



Accreditation of Study Programmes
Assessment Report

Institution: Technical University of Moldova

Study programme: Property Law

Assessment committee:

Dr Kristiina Tõnnisson (chair), Director of European College, University of Tartu, Estonia

Mr Adrian Ermurachi, Senior consultant, General Directorate for Policy Coordination, External Assistance and Central Public Administration Reform; PhD student; Moldova

Dr Tanel Kerikmäe, Professor, Tallinn Law School, Faculty of Social Sciences, Tallinn University of Technology, Estonia

Dr Yuliya Vashchenko, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Faculty of Law, Administrative Law Department, Associate Professor; Ukraine

Coordinator: Mr Hillar Bauman

Dates of the assessment visit: 06.05.2015

Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA: 09.06.2015

Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation: 23.06.2015

Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 4 votes in favour and 0 votes against.

Date: 03.07.2015

Template for Assessment Report

I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development	x		
Teaching and learning	x		
Teaching staff		x	
Students	x		
Resources	x		

Short information about TUM from the self-evaluation report:

Technical University of Moldova, former Polytechnic Institute of Chisinau, was established in 1964. At the moment the University structure includes 9 faculties: Power and Electrical Engineering, Mechanical and Industrial Engineering and Transports, Computers, Informatics and Microelectronics, Engineering and Management in Electronics and Telecommunications, Technology and Management in Food Industry, Light Industry, Cadaster, Geodesy and Construction, Urbanism and Architecture, Economic Engineering and Business

The Faculty of Cadaster, Geodesy and Construction, where the master's degree program is organized, cycle II, the specialty "Property Law", was founded in 1964. Currently, within the Faculty of Cadaster, Geodesy and Construction there operate five specialized departments (Department of "Constructions and Mechanics of Structures", Department of "Construction Technology", Department of "Assessment and Management of Real Estate", Department of "Geodesy, Cadaster and Geotechnics", Department of "Property Law"). In the period of 2010-2015, 45 master students graduated the master's degree program Property Law. Currently, 16 master students (year I) study the master's degree program.

Comments:

Template for Assessment Report

The study programme *Property Law* is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. The title of a study programme is consistent with its content, but it is still recommended to consider focusing the title even more, e.g. Real Estate and Cadastral Law. The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme presented in the Explanatory Note are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The study disciplines taught within the MA programme are distinguishable from those proposed in the first circle of study (LL.B Programme in Law) since they are devoted to more complex and specific issues connected to Real Estate and Cadastral Legal Regulation (e.g., Cadastral Law, Peculiarities of Procedure of Cadastral Disputes Examination, Cadastral Documents etc.). Study disciplines are presented in a logical succession.

Development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends of the labour market. Market representatives play continuously an active role in improving the programme. Modern teaching methods are applied, in particular, case studies, team work, simulations, etc. However, syllabi for the study disciplines within this Master programme need to be updated.. The teaching staff of the programme encourages the participation of students in the scientific events.

The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff of the programme complies with the requirements established by legislation. Currently more than 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. Less than 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme has PhD degree or equal. Then again the teaching staff is well balanced by age. Half of the teaching staff is relatively young and there is a clear sign of existing academic continuity. The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and they tend to improve their teaching methods constantly. Most of the members of teaching staff have solid experience both in teaching and in practice in the respective fields. Currently there is no evidence of foreign teaching staff to be involved nor do the members of full-time teaching staff of TUM develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions. Even though there is no clear evidence of a coherent research plan, the scientific activities of individual faculty members are considerable at least at the national level.

The University's resources available for the MA Programme implementation are sufficient and conform to the main requirements. The classrooms are equipped sufficiently; the equipment is renewed periodically. However, there is still room for the improvement, in particular, in part of library's equipment and further development of ICT solutions.

Commendations:

- Good visibility of the programme in the labour market in the Republic of Moldova. Programme is nationally competitive and has innovative character and potential;
- Efficient integration of the employers, in particular the State Enterprise "Cadastru", into the development of the programme;

Template for Assessment Report

- Development and annual updates of the supportive notes for all study disciplines;
- Good employment rate;
- Teaching staff is balanced by age and there is a sign of academic continuity;
- The workload of academic staff is well-balanced according to the ratio between teachers and students;
- Financial resources of TUM are sufficient; budget planning has sustainable character;
- Widespread usage of *Moodle* platform providing the students information regarding the courses online.

Recommendations:

- considering that the main focus of the programme is Real Estate and Cadastral Law issues it is recommended to replace the title of the programme with “Real Estate and Cadastral Law”;
- to involve in the programme development also the representatives of the private sector enterprises;
- to consider the positioning of the given master programme as a “professional master” rather than a “research master” programme. Alternatively, the sound vision of research-oriented programme must be developed according to international standards;
- to update the syllabi with the recent materials (textbooks, monographs, international scholarly articles etc.);
- to encourage master students’ involvement in internal and external mobility;
- to implement the measures aimed at reducing the level of drop-out;
- to involve more local and foreign lecturers in study process;
- to prioritise international research in order to establish a better ground for the master programme to be more competitive in the region;
- to invest in further development of the programme, in particular, in equipping the library with English language literature and modern sources of information, development of ICT solutions, modern equipping of the main computer room and well trained librarians, etc.

