme requires a thorough refection.
- It is recommended to ensure that internships are organized only in the institutions, which are directly related with the international or European law application/approximation, ensuring that internships will support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.
- To increase the study load of students and therefore the substance of and challenges posed by the courses and internship.
- Although information on labour market demands is received by the university in various ways, it is recommended to do it in a more systematic way, establishing constant channels of communication with employers and social partners.
- It is recommended to launch the strategy of improving the English language skills of the staff and students to make them more competitive on the labour market.
- Provide students with more up-to-date teaching materials in English. Also to structurally include up-to-date English materials in the syllabuses and in the library as well as in master thesis.
- It is advisable to analyse the duration of the internship and the volume of work the students have to do during the internship and adjust these so that the weekly workload of students would be reasonable and in line with the ECTS credits and hours connected to the credits.
- It is highly recommended to analyse the practice of implementing the present grading system and give teaching staff instructions about a correct implementation of the system. It should be considered whether the level of teaching in this Master programme is really high enough and whether there are enough true challenges, depth and substance. Speedy remedies are necessary here.
- It is recommended to gather feedback from the students about the satisfaction with the quality of supervision of the thesis after they have defended their thesis and use this feedback for improving the skills of supervision of the teaching staff.
- It is recommended to bring students in closer contact with the research conducted by the staff and make the programme a research led master programme. The procedure of annual plans and the magazine may be important but are in itself far from pursuing a research focus and strategy, necessary to support a master programme.



- Increase the number of full-time staff members of the master programme is absolutely necessary to make the programme more durable and ensure its quality long term.
- It is recommended to structurally increase the involvement of foreign visiting teaching staff in the teaching of the study programme.
- The University is recommended to plan the development of the skills of teaching staff at foreign higher education institutions and participation in international networks, motivate lecturers to undertake such activities and provide necessary funds for that.
- It is recommended for the Faculty to ensure much broader involvement of the teaching staff in international research projects and participation in international scientific conferences by providing necessary finances for this purpose. Scientific cooperation partners should be sought from countries other than Ukraine or Belarus.
- Further continue the efforts to create opportunities and encourage international mobility for MA students.
- Further improve the tracking and monitoring mechanism of the graduates' careers and establish an alumni association which would create more opportunities for the graduates and the university to keep in contact with each other.
- Increase efforts for better links and exchanges with (international and European oriented) labour markets and societal needs.
- Develop a clearer strategy regarding the internship places that would fit the objectives and the learning outcomes of the MA programme
- The University needs to make substantial investments into updating the library with international literature and journals regarding international and European law.

## **Recommendations to the Ministry of Education:**

- The Committee is of the opinion that the requirement established by the state in terms of having a dormitory for *all* the students is superfluous and too expensive and should be revisited, since many students have their own abode. Instead of having its own dormitory, it could be considered to cooperate with other real-estates offices and proprietors offering accommodation. So is the requirement regarding the provision of medical service it is outdated, too expensive, not efficient, and therefore too much a burden on small institutions and programmes with low funding.
- The Committee is of the opinion that the present Framework Plan adopted by the Ministry of Education is far too inflexible in terms of stipulating the volume of fundamental, specialised and optional courses, allowing the volumes of courses to be strictly 5/10/15 ECTS and subsequently one semester up to 6-2 courses/modules. It is strongly advisable to reconsider giving higher education institutions greater



freedom to decide upon the volume of obligatory and optional courses in the programme, thereby expanding students' choices. Furthermore, institutions could be allowed to have courses with volumes bigger or smaller than 5 ECTS, depending on the content of the specific course, and not simply 5 ECTS in order to fulfil some formal requirements.



#### II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		

#### **Collected evidence:**

- Strategic Plan of Development of ULIM for 2009-2014
- Strategic Plan of Development of the Law of Faculty for 2009-2014
- Education Code of the Republic of Moldova (http://lex.justice.md/md/355156/)
- Codex of ULIM (http://www.ulim.md/assets/files/codex\_ulim.pdf)
- Order of the Ministry of Education no. 1094 of November 20th, 2013, approving the study programme
- Order no. 455 of the Ministry of Education issued on June 3, 2011, establishing requirements for the master study plans
- "International and Institutional Law" Master level study programme and course descriptions
- "Law" Bachelor level study programme and course descriptions
- Information obtained during the interviews with the Dean of the Faculty of Law, the Head of Department of Public Law, students, teaching staff, alumni and employers
- Information available in the Self-Evaluation Report of ULIM

#### **General comments:**

It is to be commended that the university has a clear vision of its development and understands the importance of strategic planning. The Free International University of Moldova and the Faculty of Law have Strategic Development Plans for 2009-2014, but there are no detailed Action Plans.

The master programme "International and Institutional Law" is authorised in accordance with the normative acts in force. Yet, there are no optional disciplines, although the programme provides two free choice disciplines. Therefore, the structure of the programme is not fully in accordance with the Order no. 455 of the Ministry of Education issued on June 3, 2011.

In general, the title of the study programme – International and Institutional Law – is consistent with its content. However, it should be noted that the title is not easily understandable. Since all the fundamental legal courses are on European law, it is not clear why the name European



Law is not directly expressed in the title of the programme.

The studies, internship and development of master thesis in general support the achievement of the objectives of the study programme. It should be noted, however, that the student's independent work load is not clearly regulated, and internship is not well linked with the study programme objectives, meaning that students are allowed to perform their internship in institutions not related to international or European law.

Opportunities are provided for further education at doctoral level both in ULIM as well as other institutions in the country or abroad. In the last five years, 9 of the Master programme graduates - which constitute 8% - were enrolled in the 3rd cycle (doctoral programme).

#### Recommendations:

- It is recommended to finalize and adopt the Strategic Development Plan for 2015-2019 of the University and develop detailed Actions Plans, which will not simply reflect the usual activities of the units, but will support reaching concrete aims and smart objectives of the Strategic Development Plan.
- It is recommended to consider revising the title of the study programme in order to reflect in more direct way the content of the study programme and make it easily understandable for possible students and representatives of labour market.
- Furthermore, it is recommended to reflect on subject matters that appear obviously missing: (international) trade, international/European environmental law, international business/commercial law, arbitration, to name but a few examples. Choices must be reflected in the title of the programme, and the description of the programme and must be conscientiously made, also in light of society's wishes, labour market demands and general trends in comparable programmes elsewhere.
- It is recommended to ensure that internships are organized only in the institutions, which are directly related with the international or European law application/approximation, ensuring that internship will support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.
- To increase the study load of students and therefore the substance of and challenges posed by the courses and internships.
- Although information on labour market demands is received by the university in various ways, it is recommended to do it in a more systematic way, establishing constant channels of communication with employers and social partners.
- Although the Self-Evaluation Report and the interviews showed the existence of communication with employers and receiving feedback from students, it is recommended to establish a more systematic approach to gathering feedback from larger number of employers and social partners and ensuring more frequent collection of student feedback not only once a year, but after each course, internship, master thesis development, etc.



• It is highly recommended to encourage students to continue doctoral level studies in foreign higher education institutions or to spend a research period abroad as a visiting PhD or scholar.

1.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development period.

#### Comments:

The University and the Faculty of Law have Strategic Development Plans for 2009-2014, but do not have detailed Action Plans. At the moment, the University is developing a new Strategic Development Plan. According to the interviews, the draft was developed in April 2015, and now all the Faculties are preparing their proposals, which will then be consolidated and sent to the Ministry of Education. It is expected that the Strategy will be approved in June-July 2015.