II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with ‘X’	X		
Collected evidence: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report (SER); • Annexes of SER; 			

Template for Assessment Report

- Internal regulations;
- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.

General comments:

The annual operational plans of the department as well as the strategic plan of the department are focusing on “producing” master students/ Masters having knowledge and skills appropriate for employment. The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. Considering the majority of the subjects/ study disciplines within the programme as well as the learning outcomes of the curriculum the title of a study programme is consistent with its content. However, considering that the main focus of the programme is Real Estate and Cadastral Law issues it is recommended to consider focusing the title even more, e.g. Real Estate and Cadastral Law.

The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme presented in the Explanatory Note are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The courses and study disciplines taught within the MA programme are distinguishable from those proposed in LL.B study. Study disciplines are presented in a logical succession. Development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends of the labour market. Even now the market representatives play an active role in improving the programme. The interview with the academic employees conducted during the site visit proved the strong awareness of the teaching staff of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

Commendations:

- Good visibility of the programme in the labour market in the Republic of Moldova;
- Programme is nationally competitive and innovative;
- Good cooperation between the management of the Institution and the stakeholders involved in the programme;
- Efficient integration of the employers into programme development.

Recommendations:

- to establish a regular programme’s committee responsible for ongoing programme development based on the participation of all main stakeholders, including students, graduates and representatives of the potential employers;
- considering that the main focus of the programme is Real Estate and Cadastral Law issues it is recommended to replace the title of the

Template for Assessment Report

<p>programme with “Real Estate and Cadastral Law”;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> to strengthen the participation of the representatives of the private sector enterprises in the process of the programme development. 	
<p>1.1. REQUIREMENT: A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development period.</p> <p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>TUM plans regularly its development. It has both the structure and the guiding principles in place. The program of master’s degrees studies, cycle II, named <i>Property Law</i> is based on the provisions of the Strategic plan for development of Property Law Department for the period of 2009-2014 and, respectively, for the period of 2014-2019. According to SER there are the following documents guiding the long term and short term development of the Property Law programme on various institutional levels:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - activity programs of TUM Rector; - annual reports on budget execution and activities of TUM; - policy documents of Faculty of Cadaster, Geodesy and Construction (FCGC); - policy documents of Department of Property Law within FCGC. - decisions of TUM Senate on internal evaluation of programs of master’s degree studies and remedy plans for the shortcomings discovered. <p>The annual operational plans of the department as well as the strategic plan of the department are focusing on “producing” master students/ Masters having knowledge and skills appropriate for employment. In accordance with the Strategic plan for development of Property Law Department for 2009-2014 as well as for 2014-2019, the Department of Property Law assumes an educational and permanent training role in order to form strong personalities, a deep and creative thinking of young people.</p>	
<p>1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.</p> <p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. The Master’s Degree Program <i>Property Law</i> was authorized by order No.388 dated May 30, 2008, of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Moldova “On the authorization of master’s</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

degree programs” (cycle II of study, specialty 38. Law, specialization 38.1.Property Law), with a total number of 90 credits, the graduates being awarded the title of <i>master in law</i> (Appendix 12).	
1.3. REQUIREMENT: The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Considering the majority of the subjects/ study disciplines within the programme as well as the learning outcomes of the curriculum the title of a study programme is consistent with its content. However, considering that the main focus of the programme is Real Estate and Cadastral Law issues it is recommended to consider focusing the title even more, e.g. Real Estate and Cadastral Law.</p>	
1.4. REQUIREMENT: The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship in general support achievement of the objectives of this study programme.</p>	
1.5. REQUIREMENT: The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme presented in the Explanatory Note are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable. In particular, there are a special Master Programme in Real Estate Law proposed by Richmond School of Law (University of Richmond, VA, USA) (http://law.richmond.edu/academics/curriculum/acp-real-estate.html) and a LLM programme in Real Estate Law proposed by John Marshall Law School (Chicago, USA) (http://www.jmls.edu/academics/realestate/llm-re-law.php).). It is advised to look at their development and learning outcomes while rethinking and improving objectives and learning outcomes of the current programme in the future.</p>	
1.6. REQUIREMENT The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master’s study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor’s study programme.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The courses and study disciplines taught within the MA programme are distinguishable from those proposed in LL.B study programme since they are devoted to more complex and specific issues connected to Real Estate and Cadastral Legal Regulation (e.g., Cadastral Law, Peculiarities of procedure of cadastral disputes examination, Cadastral documents etc.).</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p>1.7. REQUIREMENT: Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Study disciplines are presented in a logical succession. The study programme begins with introductory disciplines to the field, such as Cadastral Law, Property rights, Contract Law; following by specialized courses on Methodology of drafting civil procedural acts, peculiarities of procedure of cadastral disputes examination, etc.</p>	
<p>1.8. REQUIREMENT: Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends of the labour market. According to SER the Master programme was established in order to satisfy the needs of Labour Market in the Republic of Moldova. Even now the market representatives play an active role in improving the programme. In particular, the employers value the programme due to subjects taught and thematic content, aims of study, internship management as well as fairness and exactness of preparation of master's theses. For instance, the positive conclusion regarding the quality of the programme and its necessity for the labour market in Moldova was presented by the Vice-Director of the Agency for Land Relations and Cadaster and by Vice-Director of the State Enterprise "Cadastru".</p> <p>The board for the defence of master's theses is usually appointing the representative from employers (e.g. Deputy Director of S.E. Cadastru, judge, etc.) as the chairman of the board. The participation of the representatives of the potential employers in the development of the study programme was confirmed during various interviews conducted within the site visit. However, it is recommended to involve also representatives from the private sector enterprises in the programme development.</p>	
<p>1.9. REQUIREMENT: Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The study programme has been developed taking into account the ideas and suggestions from interested stakeholders, e.g. mostly from the teachers and employers. According to the information presented in the SER and according to the information obtained during the site visit the feedback is used while the school is planning amendments and improvements. The Institution has been organizing various feedback processes. In particular, the reviews of employers are used as well as feedback from students.</p>	
<p>1.10. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The interview with the academic employees conducted during the site visit proves the strong awareness of the teaching staff of the study</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

programme and of their role in achieving these objectives. The development of the curriculum could be considered as a common process of giving input by the members of the teaching staff. They elaborate the course learning outcomes in accordance with general objectives of the study programme.

1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.

Comments:

Since the Institution does not provide an opportunity for the doctoral studies in law, the graduates of the MA programme can continue the studies at cycle III at other institutions. The expert team commends the adequate level of preparation of master theses. Both the research and practical components of the master theses are developed in accordance with the main requirements. Therefore the graduates of the Programme have necessary knowledge and skills to continue their research activity within doctoral studies in Law. According to the information presented in SER several holders of master in law title, awarded with master's degree studies at specialty *Property Law*, are currently continuing the doctor's degree studies, cycle III, in another higher educational institution.

2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	x		
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report; • Annexes of SER; • Internal regulations and normative acts of the schools; • Additional documents received during the site visit; • Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates and employers. 			

Template for Assessment Report

General comments:

According to the SER and information received during the site visit, the study management is well regulated, regulations are publicly available on the TUM's website and they support the achievement of learning outcomes. The feedback surveys are regularly organized. Modern teaching methods are applied, in particular, case studies, team work, simulations, etc. Up-to-date teaching materials are used. The requirements for the completion of the internship are determined and the instructions for conducting the internship are available. TUM has a solid network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities. According to the students and alumni the efficient supervision is also provided. The students of the master's degree program *Property Law* are involved in the research activity within the department by developing scientific articles, verification papers and by participations in conferences, roundtables, and preparation of master's degree projects. The teaching staff of the programme encourages the participation of students in the scientific events.

Commendations:

- Development and annual updates of the supportive notes for all courses/study disciplines;
- Usage of the Moodle platform;
- Efficient organization of the internship.

Recommendations:

- To update the syllabi with the recent materials (textbooks, monographs, scientific articles etc.);
- To work out the system that recognizes and work experience;
- To enhance the students involvement in research activity both at national and international levels.

2.1. REQUIREMENT: Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER and according to the information received during the site visit, the study management is regulated by the internal regulations, they are publicly available on the TUM's website and they support the achievement of learning outcomes. The feedback surveys are regularly organized. The results of such evaluations, as well as the analysis of learning activities are taken into account during the programme's development.