The leadership of ULIM is highlighting a new approach to strategic planning, encouraged by the new Code of Education. The Deputy Rector listed 3 main strategic tasks of the new Strategic Development Plan: 1) Attract students from foreign countries to the university; 2) increase the quality of studies, and 3) increase the mobility of students and lecturers. The University has a clear vision of its development and understands the importance of strategic planning.

#### Recommendation:

• It is recommended to finalize and adopt the Strategic Development Plan for 2015-2019 of the University and develop detailed Actions Plans, which will not simply reflect the usual activities of the units, but will support reaching concrete aims and smart objectives of the Strategic Development Plan.

## 1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.

## **Comments:**

The master programme "International and Institutional Law" is authorised in accordance with the normative acts in force. The programme is approved by the Senate decision no. 9 of August 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2013, and by the Order of the Ministry of Education no. 1094 of November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2013. The Framework Plan for higher education approved by the Order no. 455 of the Ministry of Education issued on June 3, 2011, establishes



requirements for the study plans at Master's level. It is the requirement for the professional Master's programmes (90 credits) to be structured in the following way: Master thesis (30 ECTS), Internship (10 ECTS), Fundamental disciplines (15-25 ECTS), and Specialized disciplines (25-35 ECTS) among which there should be up to 20% optional disciplines.

The structure of the Master's programme "International and Institutional Law" is as follows: Master thesis (30 ECTS), Internship (10 ECTS), Fundamental disciplines (30 ECTS), and Specialized disciplines (20 ECTS). There are no optional disciplines, but the programme provides for two free-choice disciplines. Therefore, the study programme is not in full compliance with the requirements foreseen in the Order of the Ministry of Education.

The Committee is of the opinion that the present Framework Plan adopted by the Ministry of Education is far too inflexible in terms of stipulating the volume of fundamental, specialised and optional courses, allowing the volumes of courses to be strictly 5/10/15 ECTS and subsequently one semester up to 6-2 courses/modules. It is strongly advisable to reconsider giving higher education institutions greater freedom to decide upon the volume of obligatory and optional courses in the programme, thereby expanding students' choices. Furthermore, institutions could be allowed to have courses with volumes bigger or smaller than 5 ECTS, depending on the content of the specific course, and not simply 5 ECTS in order to fulfil some formal requirements.

## 1.3. REQUIREMENT: The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.

#### Comments:

In general, the title of the study programme – International and Institutional Law – is consistent with its content. However, it should be noted that the title is not easily understandable and this, by itself, is a negative factor from the point of view of the competitiveness of the master programme. In the general comments the committee has elucidated on this aspect.

The content of the study programme presents a balance of courses on European law and on International law. All fundamental legal courses of the study programme are focused on European law (European Protection of Human Rights; Law and Management of European Policies; European Constitutional Law), and a majority of the specialized courses focus on international law aspects (Responsibility and Jurisdiction in the International Law; Cooperation Between European Union and Neighbouring States in the Light of Freedoms of Circulation; The Regulation of the Non-Discrimination Principle: European Theory and Practice; Transitional Justice in the Process of Reconciliation of Post-Conflict Societies; National Security in the Light of the Challenges Concerning the Security of the European Continent; Module: Methods and Forms of Protection Applicable to Certain Categories of Persons in the Modern International Law). Representatives of employers especially emphasised the need for courses related to the European integration. Having in mind that all the fundamental legal courses are on European law, European Law could be considered to be directly expressed in the title of the programme.

#### Recommendations:



- It is recommended to consider revising the title of the study programme in order to reflect more directly the content of the study programme and make it easily understandable for possible students and representatives of labour market.
- Furthermore, it is recommended to reflect on subject matters that appear obviously missing: (international) trade, international/European environmental law, international business/commercial law, arbitration, to name but a few examples. Choices must be reflected in the title of the programme and the description of the programme and must be conscientiously made, also in light of society's wishes, labour market demands and general trends in comparable programmes elsewhere.

# 1.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.

## Comments:

The studies, internship and development of master thesis, in general, support the achievement of the objectives of the study programme. It should be noted, however, that the students' independent work load is not clearly regulated, and as it was identified during the meetings with the teaching staff and the students, the student workload of independent work is not meeting the requirement of 90 ECTS (25-30 hours per credit point). That is: students spend substantially less hours on studies than should be expected.

Internship is included in the study programme, but it is not well linked with the objectives of the study programme. Namely, it is not guaranteed or regulated that students perform their internship in institutions or departments of institutions related to international or European law or that tasks performed during internship are conducive to the achievement of study programme objectives.

## **Recommendations:**

- It is recommended to ensure that the internship is organized only in the institutions, which are directly related with the international or European law application/approximation, ensuring that internship will support the achievement of the objectives of the study programme.
- To increase the study load of students and thus the substance of and challenges posed by the courses and internship.
- To enable, facilitate and promote internships abroad.
- 1.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.

#### Comments:



The Self-Evaluation Report of ULIM, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews conducted during the site visit confirm that the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable. The study programme, however, does not include research skills as learning outcome, although the development of research skills must be an integral part of master level studies (both in research and professional programmes). Despite this, the programme includes fundamental module "Philosophy and Methodology of Legal Research". Meeting with the teaching staff, the Dean of the Faculty of Law and the Head of Department of Public Law confirmed that research activities are included in all courses of the programme and in particularly applied during development of the master thesis. Students are also encouraged to participate in students' conferences and to write articles, which contribute to the development of research skills.

#### Recommendation:

• It is recommended to strengthen and upgrade the research focus in all courses and the master thesis, also in line with the earlier finding and recommendation to strengthen the programme's scope and substance and challenges.

# 1.6. <u>REQUIREMENT</u> The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews with the Dean of the Faculty of Law, the Head of Department of Public Law, students and teaching staff confirmed that objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme. It was also confirmed that there is a compensatory semester that should be completed by graduates of Bachelor level programmes admitted to the Master programme from fields of study other than law.

## 1.7. REQUIREMENT: Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews with the Dean of the Faculty of Law, the Head of Department of Public Law, students and teaching staff provided sufficient arguments on presentation of the study disciplines of the study programme in a logical succession. The content of the study programme presents a balance of the courses on European law and on international law. All fundamental courses in the first semester are focused on European law (European Protection of Human Rights; Law and Management of European Policies; European Constitutional Law), and the second semester focuses on philosophy and methodology of legal research. Specialized courses are mainly on various international law aspects (Responsibility and Jurisdiction in the International Law;



Cooperation between European Union and Neighbouring States in the Light of Freedoms of Circulation; The Regulation of the Non-Discrimination Principle: European Theory and Practice; Transitional Justice in the Process of Reconciliation of Post-Conflict Societies, etc.) and are studied in the first and second semesters. The internship is organised in the second semester and the master thesis developed and defended in the third semester. According to the information provided, the courses on European law are included in the programme, taking into account the priorities of the Republic of Moldova (the EU integration policy), and also aspects of international law, representing problems of the region.

#### Recommendation:

• In line with the Committee's earlier recommendations and findings, the content of the programme must be made more to be reflected in the name, and choices of courses ought to be made more explicit in the public presentation of the Master's programme and its objectives.

## 1.8. REQUIREMENT: Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews with the Dean of the Faculty of Law, the Head of Department of Public Law, students, teaching staff and employers provided sufficient arguments that development of the study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market. The study programme was developed in 2008 and revised in 2013 as a response to the labour market needs. However, it should be noted that the employability index of the Law Faculty graduates is not very high (56%). The interview with employers revealed that labour market needs graduates with more practical skills. The employers also suggested including in the programme more courses on international commercial or trade law. Employers especially highlighted the graduates' international experience and good understanding of international context.