Template for Assessment Report

<p>2.2. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, teamwork-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> According to the information presented in the SER, syllabi and obtained during the site visit the modern teaching methods are applied, in particular, case studies, team work, etc. Students confirmed that the teaching staff is using the modern interactive teaching technique such as mosaic approach, gallery tour, three-stage interviews, case studies, problem-solving and others.</p>	
<p>2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> According to the information presented in the SER up-to-date teaching materials are used within the education process of the study programme (e.g. handouts, PowerPoint presentations, reference books for preparing for verification tests and works, reference books on internships, scientific articles, materials of scientific conferences, diagrams, charts, examination tickets etc.). Since the property law in the Republic of Moldova is constantly modifying, the methodical materials are updated annually taking into account the views and opinions of local and foreign doctrinarians, reflected in monographs, textbooks and other scientific publications. All master students have access to teaching and training materials via TUM's <i>moodle</i> platform and to folders designated for each separate subject located at Property Law Department.</p> <p>During the site visit the institution proved the existence of necessary teaching and learning materials. In particular, explanatory notes for each discipline are developed and published annually. However, the syllabi for courses provided with the SER did not include recent references. The expert team is suggesting the improvement of the syllabi concerning more frequent use of recent academic materials as well as materials prepared by teaching staff involved in the teaching process. In particular:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Discipline "Business Law" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It is recommended to define the mandatory up-to-date scientific readings (there are only legislative documents presented in the list of mandatory reading materials) - The latest scientific reading material is from year 2006. 2) Discipline "Cadastral documents" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The latest scientific reading material is from year 2005. 3) Discipline "ECHR Procedure and Practice and other treaties obligatory for the Republic of Moldova" <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The latest scientific reading material is from year 2006 - The is no optional reading materials <p>Therefore it is strongly recommended to update the list of literature presented in the syllabi.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p>2.4. REQUIREMENT: Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Organization of internship is regulated by the legislative acts and internal regulations of the school. The requirements for the completion of the internship are determined and the instructions for conducting the internship are available. According to the students and alumni the efficient supervision is provided.</p>	
<p>2.5. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> TUM has a solid network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes. According to the presented information TUM has cooperation agreements (covering also the obligations to arrange the student internships) with the list of organizations active in the fields covered by the MA programme, in particular: Cooperation Framework Agreement between Agency for Land Relations and Cadaster of Republic of Moldova and Technical University of Moldova dated September 14, 2010 (indefinite term); Cooperation Framework Agreement between Agency for Land Relations and Cadaster of Republic of Moldova and Technical University of Moldova of 2014 (indefinite term); Partnership Framework Convention between Technical University of Moldova and Center for Protection of Property Rights dated September 01, 2011 (indefinite term); Partnership Framework Convention between Technical University of Moldova and Office of lawyer Alla Climova dated October 20, 2010 (indefinite term); Partnership Framework Convention between Technical University of Moldova and Office of lawyer Alexandru Savva dated October 21, 2013 (indefinite term); Partnership Framework Convention between Technical University of Moldova and Notary Public Palii Olga (30, Armeneasca St.) dated April 04, 2014 (indefinite term).</p>	
<p>2.6. REQUIREMENT: Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed at TUM in accordance with the existing requirements. According to the SER and meeting with the management the assessment of academic results is carried out in accordance with TUM Regulation on organization of</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p><u>learning activity of students dated December 05, 2011.</u> Assessment methodology seems to be consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development. During the interview the students informed that the teaching staff support their progress on regular basis. The interim and final assessment of students activity include the feedback on study results. However, it is recommended to establish the system of monitoring of the residual knowledge of students (that should be conducted in some period after the completion of the study discipline). In order to avoid possible overassessment of students' progress.</p>	
<p>2.7. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Referring to the Educational legislation on the Republic of Moldova (in particular, with the Education Code of the Republic of Moldova) there are legislative requirements regarding the prior learning recognition. TUM's commented that such mechanisms allow the TUM to form groups at the master's level composed of graduates of the bachelor's degree or master's degree from other universities in the country and abroad. In accordance with p. 48 of the Regulation on the organization of Master degree studies, the students with at least 2 years proven practical experience in the given field will be assigned with the necessary number of credits based on the assessment of competences and recognition of the practical experience by the specialized department/departments. Therefore there is a legal basis for the recognition of the work experience. However the expert team was informed during the site visit that the procedure of the implementation of this provision requires further clarification. Currently there is no such a system in place that recognizes work experiences.</p> <p><u>Recommendation:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - to establish the system of recognition of work experiences based on the legislative provision mentioned above. 	
<p>2.8. REQUIREMENT: Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are undertaken.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is conducted and improvement measures are undertaken. The results of students study progress are analyzed several times during the academic year at different levels. First of all, the achievement of learning outcomes is discussed at the meeting of the department, then – at the meetings of the Faculty Council and Administrative Council of TUM. Based on the analysis of students results the department develops and submits to the Faculty Council the proposed measures aimed at the improvement of the students' progress.</p>	
<p>2.9. REQUIREMENT: Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

high.
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information presented in SER and obtained during the site visit the students of the master’s degree program <i>Property Law</i> are involved in the research activity within the department by developing scientific articles, verification papers and by participations in conferences, roundtables, and preparation of master’s degree projects. The teaching staff of the programme encourages the participation of students in the scientific events. However, in practice the term “research” is often referring to analyses without solid academic base. The expert team witnessed necessity of the improvement of students’ supervision during the activities. The expert team still suggests having stronger base in research methods within the curriculum (what are different quantitative and qualitative methods, advantages and disadvantages of applying various approaches, etc.).</p> <p>During the site visit, the discussion with teachers and students revealed that they see major difference between bachelor and master studies in terms of the former being more <i>theoretical</i> and the latter more <i>practice-oriented</i>. The overall impression of this discussion indicates that this particular master programme is seen rather none-research-based study programme. The evaluation team understands that the country urgently needs specialists in the field but a more balanced and theory-based teaching space would give a chance for more competitive graduates. The research cannot be underestimated and the practice overvalued as the latter would cause a situation whereby the development of property law in Moldova would be in stagnation.</p> <p>Therefore it is recommended to strengthen the scientific requirements to the master theses preparation and to enhance the monitoring of their fulfilment.</p> <p><u>Recommendation:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - to enhance the students involvement in research activity both at national and international levels.

3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with ‘X’		X	
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report; • Annexes of SER; • Internal regulations and normative acts of the schools; 			

Template for Assessment Report

- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates and employers.

General comments:

The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff of the programme complies with the requirements established by legislation. Currently more than 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. Less than 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme has PhD degree or equal. Then again the teaching staff is well balanced by age. Half of the teaching staff is relatively young and there is a clear sign of existing academic continuity.

The workload is rather well-balanced according to the ratio between students and teachers (2:1) due to a rather small group of students. Still the student representatives expressed their concern regarding insufficient number of teaching staff/ lawyers. The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and they tend to improve their teaching methods constantly. Most of the members of teaching staff have solid experience both in teaching and in practice in the respective fields. Continuous training for teaching staff is available at TUM. The university provides also financial support for preparing textbooks and this has been actively used by the faculty members. Currently there is no evidence of foreign teaching staff to be involved nor do the members of full-time teaching staff of TUM develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions. Even though there is no clear evidence of a coherent research plan, the scientific activities of individual faculty members are considerable at least at the national level.

Commendations:

- Teaching staff is balanced by age. Half of the teaching staff is relatively young and there is a sign of academic continuity;
- The workload is well-balanced according to the ratio between teachers and students (0.5);
- The staff members are motivated to foster their own professional development.

Recommendations:

- The university should recognise the need to include local and foreign academic staff and practitioners to the teaching process;
- It is suggested to prioritise international research in order to establish a better ground for the master programme to be more competitive in the region.

Template for Assessment Report

3.1. REQUIREMENT: The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff of the programme does not comply with the requirements established by legislation. There are (Appendix 5 of the SER) 6 full time members of teaching staff – 4 PhD-s and 2 Masters. The doctoral qualifications of the teaching staff have been obtained in different fields that would potentially support the discipline “Property Law” such as in economics and in civil engineering. There are two part time faculty members, one of them a judge with solid practical experience. Currently more than 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. Less than 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme has PhD degree or equal.</p> <p><u>Recommendation:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To increase the number of full time teaching staff – Ph.D. or Dr.Habil. holders. The university should recognise the need to include local and foreign academic staff and practitioners to the teaching process. 	
3.2. REQUIREMENT: Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The SER provides enough evidence (p 22 and Appendix No. 5) that the teaching staff is balanced by age. Half of the teaching staff is relatively young (between ages 28-40) and there is a clear sign of existing academic continuity. 50% (4 persons) of the staff is between the age 28-40; 25% (2 persons) between the age 51-60 and 25% (2 persons) between the ages 61-65.</p>	
3.3. REQUIREMENT: The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at MA level.	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The workload is well-balanced according to the ratio between teachers and students (1:2) due to a rather small group of students. The</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p>qualification of teaching staff is not only screened by the legal requirements (Appendix No 5) but also regularly reviewed from the angle of graduates' surveys (Appendix No 14). Therewith, based on the aforementioned, the recommendations to the faculty members to improve their professional skills have been made by the faculty management periodically. The students of the programme would benefit from guest lecturing and therefore it is suggested to invite visiting faculty, guest lecturers (also from abroad) for delivering various specific law courses. This would also enrich the study environment, entail a variety of teaching methods and bring along innovativeness to the programme.</p> <p>Recommendation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To increase the number of full time teaching staff. The university should recognise the need to include local and foreign academic staff and practitioners to the teaching process. 	
<p>3.4. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching methods.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and they tend to improve their teaching methods constantly. Most of the members of teaching staff have solid experience both in teaching and in practice in the respective fields. In general, members of the faculty are motivated to improve their teaching methods. Didactic skills are mentioned as one of the priorities both by the SER and by stakeholders. There is continuous practice of developing individual development plans and strategies within the given academic unit according to which the teaching competence and teaching methods can be assessed regularly.</p>	
<p>3.5. REQUIREMENT: The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The basic principles of the staff development system are in place. Continuous training for teaching staff is available at TUM. During the evaluation it became apparent that the staff members are motivated to foster their own professional development. One of the permanent staff members has been going through 40 professional development seminars and there is enough evidence that other colleagues have been regularly taking part of self-developing seminars. The university provides also financial support for preparing textbooks and this has been actively used by the faculty members. Also psycho-pedagogical training is available for the staff. The visiting team encourages to broaden the scope of trainings even more while including possibilities to enhance the skills related to application of ICT.</p>	
<p>3.6. REQUIREMENT: Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p>	

Template for Assessment Report

Despite the fact that there is a solid record of visiting teachers and practitioners from Moldova, there is no evidence of foreign teaching staff to be involved. Also TUM admits on p. 24 of the SER “So far, there have not been examples of involvement of foreign teachers in the teaching process within the Master’s Degree Program Property Law.”