## **Recommendations:**

- Although information on labour market demands is received by the university in various ways, it is recommended to do it in a more systematic way, establishing constant channels of communication with employers and social partners.
- In addition, the Committee urges to take this information and ideas put forward by the labour market about skills, courses and content much more into account and consideration.
- 1.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.



#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews with the Dean of the Faculty of Law, the Head of Department of Public Law, students, teaching staff, alumni and employers provided sufficient arguments that the study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders. According to the Self-Evaluation Report, the analysis of the programme's efficiency is made within the Commission for Quality Assurance of the Faculty, represented by students and employers, and the Dean discusses issues related to the studies in monthly meeting with bachelor and master students.

#### Recommendation:

• Although the Self-Evaluation Report and the interviews proved existence of communication with employers and receiving feedback from students, it is recommended to establish a more systematic approach to gathering feedback from a larger number of employers and social partners and ensuring more frequent collection of student feedback – not only once a year, but after each course, internship, master thesis development, etc.

# 1.10. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

#### Comments:

The interviews with the teaching staff confirmed that they are aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives. Lecturers were able to describe the objectives and outcomes of the study programme and explain how their courses are facilitating their achievement. Lecturers demonstrated critical thinking and provided various critical views and ideas about the development of the programme. All this proves existence of the tradition of critical discussions at the Faculty and Chair.

## 1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.

## **Comments:**

The Self-Evaluation Report, the study programme, the course descriptions and the interviews with the Dean of the Faculty of Law, the Head of Department of Public Law, students, teaching staff confirmed that the study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level. The graduates of the Master Cycle have access to the doctoral programme "552-public law", "552.08-international and European public law" and to other doctoral programmes offered by ULIM or other institutions in the country or abroad with interdisciplinary feature. In



the last five years, 9 of the Master programme graduates - which constitute 8% - were enrolled in the 3<sup>rd</sup> cycle (doctoral programme). The faculty has 12 lecturers, who have the right to supervise PhD thesis.

#### Recommendation:

• It is highly recommended to encourage students to continue full doctoral level studies in foreign higher education institutions and to visit foreign institutions during their doctoral studies and also to structurally involve foreign professors in the supervision of PhD's.

2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		Х	

#### **Collected evidence:**

- Website of ULIM http://cci.ulim.md/
- The list of the internship places for 2014, MA programme in "International and Institutional Law" (available during the visit)
- Information obtained during the interviews.
- Information available in the Self-Evaluation Report of ULIM
- Selection of Master thesis (available during the visit)

#### **General comments:**

In the interviews conducted during the accreditation process, the representatives of the employers and alumni expressed the need for updating the website of ULIM and publishing more materials about the activities of the University to better communicate with the students and the society.

Feedback from students about the study process is gathered, but only once during the studies at the end of the academic year. Students themselves analyse the results of feedback and propose the changes in the study programme and study management. A well-established system



of taking the results of the feedback into account in study management development is not in place.

Although ULIM library has got a good budget to buy books and electronic resources for the library, it is still far from being adequately equipped, especially in terms of up-to-date contemporary legal literature in foreign languages. In the thesis, there are sources in English used now and then, but not to the sufficient extent. Many sources are out of date and scarce, specifically on International law and European law in the English language.

Students are expected to work 300 hours for internship (the work load per one week being 60 hours). That appears to the Committee not to be in accordance with rules and ECTS credits. 5 weeks for 10 ECTS do not really match and this ought to be remedied shortly. Agreements have been signed with partner organizations that provide opportunities to perform internship, but all the partner organizations are from Moldova and therefore the internship places have so far been mostly national; most students have their internships in places which are more related to judicial, law enforcement fields and not to international law.

The average grade for the exams in 2015 was 9.14. The grades are incomprehensibly high, taking into account that the grading system used has "10" as the highest grade and "5" as the pass rate (lowest positive grade). The current grading system does not even formally conform to the ECTS grading scale.

The staff was not able to convince the Committee that the analysis of learning outcomes is a systematic procedure or that there is a system for using the analysis for improving the achievement of learning outcomes.

Although the Self-Evaluation Report states that students have the possibility to inform the programme manager, head of department, methodologist responsible for organizing the monitoring of the study process at Master's cycle and other hierarchically superior structures about any deficiency related to the communication with supervisor, yet, it is not clear what steps are taken as a result of such feedback. There is no system of gathering feedback from the students about the satisfaction with the quality of supervision of the thesis. Research skills of both the students and teaching staff should be increased; students should be more actively involved in research-related activities. Since the majority of the teaching staff are also employed in other organisations besides ULIM, there is not enough time to be dedicated on supervising MA thesis and encouraging students to take part in research and development activities. Teaching staff themselves should be more orientated towards research; at the moment there is lack of such orientation.



#### Commendations:

- It is commendable that students themselves have taken responsibility for analysing the feedback and proposing changes in the programme and study management based on the results of feedback. Students could be encouraged even more to take active part in quality assurance processes of the study programme.
- Majority of the teaching staff and students knows foreign languages and uses books in English/French for teaching/learning purposes.
- The eagerness of the teaching staff in applying new and more interactive teaching methods and sharing experience among each other is commendable and worthy to set as an example to other universities.

#### **Recommendations:**

- It is recommended to publish all the regulations on the website of the University and to have them translated into English and electronically published for the international students who should be aware of the study regulations.
- It is recommended to launch the strategy of improving the English language skills of the staff and students to make them more competitive on the labour market.
- Provide students with more up-to-date teaching materials in English. Also to structurally include up-to-date English materials in the syllabuses and in the library as well as in master thesis.
- It is advisable to analyse the duration of the internship and the volume of work the students have to do during the internship and adjust them so that the weekly workload of students would be reasonable and in line with the ECTS credits and hours connected to the credits.
- It is recommended to find partner organisations that offer internship places for ULIM students also among international organisations and other institutions dealing with international law, at home and abroad, in order to give students more opportunities to deepen their understanding of international law and obtain a true and necessary experience of working within the realm of international and European law and with foreigners as well as in foreign languages.
- It is highly recommended to analyse the practice of implementing the present grading system and give teaching staff instructions about correct implementation of the system. It should be considered whether the level of teaching in this Master programme is really high enough and whether there are enough true challenges, depth and substance. Speedy remedies are necessary here.
- It is recommended to gather feedback from the students about the satisfaction with the quality of supervision of the thesis after they have defended their thesis and use this feedback for improving the skills of supervision of the teaching staff.
- It is recommended to launch a regular course for the teaching staff aimed at improving the competences of teaching.



• It is recommended to bring students in closer contact with the research conducted by the staff and make the programme a research led master programme.

2.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.

## **Comments:**

Study management is regulated, but there is only limited access to the texts of the regulations on the website of ULIM. According to the information received from the staff of ULIM the study regulations have not been translated into English. The main menu of the website has been translated into English, French and Russian languages, but the content is still only in Romanian. In the interviews conducted during the accreditation process, the representatives of the employers and alumni expressed the need for updating the website of ULIM and publishing more materials about the activities of the University to better communicate with the students and the society.