The meeting with the alumni and employers clearly indicates that the graduates as well as the practitioners expect more contacts with the university to share their experiences and make proposal for improving the programme.

Recommendation:

- To increase the number of full time teaching staff. The university should recognise the need to include local and foreign academic staff and practitioners to the teaching process.

3.7. REQUIREMENT: The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.

Comments:

Currently the members of full-time teaching staff of TUM do not develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions nor participate actively in international networks. Rather few teachers occasionally visit some foreign institutions. These are rather random situations and these visits do not take place due to special conditions of TUM, but mostly based on personal contacts. The international research has not been a priority for the teaching staff. This fact was visible during the site visit based on the students’ reflections on the evaluation team’s questions, especially when asking about international dimensions of the field, including European case law. The overall assessment of the teaching staff of being involved in international research activities cannot be assessed positively. The examples of self-improvement of staff members abroad are rather out-dated (years 2000 and 2008) and, as a rule, not conducted at the scale of high-level international research projects. Few contacts with Romanian universities (teaching, summer school) are not genuine indications of widespread international dimension of research and self-development.

Recommendations:

- to find more resources for staff development (including training abroad, time for research and publishing, etc.).

3.8. REQUIREMENT: Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.

Comments:

Even though there is no clear evidence of a coherent research plan, the scientific activities of individual faculty members are considerable

Template for Assessment Report

(Appendix No 30) at least at the national level. The teaching staff also include motivated students to take part in scientific events (Appendix No 31) (See also 3.7. above) and the students appreciate them being part of an academic community. Unfortunately no major international research project is conducted in the given field (though the university itself is part of some international research projects, but in other fields).

3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

Comments:

The attestation of the teaching staff is organised once in every 5 years by the Contest Commission (p. 21 of the SER). The attestation process relates to the requirements of academic position and is not directly focusing on periodical research excellence in the faculty in general. Although SER (p. 24) refers to several international and national projects, the university representatives could not provide clear evidence of faculty members' commitment to international research during the site visit. Therefore it is not possible to state that research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

Recommendations:

- It is suggested to prioritise international research in order to establish a better ground for the master programme to be more competitive in the region.
- to foster the culture to look for "additional funding" among the staff.

4. STUDENTS	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		
Collected evidence: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Self-evaluation report; - Annexes of SER; - Additional documents received during the site visit; - Tests (civil law, computer and foreign language) on acceptance on study; - Antiplagiarism system; - Internal regulations; - Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers. 			

Template for Assessment Report

General comments:

The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned and effective. The university applies all the normative acts regarding the internal and external mobility and the students have possibility to move from one university to another university. Even while considering the fact that currently law students don't participate in any internal and external mobility activities, they know about these possibilities. The master students take actively part in the decision-making process through the TUM Student Senate, Student Council of Faculty, and Quality Management Committee within Faculty. The Property Law Department keeps a manual Register and a computerized Register of students/ graduates containing data about the employment of current master students of Property Law Department and professional evolution and development thereof while being the alumni. According to SER from the total number of 45 graduates over the period 2010 – 2015, 36 (80 %) are employed in accordance with the qualification obtained.

Commendations:

- regulatory documents are made available to the students/applicants in the form of a booklet, as well as in electronic form on the TUM website;
- Good relations with the State Enterprise "Cadastru" which provides major opportunities for employment;
- Good employment rate in respective fields.

Recommendations:

- to encourage international student exchange and short studies abroad;
- to reduce the level of drop-out.

<p>4.1. REQUIREMENT: The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.</p>	
---	--

Comments:

The admission of students is conducted by the Admission Commission within TUM on the basis of admission methodology, approved by Government Decision No.1455 dated December 24, 2007 (<http://lex.justice.md/viewdoc.php?action=view&view=doc&id=326588&lang=2>), Regulation of organizing and conducting the admission process to higher education institutions, approved by the Ministry of Education of Republic of Moldova and annual admission plan. The candidates for the master's degree studies Property Law may be the holders of license

Template for Assessment Report

<p>degree or master's degree diplomas in the same field or related field. The applicants which don't have law or related field degree must pass a special program of at least 30 credits at the basic and specialized subjects. The applicants are passing, in written form, a complex test at field subject and are passing the verification tests of language skills at one of the foreign languages and computer skills.</p> <p>The registration for contract-based places with payment of tuition fees is made from candidates for entrance who are under the last candidate admitted to budget financed places, but who have passed the contest tests (in descending order of average grades for contest) at the written request of the applicant. Thus, the admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts. Regulatory documents are made available to the students/applicants in the form of a booklet, as well as in electronic form on the TUM website.</p>	
<p>4.2. REQUIREMENT: The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> Within TUM the University Center for Information and Guidance in Career is operating through providing informational assistance regarding the professional orientation of young people, through organizing practical trainings for students and through employing the university graduates. All teachers have also completed psychological pedagogy courses offering them additional skills in the process of consultation of students. That is why the teachers are as well available for consulting study, career and psychological issues. Students' hostels have also employed psychologists who contribute in advising, counselling and guiding students.</p>	
<p>4.3. REQUIREMENT: Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The University applies all the normative acts regarding the internal and external mobility and the students have possibility to move from one university to another university. The master students and doctoral students participated in international mobility programs within Technical University of Istanbul (Turkey); Taurida University in Simferopol (Ukraine); Technical University of Varna (Bulgaria) and "Ovidius" University of Constanta (Romania). Also, the University has the external mobility possibilities, provided several European projects (ERASMUS +, FP 7, TEMPUS, etc.). Although there are no impediments in this regard, so far within the master's degree of Property Law programme haven't used the opportunity to participate in mobility programmes. Even while considering the fact that currently students don't participate in any internal and external mobility activities, they know about these possibilities and the university provides these opportunities.</p>	
<p>4.4. REQUIREMENT: Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in student mobility is stable or growing.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p><u>Comments:</u> Master's students at the level of the university are active participants in international mobility programmes. In the academic year 2013-2014, 19 master and doctoral students participated in international mobility programmes. However, according to the information provided by the stakeholders (teachers, students, etc.) no person from the property law programme has participated in any international mobility programmes. Moreover, several alumni representatives expressed their willingness to participate but admitted that they didn't have possibility even after being actively informed about the international programmes. It would be recommended for the university to find more opportunities for promoting international mobility programmes to guarantee involvement of students from the property law specialty with the purpose to enrich their study experience.</p> <p>Recommendation: - to encourage also the students from the Law specialty to apply for the mobility programmes.</p>	
<p>4.5. REQUIREMENT: Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education institution.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The master students take part in the decision-making process through the TUM Student Senate, Student Council of Faculty, and Quality Management Committee within Faculty (which consists of one representative from each department and 2 students from the faculty). Students have also a representative in the senate of the university. The representatives of the students are elected at student meetings for a term of one year.</p> <p>The university and the faculty give enough possibility for the students to participate at all levels of decision making processes. Unfortunately, the students don't know who exactly represents them in these bodies. It is very important that the ones not personally participating in the decision making processes still know about their representatives, the activities of these bodies and have periodical communication with them. It is recommended for the school and for the students themselves to promote the possibilities to be involved and to follow decision making processes within the school.</p>	
<p>4.6. REQUIREMENT: A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> TUM has a basic system for prevention of academic fraud that is applied only in case of suspicion. There are no obligations that all theses or any</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

other written works have to pass through the system - it remains up to the academic staff to decide. One weakness of the system is that it doesn't compare theses with other books or journals and also doesn't check international sources written in other languages (English, French, etc.). Meanwhile, even the system is applied rarely and does not screen maximum amount of sources, it has reduced the academic fraud while having a very strong psychological effect on the students who all know about the system and who are "positively afraid of it".

It would be useful for the university to develop and extend the antiplagiarism system for all levels and cases. For the future development it would be even more useful if the system could be extended so that variety of the sources to compare with would be higher (books, journals etc.). It would be also a positive development if the school would develop clear regulation of standards and sanction system available both for academic staff and the students.

4.7. REQUIREMENT: Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates' employment and is monitoring the evolution of graduates' career.

Comments:

The Property Law Department keeps a manual Register and a computerized Register of students/ graduates containing data about the employment of current master students of Property Law Department and professional evolution and development thereof while being the alumni. The Department has enough information about their graduates, even when graduates are abroad. At least once per year the university updates the Register. The expert team witnessed very close communication with their alumni. This issue confirmed not only by the academic staff, but also by the alumni.

4.8. REQUIREMENT: The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the programme.

Comments:

The competitiveness of the graduates of the study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification. According to SER from the total number of 45 graduates over the period 2010 – 2015, 36 (80 %) are employed in accordance with the qualification obtained. 22 % of them are employed at the State Enterprise "Cadastru". The rate of unemployment is about 9 % and about 11 % of the graduates work on another speciality. Considering the general situation of the Republic of Moldova on these issues TUM shows relatively good result. Each graduate of the Master's Degree Program Property Law is issued and awarded with the diploma of master in law prepared in two languages: Romanian and English, and the Diploma Supplement in two languages.