Feedback from students about the study process is gathered, but only once during the studies at the end of the academic year. Students themselves analyse the results of feedback and propose the changes in the study programme and study management. Some members of the teaching staff have implemented their own system of collecting feedback about their course in order to get more precise and up-to-date information about the students' reactions to and expectations about the course. A well-established system of taking the results of the feedback into account in study management development is not in place.

#### Commendation:

• It is commendable that students themselves have taken responsibility for analysing the feedback and proposing changes in the programme and study management based on the results of feedback. Students could be encouraged even more to take active part in quality assurance processes of the study programme.

#### Recommendation:

• It is recommended to publish all the regulations on the website of the University and to have them translated into English and electronically published for the international students who should be aware of the study regulations.



# 2.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, teamwork-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.

#### Comments:

According to the Self-Evaluation Report and the interviews conducted with the teaching staff and students, modern and interactive teaching strategies, such as Moot Courts and Mock Trials, brainstorming, mind-mapping etc. are applied in the teaching-learning process. The teaching staff described during the interviews how they share the experience about teaching methods among each other and discuss it in the Faculty. IT technologies (interactive testing system, MOODLE, etc.) are used to make the learning process more interactive. It was described how one of the professors had used open testing for the exam, letting the students pass the test as many times as they wished and taking into account the best result. That method made the students to dedicate more time on this subject and to rethink the mistakes they made. During their interview, the students expressed satisfaction with the teaching methods used by the teaching staff.

#### Commendation:

• The eagerness of the teaching staff in applying new and more interactive teaching methods and sharing experience among each other is commendable and worthy to set as an example to other universities.

## 2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.

## Comments:

According to the Head of the Library, ULIM library has got an annual budget of EUR 5000 to buy books and electronic resources for the library. Still, the library is far from being adequately equipped, especially in terms of contemporary legal literature in foreign languages. The Vice-Rector admitted that ULIM needs to increase the library materials in foreign languages and start courses in French and English. The legal databases and electronic journals bought by ULIM can be accessed by all members of the staff, students and visitors within the premises of ULIM (via local WIFI network). Members of the teaching staff and students claimed that they are frequent visitors in the Public Law Library.

The Committee acknowledges that the majority of the students and staff members met could speak foreign languages, and literature in English/French is used for teaching and learning. Not all, but the majority of the people the Assessment Committee met were fluent in English. Nevertheless, the insufficient command of English by the staff and students was pointed out by themselves as one of the main threats to the quality of education in ULIM.

The lecture notes of the teaching staff are published on CD-s and made available for the students.

There is a lot of room for improvement with regard to the sources used in the MA thesis defended in ULIM last year. In the thesis, there are sources in English used now and then, but not to the sufficient extent. Analysis by the Committee of relevant and available literature in the



library showed that many sources are outdated and scarce, specifically on international law and European law in the English language.

## Commendation:

• Majority of the teaching staff and students knows foreign languages and uses books in English/French for teaching/learning purposes.

## Recommendations:

- It is recommended to launch the strategy of improving the English language skills of the academic staff and students of ULIM even more to make them more competitive on the labour market.
- Provide students with more up-to-date teaching materials in English. Also to structurally include up-to-date English materials in the syllabuses and in the library as well as in master thesis.
- 2.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.

## Comments:

The organisation of internship is regulated and the requirements for the completion of internship are determined. Each student has a tutor at the host organization where they do their internship. There is a methodical guide about internship, which is available for the students and the tutors. The tutors assess the outcomes of the internship and the students present a written report that contains evidence about the development of practical skills and the competences acquired.

The duration of internship is 5 weeks, the students get 10 ECTS for internship and are expected to work 300 hours for that. According to that the work load per one week is 60 hours. That appears to the Committee not to be in accordance with rules and ECTS credits. 5 weeks for 10 ECTS do not really match and this ought to be remedied shortly.

#### **Recommendation:**

- It is necessary to analyse the duration of the internship and the volume of work students have to do during the internship and adjust these so that the weekly workload of students and the ECTS are in accordance.
- 2.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.



#### Comments:

Agreements have been signed with partner organisations that provide opportunities to perform internship. All the partner organisations are from Moldova and therefore the internship places have so far been mostly national, such as Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Defence, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Prosecutors' Office, courts, Anti-corruption Centre. The list of internship places for the last year confirmed that most of the students, with some exceptions, are having their internships in places which are more related to judicial, law enforcement fields and not to international law. According to the Vice-Rector, the Career Counselling Centre helps the students to find relevant places for internship. The students also confirmed that the university has helped them to find internship places if necessary.

#### Recommendation:

• It is recommended and necessary for an International Law programme to find and have partner organisations that offer internship places for ULIM students also among international organisations and other institutions dealing with international law or European law abroad to give students more opportunities to deepen their understanding of international law and of European law and get the experience of working abroad, in foreign settings and with foreign languages.

# 2.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.

## Comments:

According to the data presented by ULIM, the average grade for the exams in 2015 was 9.14. Those grades are incomprehensibly high, taking into account that the grading system used has "10" as the highest grade and "5" as the pass rate (lowest positive grade). It is also important to mention that the current grading system does not even formally conform to the ECTS grading scale, where "A" is the highest positive grade and "E" marks the pass rate. During the interviews the teaching staff could not give any clear explanations about this situation and kept convincing that the grades are so high because the students are so bright and experienced. The teaching staff also claimed that good grades are related to the relatively few students in the group. The smaller the group, the more attention can be spent on each student individually and the better the results.

The teaching staff claimed that each of them have their own methods for giving the students feedback about their performance, but there is no training or counselling offered by the university how to make it more effective.

#### Recommendations:

• It is necessary to critically analyse and amend the practice of the present grading system in order to ensure a fair and



comprehensive assessment of the academic performance of students, and to give teaching staff instructions about correct implementation of the system and of awarding grades. The reason for high grades cannot solely be the outstanding performance of (almost) all of the students, but must be sought also in the level of teaching of this Master programme and the lack of true challenges, depth and substance. Speedy remedies are necessary here.

• It is recommended to share experience among the teaching staff about methods of giving feedback to the students and to make sure the feedback is well-structured and supports students' development.

## 2.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.

## Comments:

According to the interview with the Vice-Rector, the Head of the Department of Public Law and also the students, the University recognizes prior learning experience according to the national legislation. There have been several cases when credits obtained in other higher educational institutions have been transferred.

Prior work experience is recognized as performance of internship. In order to have prior work experience recognized the student has to present the certificate about employment, the list of tasks fulfilled at the working place, the characterization by the employer and the report completed by the student about work experience, which are assessed by the University.

## 2.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are undertaken.

#### Comments:

According to the Self-Evaluation Report, systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and the results are discussed in different bodies of ULIM. However, during the visit the staff could not convince the Committee that the analysis of learning outcomes is a systematic procedure or that there is a system for using the analysis for improving the achievement of learning outcomes. The university is encouraged to make sure that a system of evaluation, analyses and application is put in place and executed.

2.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is high.

#### Comments:



The Vice-Rector stated that the "International and Institutional Law" MA programme includes some elements of research, but the research skills of both the students and teaching staff should be increased. ULIM has got its own journal where professors and students can publish articles. Students' research conferences are organized. Cooperation agreements with other higher educational establishments in Moldova have been signed to cooperate in training PhD students and developing scientific research. The majority of the teaching staff are also employed in other organisations besides ULIM and this explains why there is not enough time to dedicate themselves to supervising MA thesis and encouraging students to take part in research and development activities. The university has established a procedure which foresees that staff members are to present annual research plans and reports concerning published articles and monographs, participation in conferences, projects etc.; additionally, the Centre of legal Research publishes a scientific magazine "Studii Juridice Universitare" and collections of reports from the conferences organized by the Centre. However, these activities are far from pursuing a research focus and strategy, which support a master programme. Therefore, teaching staff themselves should be more orientated towards research; at the moment there is lack of such orientation.

The Self-Evaluation Report states that students have the possibility to inform the programme manager, head of department, methodologist responsible for organising the monitoring of the study process at Master's cycle and other hierarchically superior structures about any deficiency related to the communication with supervisor. Yet, it is not clear what steps can be taken as a result of such feedback. There is no system of gathering feedback from the students about the satisfaction with the quality of supervision of the thesis.

#### Recommendations:

- It is recommended to gather feedback from the students about the satisfaction with the quality of supervision of the thesis after they have defended their thesis and use this feedback for improving the skills of supervision of the teaching staff.
- It is recommended to launch a course for the teaching staff for improving the competences of teaching, including the skills of supervising the writing of the thesis.
- It is recommended to bring students in closer contact with the research conducted by the staff and make the programme a research led master programme.

3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	



#### **Collected evidence:**

- Website of ULIM http://cci.ulim.md/
- Cooperation agreements with national and foreign universities (http://cci.ulim.md/bilaterale-inter-institutionale/)
- CVs of teaching staff
- Information obtained during the interviews
- Information available in the Self-Evaluation Report of ULIM

#### **General comments:**

There is a good balance between the distribution of full-time teaching staff by age and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensuring the sustainability of the study programme. Also, the qualification of teaching staff is sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme at MA level. However, staff size (4 full-time academic staff members out of 9 teaching on the programme) is indeed very limited and appears not to be in balance with the breadth and depth of the programme which focuses on both international and European law. The small number also poses a risk from the perspective of building a true academic culture in the institution and guaranteeing full expertise and knowledge to be present in all domains of the programme.

During the interviews it became evident that no visiting lecturers were involved in teaching the master program under assessment. Only public lectures have been organised with participation of ambassadors and international organizations/projects representatives, but such lecturers are not incorporated in teaching the courses of the study programme and therefore cannot be considered as visiting professors. During the meeting, students expressed desire to have more visiting members of the teaching staff from foreign universities.

Only very limited number of teaching staff have developed their skills at foreign higher education institutions and no staff member on the MA programme has participated in international networks, despite the fact that the majority of the teaching staff knows foreign languages, which is very positive and helpful. More opportunities should be found to facilitate and encourage such mobility.

There was no clear evidence of the involvement of teaching staff in national and international research projects and participation in national and international conferences. The University itself is organising numerous conferences and forums and in 2014 passed the scientific accreditation. Yet, participation both in national and international research projects and conferences must be increased in number and scope.



## Recommendations:

- An increase in the number of full-time staff members of the master programme is absolutely necessary to make the programme more durable and ensure its quality.
- It is recommended to structurally increase the involvement of foreign visiting teaching staff in the teaching of the study programme. Video conferences for involving visiting lecturers in teaching process would be, for instance, one option.
- The University is recommended to plan the development of the skills of teaching staff at foreign higher education institutions and participation in international networks, motivate lecturers to undertake such activities and provide necessary funds for that.
- It is recommended for the Faculty to ensure much broader involvement of the teaching staff in international research projects and participation in international scientific conferences by providing necessary finances for this purpose.
- It is also recommended to seek scientific cooperation partners from countries other than Ukraine or Belarus. Since the focus in the master programme is also on European law, co-operation and exchange with EU partners and universities is imperative.
- 3.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report, the CVs of teaching staff and the interviews confirm that the number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. The programme "International and Institutional Law" is implemented by 9 teaching staff members and additionally 4 academic staff members in compensatory studies – in total 13 members. Among the 9 staff members involved in the programme, 6 hold a doctoral degree in law (67%) and 3 Master's degree in law (33%). Among these 9 staff members, only 4 are full-time employed lecturers teaching the students of this master programme and have the workload at the university at least 1.00 (3 have the work load bigger than 1.00); they are teaching 10 out of 15 courses of the programme; all of them hold a doctoral degree in law.

3.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.

## **Comments:**

According to the information provided in the Self-Evaluation Report and the CVs of teaching staff, the structure of the teaching staff – all together 13 academics – by age is as follows: 70% of the staff are less than 45 years old, 23% are between ages 46-60, and 7% over 60 years old. The teaching staff who are younger than 35 constitutes over 40% of the employees involved in the implementation of the study programme.



The average age of the staff teaching on the programme is 42 years. There are 4 full-time teaching staff members; their average age is 38 years.

The above confirms that there is a good balance between the distribution of full-time teaching staff by age and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensuring the sustainability of the study programme.

3.3. <u>REQUIREMENT</u>: The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at MA level.

#### Comments:

The overall number of academics involved in the implementation of the Master programme "International and Institutional Law" is 9 persons, 3 of whom are also working in other institutions; 4 lecturers (out of 9) teaching the students of this master programme have full-time workload at the university, 3 among them workload bigger than 1,00. The interview with teaching staff and students proves that the number of supervised students for each lecturer is adequate (2-7 students are supervised by one lecturer), but they also revealed that students' individual work is less than is foreseen in the course programmes and is required for 90 ECTS credits.

• All in all, the information obtained from the Self-Evaluation Report, the CVs of the teaching staff and the interviews confirm that the qualification of teaching staff is sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme at MA level. However, staff size (4 full-time academic staff members) is indeed very limited and appears not to be in balance with the breadth and depth of the programme which focuses on both international and European law. The small number also poses a risk from the perspective of building a true academic culture in the institution and guaranteeing full expertise and knowledge to be present in all domains of the programme. Increase in the number of full-time staff members of the master programme is absolutely necessary to make the programme more durable and ensure its quality.

#### Recommendation:

• To seek to build a truly international competitive and sustainable programme with sizeable staff, so as to accommodate all relevant and necessary expertise. An option to be pursued is to seek collaboration with other International/European law programmes and thus pool resources and create a larger student body, whilst building a competitive joint programme.

3.4. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching



#### methods.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report states that "The teaching staff of the Law faculty have adequate education and professional experience for the taught disciplines. They hold or have held positions in different legal structures, offering them the possibility of organizing the courses at a high level and to prove the continuous improvement." ULIM offers teaching staff opportunities to develop their teaching skills within the psychological-pedagogical module organized by the Psychology and Social Assistance Faculty. The interviews with students and teaching staff confirmed that lecturers have adequate teaching competences and are using various interactive teaching methods.

# 3.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report provides information that ULIM offers teaching staff opportunities for the development of teaching skills within the psychological-pedagogical module organized by the Psychology and Social Assistance Faculty. This module includes trainings on curriculum theory and methodology, evaluation theory and methodology, university didactics, ethics in pedagogy, class management, etc. During the meetings it was confirmed that majority of the lecturers participating in the interview completed the psychological-pedagogical module. Lecturers also informed that the University organises once a year courses for the teaching staff in application of IT technologies and modern teaching methods, and lecturers have the obligation to attend these courses. These courses are also organised by the Psychology and Social Assistance Faculty. The lecturers also informed that they are organising discussions on teaching methods in the Chair meetings, are sharing information and experience on new methods applied. From the total of 13 teaching staff involved in the realization of the Master programme, 8 of them know at least one foreign language at a sufficient level. The University is also supporting the teaching staff mobility.

The information above allows to conclude that the staff development system is in place and it is effective.

# 3.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.

#### Comments:

Although the Self-Evaluation Report informs colleagues from university's partners (e.g., from the University Paul Cézanne-Aix-Marseille III, Aix-en-Provence, France; University "Spiru Haret", Bucarest, Romania; Institute of International Relations, National University "Taras Shevchenko" Kiev, Ukraine) have visited ULIM and there is collaboration with strategic partners such as UNCHR, ICRC, International Organization for Migration, EUBAM, Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and European Integration of the Republic of Moldova, during the interviews it



became evident that no visiting lecturers have been involved in teaching the master programme under assessment. Only public lectures have been organised with participation of ambassadors and international organisations/projects representatives, but such lecturers are not incorporated in teaching the courses of the study programme and therefore cannot be considered as visiting professors. During the meeting, students expressed desire to have more visiting members of the teaching staff from foreign universities.

#### Recommendation:

• It is recommended to substantially increase the involvement of foreign visiting teaching staff in the teaching of the study programme. Video conferences for involving visiting lecturers in teaching process would be, for instance, one option.

3.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.

#### Comments:

Only very limited number of teaching staff have developed their skills at foreign higher education institutions and no staff member on the MA programme has participated in international networks. Information about participation in mobility projects is provided only about lecturer Mr. V. Gamurari, who has taken part in the following projects: University Sorento, Lecce, Italy, Master Program "Erasmus" April 30th – May 3rd, 2009; Université Paul Cézanne Aix-Marseille III, Aix-en-Provence, France, Master Program II "Droit international pénal" March 15th–April 15th, 2010; Mykolas Romeris University, Vilnius, Lithuania, April 5th–11th, 2011; International University "MITSO", Minsk, Belarus, Master Program "International Law" October 31st, 2012–November 1st, 2012. The University has a number of cooperation agreements with foreign universities which would offer possibilities for lecturers' mobility, for instance, in Bulgaria, France, Italy, Romania, Russia, Ukraine, USA, South Korea, and others. Majority of the teaching staff knows foreign languages, which is very positive, and therefore more opportunities should be found to facilitate and encourage such mobility. Such a limited participation in international networks and development of skills at foreign institutions of higher education on part of the teaching staff cannot be considered as regular, which is requested for fulfilment of this requirement.

## **Recommendation:**

- The University is recommended to plan the development of the skills of teaching staff at foreign higher education institutions and participation in international networks, motivate lecturers to undertake such activities and provide necessary funds for that.
- 3.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report provides information that the teaching staff involved in the implementation of the Master programme have contributed to the organisation of a series of conferences, participated in the editorial boards, working groups, etc.; the teaching staff/scientific researchers from other countries have participated as members of the Editorial Board for the scientific magazine "University Legal Studies", and Editorial Board of the international scientific conferences organised with the participation of the scientific/teaching staff within the Master programme.

Unfortunately, the lecturers' CVs do not provide any information on their involvement in national and international research projects and participation in national and international conferences. The University itself is organising numerous conferences and forums and in 2014 passed the scientific accreditation. Yet, participation both in national and international research projects and conferences must be increased in number and scope.

#### Recommendations:

- It is recommended for the Faculty to ensure much broader involvement of the teaching staff in international research projects and participation in international scientific conferences by providing necessary finances for this purpose.
- It is also recommended to seek scientific cooperation partners from countries other than Ukraine or Belarus. This is specifically relevant and obvious when considering the important place for European law in the master programme. That aspect requires a much wider research collaboration and involvement in European networks.

## 3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

## Comments:

Interviews confirmed that research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently. There are plans of the research activities of the Chair and also the plans of the individual teachers. Lecturers are developing the plans at the beginning of the academic year, which includes pedagogical and scientific activities and reports on its implementation in June. Scientific activities are organised by the Research Centre. The teaching staff confirmed that the planning and monitoring system is in place and fulfils its functions.

4.	STUDENTS	conforms to	partially conforms to	does not conform to	i
----	----------	-------------	-----------------------	---------------------	---



	requirements	requirements	requirements
mark with 'X'		X	

#### Collected evidence:

- Internal Regulation on the activity of the career counselling and orienteering Centre (available during the visit)
- The Register of the career counselling and orienteering Centre (available during the visit)
- Internal framework Regulation on academic mobility (I, II, and III cycle) approved by the Senate on 27 January 2014 (http://cci.ulim.md/assets/files/mobilitate/Regulament-Cadru-cu-privire-la-mobilitatea-academica-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEnv%C4%83t%C4%83mintului-superior-cadru-md.pdf)
- Information on the organization of informative seminars on mobility opportunities (http://cci.ulim.md/)
- The web-page of the Centre for international cooperation (http://cci.ulim.md/mobilitate/)
- Cooperation agreements with national and foreign universities (http://cci.ulim.md/bilaterale-inter-institutionale/)
- Regulation on the Senate's activity (http://ulim.md/assets/files/senatul\_regulamentul.doc.pdf)
- The list of the members of the Senate (http://ulim.md/senat/membri)
- Cooperation agreements with the representatives of the labour market (the cooperation agreements provided during the visit and the list available on http://drept.ulim.md/studii/licenta/stagii-profesionale)
- The list of the internship places for 2014, MA programme in International and Institutional Law (available during the visit)
- Report on the number of enrolled students and graduates of the MA programme in International and Institutional Law (available during the visit)
- The information obtained during the interviews
- Information available in the Self-Evaluation Report

#### **General comments:**

The university generally complies with the requirements. There is still a need to encourage the MA students to apply for and benefit from the mobility opportunities provided by the university. The medium-term plans to offer joint diplomas with universities from EU countries is a clear step in that direction. The cooperation agreements with the employers and the internship places indicate that the university is planning to make more efforts to obtain better information about the labour market and to ensure that this information is related to the objectives and learning outcomes of the MA programme - International and EU law. The programme and the University have to focus on links with international labour markets and national employers with international and European aspects. This is needed to become a centre of international and European law for students, staff and society, providing the expertise and research and being a focal point for all stakeholders and students.



#### Commendations:

- The university has a functioning system for career counselling and orientation as well as psychological counselling for students.
- The university has a Centre for International Cooperation responsible for students' mobility and its web-page.
- A functioning system is in place for detection and prevention of academic fraud.

#### Recommendations:

- Increase the transparency of the admission process for the 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle by adopting and publishing on the university's web-site the internal act which would clearly regulate the admission requirements for the Master studies.
- Further continue the efforts to create opportunities and encourage international mobility for MA students.
- Further improve the tracking and monitoring mechanism of the graduates' career and establish an alumni association which would create more opportunities for the graduates and the university to keep in contact with each other.
- Increase efforts for better links and exchanges with (international and European oriented) labour markets and societal needs.
- Develop a clearer strategy regarding the internship places that would fit the objectives and the learning outcomes of the MA programme.

# 4.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.

#### **Comments:**

The admission process is based on the national legal framework (Code of Education and the Government Decision on the organization of the Master study programmes of 2007). No internal regulation has been identified on the university's website or among the annexes to the Self-Evaluation Report which would regulate the admission process for the 2nd cycle studies (the regulation exists only for the 1st cycle) and it was not made available during the visit. The management of the university informed that the admission requirements include a specialty exam and an assessment of the IT and foreign language skills. Reduction of 30% of tuition fee is applied to the students who have graduated from BA studies in ULIM.

In terms of numbers of admission, a tendency in decrease has been observed, which is applicable for all the 5 MA programmes taught at the Faculty of Law and mentioned in the Self-Evaluation Report, including the programme "International and Institutional Law". 23 students were enrolled for the MA in "International and Institutional Law" in 2014, compared to the 43 enrolled in 2010 (2010 – 43 students; 2011 – 38 students; 2012 – 28 students; 2013 – 30 students; 2014 – 23 students). While the numbers have decreased almost twice, the university claims



that the number of applicants is constant each year and the smaller number is due to the selection process – not all the applicants have succeeded. The Committee was informed that usually there are about 50-60 applicants and the competition is 2–2.5 persons per place. The representatives of the university informed about their strategy to enrol more, about 40 students, which would fit the capacity of the institution. In that respect, the university had intensified its dialog with employers. Part of the university strategy is also to attract more foreign students – up to 10% – and for that the university plans to enhance the foreign language skills of Bachelor students, increase the number of books available in foreign languages and introduce coursers taught in English/French, especially for the coursers with international content. The students and graduates whom the Committee met demonstrated adequate skills and good command of English.

#### Recommendations:

- The university is recommended to increase the transparency of the admission process for the master studies and adopt and publish on its web-site the internal act which clearly regulates the admissions requirements.
- It is recommended not to apply different tuition fees to students dependent on the university from which they graduated BA studies. The aim of ULIM should be to attract best students from all over the country and abroad and to avoid potential academic inbreeding. At the same time, reduction of tuition fee as a result of excellent academic results is applied and is purposeful and effective, but this information ought to be published on the university's website.
- The university has to reflect on how to make the programme attractive and competitive. The Committee suggests that the best way is to develop the programme into a top level programme, with higher (and much higher) challenges for the students, international mobility, and perspectives on relevant labour markets.

# 4.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.

## Comments:

ULIM has a Centre for Career Counselling and Orientation, which is also responsible for psychological counselling of students. Its activity is regulated by an internal act which provides a list of members of the Centre: methodologists, psychologists, IT specialists, representatives of each faculty and other interested parties (students, graduates, etc.). The academic staff and the students of the Faculty of Psychology are also working at the Centre. During the visit, the Register of the Centre was made available which confirmed the activity of this unit: career guidance; counselling and training; psychological counselling. The unit also uses special questionnaires for undergraduate students from various schools of the country in order to help them to choose the most suited field of study for higher education.





#### Commendation:

• The university has a functioning system for career counselling and orientation as well as psychological counselling for students.

## 4.3. REQUIREMENT: Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.

#### Comments:

The university has a Centre for International Cooperation, which is in charge of helping students to find mobility opportunities and prepare the file for students' applications. The Committee had an opportunity to visit the office of the Centre, which was well-organised. The Self-Evaluation Report also states that the university organises special seminars and offers counselling for practical aspects related to the participation in mobility programmes, such as Erasmus Mundus/Erasmus Plus, Ceepus III, AUF, DAAD. This was confirmed by the students who informed that they are offered exchange opportunities and that they are informed by the teachers about such opportunities at the beginning of their courses. The web-site of the university contains some information about the organisation of such information seminar: Fulbright, Carnegie research fellowship program, etc. (http://cci.ulim.md/). The Centre for International Cooperation has a separate web-page and a special section dedicated to student mobility with a quite detailed and informative content (http://cci.ulim.md/mobilitate/). The university has many cooperation agreements with foreign universities; the list and their content are available on http://cci.ulim.md/bilaterale-inter-institutionale/. The academic mobility (1st, 2nd and 3rd cycles) is regulated by an internal framework Regulation approved by the Senate on 27 of January 2014 (http://cci.ulim.md/assets/files/mobilitate/Regulament-Cadru-cu-privire-la-mobilitatea-academica-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-mobilitatea-academica-mobility (1st, 2nd and 3rd cycles) is regulated by an internal framework Regulation approved by the Senate on 27 of January 2014 (http://cci.ulim.md/assets/files/mobilitate/Regulament-Cadru-cu-privire-la-mobilitatea-academica-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-mobilitatea-academica-%C3%AEn-%C3%AEn-mobilitatea-academica-%C3%AEn-

With regard to internal mobility, the representatives of the university informed that they cooperate with other national universities for the development of the curriculum and when organising/participating at scientific conferences or training the PhD students. Universities in Cahul, Comrat, Balti, and The Institute of Economy of the Academy of Science are among the institutions with which ULIM has concluded cooperation agreements (http://cci.ulim.md/bilaterale-inter-institutionale/).

### Recommendation:

Both external and internal mobility activities must be broadened and more EU and other foreign universities and institutions included in
the selection. International law master programme is an international programme and this facet and focus must also be seen to be truly
reflected in how the programme is taught and how its facilities are set up. Being international implies to be truly international in
outlook, exchanges, study materials, jobs, internships, mobility, and teaching staff and its qualifications.

## 4.4. REQUIREMENT: Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in

#### student mobility is stable or growing.

#### Comments:

No students enrolled in the MA programme have participated in international mobility programmes so far. The management of the university informed that the students of other faculties are more active and benefit of such opportunities. The Committee also learned during the interviews that students have had had sufficient international opportunities through their work, and having work or a family are the main reasons that make participation in mobility programmes difficult. The management informed that the university plans to encourage students' participation by offering joint diplomas with foreign universities from France, Switzerland, and Italy. The university plans to develop such cooperation relations within the following 5 years and make such opportunities available for both MA and PhD students.

#### Recommendation:

• The university is strongly recommended to further continue its efforts to create opportunities and encourage international mobility for MA students.

## 4.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education institution.

#### Comments:

Students are involved in the decision-making process at the level of the Faculty Council (20% of the Council members are students), Senate (20% of the members are students), Quality Commission of the Faculty of Law and of the university. Art. 8 of the Regulation on the Senate's activity (http://ulim.md/assets/files/senatul\_regulamentul.doc.pdf) stipulates that each Department shall be represented by a student elected by students' associations. The list of the members of the Senate available on university's web-site confirms that about 23% of the members are students' representatives (14 out of 60) - http://ulim.md/senat/membri. The students who the Committee met during the visit were aware of their representation and gave examples of cases when their proposals were conveyed to the Senate.

## 4.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.

## Comments:

The university has developed an anti-plagiarism software. The management of the university informed that there is still room for improving the existing software. Nevertheless, the Committee learned from the students it met during the visit that all their BA thesis were checked by the anti-plagiarism programme and were of the opinion that the system has been improved. The management of the university informed about regular meetings where the academic fraud issue is discussed and the students demonstrated adequate knowledge about the concept of



plagiarism and the system in place to detect it. In order to prevent plagiarism, the university revises the topics of the master thesis each year. This was confirmed by the management of the university as well as by the unit dealing with anti-plagiarism soft (Quality Assurance Council). The university claims that no cases of academic fraud have been registered since 2011.

4.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates' employment and is monitoring the evolution of graduates' career.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 16) mentions that the Department of Partnerships, Counselling and Continuous Training ensures the monitoring of the employment and career development of the graduates. The university has information about the employment rate of its students, including those who are employed in areas which are not related to the MA programme. There are plans to improve the system and the Report informs that on 16 April 2014 the Senate decided to establish a more advanced mechanism for analyses of the labour market and monitoring the career development of the graduates. No information was provided as to what is the current stage of the implementation of the Senate's decision.

## Recommendation:

- The university is recommended to enhance its mechanism for monitoring the employment and career development of the graduates and establish an alumni association, which would create more opportunities for the graduates and the university to keep in contact with each other.
- 4.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the programme.

#### Comments:

The Self-Evaluation Report (p. 17) states that the Department of Partnerships, Counselling and Continuous Training performs quantitative and qualitative research about employability and competitiveness of graduates at institutional level. According to the table below (p. 16 of the Self-Evaluation Report) the employment rate of the graduates is about 60%.

	2010	2011	2012	2013



Number of graduates employed	63%	57%	54%	57%
among whom employed in the specialty:	80%	56%	56%	56%
Unemployed	37%	43%	46%	43%

However, it was not entirely clear how the employment rate of the "International and Institutional Law" MA programme can be 60% while the team was informed that about 80% of the students are already employed. It also appears that the provided information applies to the Faculty of Law graduates and not to the graduates of the MA programme.

From the discussion with various stakeholders during the visit, some conflicting opinions were heard by the Committee. For example, the employers and alumni had a higher opinion about the employability of the MA programme graduates, while the management of the university seemed to agree with the information regarding the 43% of unemployment rate. It appears that the university does not have accurate data about the employment rate and the competitiveness of the graduates of the MA programme.

The team was also not entirely clear which employers constitute the target group for the MA programme in "International and Institutional Law" as the partnerships with employers predominantly focus on courts and law enforcement authorities (the cooperation agreements provided during the visit and the list available on <a href="http://drept.ulim.md/studii/licenta/stagii-profesionale">http://drept.ulim.md/studii/licenta/stagii-profesionale</a>) and the internships places for the MA students for the last year confirmed this approach (the list of the internship places for 2014, MA programme in International and Institutional Law provided during the visit).

# 4.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.

## Comments:

The academic progress is monitored by the Department of Academic Affairs together with the programme manager, and the results are regularly discussed during the Senate's meetings (Self-Evaluation Report, p. 17). Nevertheless, the Committee learned that the students get predominantly high grades (at least 8 out of 10) and the main arguments from the university's side on this system of grading is reliance on high competences of the enrolled MA students (see 2.6 above). Supra, the Committee has expressed its doubts as to the integrity of the grading system and its apparent flaws and setbacks and the need to structurally remedy the situation.

In 2009-2012, 138 students were admitted on the MA programme; in the period of 2011-2014, 113 of them graduated, indicating a drop-out rate of 18% (Self-Evaluation Report p. 4). The information made available during the visit (Report on the enrolled students and graduates of the



MA programme) reveals that the drop-out rates vary each year between 9% and 29% and that the average rate is about 17%. The management and the academic staff were aware of the reasons (e.g., personal and financial issues; not being interested in the subject, etc.), and informed about the strategies applied for reducing the drop-outs which seemed to be adequate: personal discussions with the student, a flexible programme for the exams if needed, materials provided in Romanian/Russian (since the programme has also enrolled Russian-speaking people), psychological counselling, organizing studies in the evening, etc.

5. RESOURCES	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		Х	!

#### Collected evidence:

- Information obtained during the interviews
- Information available in the Self-Evaluation Report of ULIM

#### **General comments:**

The fact that the International and Institutional Law programme is set within the context of a larger institution has certainly been a benefit. Also, the number of students does create confidence about sustainability, though the numbers are still small and declining, which is worrying, but which is obviously a general trend in many institutions.

The University has provided the team with further specific data about intake in the programme and these figures show a decline from 43 in 2010, to 38 in 2011, to 28 in 2012, 30 in 2013 and to 23 in 2014 (for the year 2014/15).

The Committee has also been provided with budgetary data about the budget years 2010, up until 2014. A matter of concern here is that the revenues have declined from 54,696,254 MDL in 2010 to 47,356,387 MDL in 2014. Personnel expenditure went up (from 13,656,703 MDL up to 19,328,730 MDL). The percentage of staff in the 2014 budget of 41,2% is according to international standards rather low, since law programmes appear to have staff expenses as a major cost.

Although the university has a spacious and beautiful library, the collection of literature concerning international (and European) law should be updated and expanded.



#### Recommendation:

• The University needs to make substantial investments into updating the library with international literature and journals regarding international and European law.

# 5.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.

#### Comments:

The university budget is approved by the Administrative Council of ULIM. The Committee was provided with budgetary data about the budget years 2010, up until 2014. A matter of concern here is that the revenues have declined from 54,696,254 MDL in 2010 to 47,356,387 MDL in 2014. Personnel expenditure went up (from 13,656,703 MDL up to 19,328,730 MDL). The percentage of staff costs is according to international standards rather low (although there has been a positive increase from 38,7% in 2010 to 41,2% in 2014), since law programmes appear to have staff expenses as a major cost. Positively, income from research projects has increased from 7,6% of total income in 2010 to 10% in 2014.

The resources seem sustainable to us in the sense that no deficit was run, although investments (in full-time staff, research, staff and student mobility, library etc) will be impacting the budget and with the decline in students numbers, sustainability and the possibility to build and maintain an internationally competitive programme will be at stake.

# 5.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.

#### Comments:

The figures of intake in the Master programme show a decline from 43 in 2001, to 38 in 2011, to 28 in 2012, 30 in 2013 and to 23 in 2014 (for the year 2014/15). The committee was informed that the focus is on 40 students per annual intake. The University has explained that the decrease in student numbers is due to deep demographic decline of secondary school graduates.

Both the numbers of students as well as the budget of the university (see above 5.1) during the last 5 years have slowly but steadily declined. Therefore, there cannot be complete assurance in terms of long-term sustainability of the programme.

#### Recommendation:



- The University is encouraged to work more intensively towards the marketing of the programme, making it more attractive for potential students, so that the goal of 40 students regarding intake per year would be achieved.
- 5.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).

### Comments:

The programme is housed in the ULIM building with students having access to all facilities and with properly equipped classrooms. The facilities meet standards and are well equipped with the necessary furniture, projectors, blackboards, and computers. In 2013, ULIM invested resources into modernisation of teaching infrastructure and computers. ULIM has a spacious library which is accessible to all the university's students and has plenty of space for private work of the students.

During the visit to the University, the Committee noticed that at least some of the restrooms were locked and could only be accessed with a key. Normally, all restrooms in higher education institutions elsewhere in Europe allow free access (i.e, withought having to use a key and getting a permission from anyone) to such facilities for staff, students and anyone who visits the building. It is advisable to keep the restrooms unlocked. The committee has been informed at a later stage that this incident was due to an unlucky event and incidental.

5.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by up-to-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.

#### Comments:

The Committee has noted that IT facilities, such as touch-screen digital boards, are indeed present, running and implemented. Communication portals and E-learning facilities need to be incorporated more into the teaching process. The study information system is currently being modernised.

5.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.

## Comments:

The University has a hostel situated in the hotel complex "EUROPA".



Medical service is provided for the students of ULIM through primary medical service available at the campus. Additionally, ULIM has a collaboration agreement with the private, certified clinic "SANCOS" which offers all ULIM's students medical services.

The Committee is of the opinion that the requirement established by the state in terms of having a dormitory for *all* the students is superfluous and too expensive and should be revisited, since many students have their own abode. Instead of having its own dormitory, it could be considered to cooperate with other real-estate companies and proprietors offering accommodation. So is the requirement regarding the provision of medical service – it is outdated, too expensive, not efficient, and therefore too much a burden on small institutions and programmes with low funding.

5.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.

## Comments:

A sizable library exists and affords a variety of study places. However, in the context of an international (and European law) programme much more effort has to be made to update the collection with international literature and journals regarding international and European law. The University ought to invest in this respect.