Template for Assessment Report

<p>4.9. REQUIREMENT: There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The entire process of study is monitored by special services of TUM Rector’s Office, Dean’s Office of FCGC and administration of Property Law Department. Also, the Faculty has an electronic system which keeps all the information regarding students’ progress. The results of passing exams are analysed at the meetings of Property Law Department where the reports on the success are presented. If possible, the meeting will also set the terms and procedures for repeated examination of the students who failed in their previous attempts and the guideline for general improvement of the situation.</p> <p>Regarding the drop-out rate, the department is working hard to reduce it: discussions with students who failed the exams; additional consultations; establishing the schedule of educational process depending on the work program of the master students, etc. Even after all these measures are taken, the drop-out rate is still rather high, being more than 25 %. During last years a positive trend has been witnessed - in 2013 there were 6 dropped-out students, in 2014 no one dropped out. University is encouraged constantly to follow the strategy and measures taken.</p>	

5. RESOURCES	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		
<p>Collected evidence:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report; • Annexes of SER; • Site visit tour to the library and facilities, including study rooms; • Interviews with management, teaching staff and students. 			

Template for Assessment Report

General comments:

In general the University's resources available for the MA Programme implementation are sufficient and conform to the main requirements. The number of students enrolled to the programme has been stable in recent years and there is a concrete strategy to increase the number of entrants. The classrooms are equipped sufficiently; the equipment is renewed periodically. Reasonable ICT devices are available for faculty members and students. However, there is still room for the improvement, in particular, in part of library's equipment and further development of ICT solutions.

Commendations:

- Financial resources of TUM are sufficient. The chart presented in SER (page 31) clearly shows the sustainable character of the budget planning;
- Positive trend is widespread usage of Moodle platform providing the students information regarding the courses online.

Recommendations:

- The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific literature in English;
- The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable;
- The university should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in national databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources;
- The main computer room would need improvement as another computer room sponsored by a TEMPUS project looks modern and meets the contemporary standards.

5.1. REQUIREMENT: The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.

Comments:

The financial resources of TUM are sufficient. The chart presented in SER (page 31) clearly shows the sustainable character of the budget planning.

Template for Assessment Report

<p>5.2. REQUIREMENT: Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The number of students enrolled to the programme has been stable in recent years (within the last three years accordingly 20, 15 and 16 students) and there is a concrete strategy to increase the number of entrants (entrant numbers from 2012-2014 are respectively 20, 15, 16). The number of graduates from last three years (2012-2014) is accordingly 10, 10, 16; however, the number of dropouts (10 students between 2012-2014) is too high in proportion to enrolled and graduated students (See SER, p No. 30). The stability of interested candidates is a basis for adequate financial support for the programme, including the equipment, space, salaries and services needed for the modern study environment.</p>	
<p>5.3. REQUIREMENT: Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> The classrooms are equipped sufficiently; the equipment is renewed periodically. There is sufficient space for conducting modern teaching. The computing centres and computer classes are available for students for independent work. The rooms are equipped with computers and projectors.</p>	
<p>5.4. REQUIREMENT: Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by up-to-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> There is sufficient number of computers; ICT devices are available for faculty members and students. The main computer room would need improvement as another computer room sponsored by a TEMPUS project looks modern and meets the contemporary standards. The staff and the students are motivated to use ICT techniques, only their knowledge regarding electronic databases should be increased. The positive trend is widespread using of <i>Moodle</i> platform providing the students information regarding the courses online.</p>	
<p>5.5. REQUIREMENT: The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.</p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u> 12 hostels are available for students and the medical services are accessible. The student hostels are regularly visited by sanitary and epidemiological control.</p>	

5.6. REQUIREMENT: A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.	
---	--

Comments:

Although the library statistics by SER shows good numbers, there are several serious discrepancies and the evaluation showed that there is no foreign literature in the field. The books available are rather out-dated. According to the librarian, last year purchase of the books contained 1636 new volumes that can be related to the legal studies (general subjects and law). However, the visit to the library proved that the literature in the field is inadequate and needs fundamental strategic re-planning. TUM has made visible efforts to modernise the library - currently, there is the website of TUM library (library.utm.md) containing the following information: electronic library, periodicals, book purchases, and databases. Similarly, under the project REM (Electronic Resources for Moldova), in which TUM library takes part, there is provided online access to databases like EBSCO, Cambridge Journals Online, IOPscience, OECD-iLibrary, Royal Society Journals Collection, BioOne. However, the reality shows that the students are not aware of international databases and therefore not motivated to use the few available. Also the librarians need training to give advice to the students on how to access electronic academic materials.

Recommendations:

- The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific literature in English;
- The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable;
- The university should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in national databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources.