



## Template for Assessment Report

### Accreditation of Study Programmes Assessment Report

**Institution:** The State University of Moldova

**Study programme:** Professional Master Programme in Business Law

**Assessment committee:**

Urmas Volens (chair), Head of SORAINEN Real Estate & Construction Team, Estonia

Mihai Floroiu, Professor, “Dunarea de Jos” University of Galati, Romania

Ingeborg Mottl, Associate professor, University of Salzburg, Austria

Rene Värk, Associate professor, Estonian National Defence College; University of Tartu, Estonia

Joosep Raudsepp, Student, Tallinn University, Estonia

**Coordinator:** Hillar Bauman

**Dates of the assessment visit:** 20.05.2015

**Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA:** 10.07.2015

**Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation:** No comments for this report.

**Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 5 votes in favour and 0 votes against.**

**Date:** 07.09.2015

**Template for Assessment Report**

**I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):**

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development	<b>X</b>		
Teaching and learning		<b>X</b>	
Teaching staff		<b>X</b>	
Students		<b>X</b>	
Resources		<b>X</b>	

**General Introduction:**

The State University of Moldova (hereinafter referred to as SUM) is a state higher education institution established in 1946 with a mission of educating qualified specialists able to adapt to the changing social and economic conditions, as well as conducting fundamental and applied scientific research and offering various continuous education training programmes. Since 2001, SUM holds the status of an autonomous National University granted by the Government of Moldova and constitutes a unitary, integral and indivisible academic, educational, scientific and cultural center.

As the largest University in Moldova, SUM is providing both full and part-time studies on a wide range of specialties at the Bachelor's level (1<sup>st</sup> cycle) and the Doctoral level (3<sup>rd</sup> cycle), and on 125 Master of Research and Professional Master study programmes (2<sup>nd</sup> cycle) with the corresponding duration of 2 and 1.5 years.

## Template for Assessment Report

The Law Faculty of SUM was founded in 1959 and continues to be the leading provider of specialists in law in Moldova. The Faculty consists of nine departments: Theory and History of Law, Constitutional Law and Administrative Law, International Law and Law of Foreign Economic Relations, Civil Procedure Law, Civil Law, Business Law, Criminal Law and Criminology, Labour Law and Criminal Procedure and Forensics, and is governed by the Council of the Faculty elected for a term of five years. In academic year 2014/15, SUM conducts studies on 12 Professional Master programmes in the field of law: “Business Law”, “Criminal Law”, “Criminal Procedure Law and Forensics”, Civil Law”, “Civil Judicial Procedures”, “National and European Enforcement Law”, “Labour Law”, “International Law”, “Human Rights”, “Informational Law”, “Customs Law” and “Public Law”.

The Professional Master programme “Business Law”, which is being evaluated, is a programme with the duration of 1.5 years of studies, three semesters and 90 credits. The study programme was initiated in year 2008 by the Department of Business Law, who is also responsible for the monitoring and development of the curriculum.

### **Comments:**

The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. The title of the programme is consistent with its content. The department regularly plans the development of the study programme. The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme presented in the SER are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The content and the learning outcomes of the programme are distinguishable from those of the bachelor’s study programme. The main objective of the master programme is to supplement the theory acquired by the students during the first cycle of studies with judiciary cases and practical aspects provide a more in-depth and focused object of study. The master’s programme has a logical structure.

Although the development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends of the labour market, there is some room for improvement regarding the more internationally comparative and interdisciplinary focus of the study disciplines. Also, there is a certain lack of systematic approach in collecting and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders. The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

The Faculty and Department regularly conduct surveys to evaluate learning process and outcomes. However, the Department should have a clearer procedure to engage the students, alumni and employers in the development process. The teaching staff is enthusiastic and prefer to use active teaching methods. As a good starting point for independent learning, some courses have a textbook written by the instructor. The teaching staff is well aware of the need to keep up with the changes in legal regulations and recent court practice. Still, in order to provide a wider, comparative perspective, it is essential to include non-Moldovan, non-Romanian and non-Russian literature in the syllabi.

## Template for Assessment Report

The University has agreements or good cooperation with many public and private institutions, where the students can perform their internship. Students in general expressed satisfaction with organisation of internship. In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of business law.

It remains unclear how exactly the assessment methods are chosen and matched to learning outcomes and whether the students receive personal feedback regarding their performance at different assessments in order to support student development. The necessary regulation appears to be in place for the recognition of prior learning, but there is no actual experience. The Department should consider the possibility of increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It provides more choices to students, but also increases the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility and therefore again makes academic mobility more attractive.

Although the students are already being encouraged to participate in scientific conferences and publish articles, the Department should find more ways to involve master students in current or future research projects (also in development activities).

At the moment, the number and qualification of full-time teaching staff does not fully comply with legal requirements as not all of them hold a PhD degree and only a few have had some international experience. However, the fact that some members of the teaching staff are also involved in practical legal activities related to the disciplines taught can be considered positive. Still, in order to meet the requirements established by legislation, all members of the academic staff involved in the study programme should as soon as possible finalize their PhD studies. The members of the teaching staff have adequate teaching competence - the fact that most of them are involved also in practicing legal activities in field similar to disciplines taught is a positive as they can combine the practical experience with their teaching activities.

At the Faculty management level, both academic staff and the students should be provided with opportunities of academic mobility and international cooperation and also encouraged to use the existing possibilities (of which an important part is the improvement of English language proficiency). At the moment, there are no visiting staff involved in the teaching process, the mobility options of the students on the Business Law study programme are very limited and the academic mobility is virtually non-existent. In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.

To further support the students, MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists and also provide some sort of psychological counselling services for the students. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.

## Template for Assessment Report

The committee welcomes the use of modern software by MSU in order to discover plagiarism, yet this approach is only one aspect of plagiarism detection. Therefore, the committee urges the Faculty to adapt a unified and more systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and actively seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g. course for academic writing, master's seminars etc).

Although the graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements, it would be in the Faculty's best interests that the causes for dropping out would also be formally collected and analysed.

The budget planning in general is sustainable. However, the Faculty seems underfinanced, which according to the understanding of the committee is the reason for many shortcomings, e.g. the general salary level of the academic staff, the state of library and the general infrastructure of the Faculty, the low level of academic mobility etc. The trend of student numbers is decreasing. It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.

As the Faculty in general was at least partially under renovation, it was not possible for the committee to assess the conformity to the requirements of the teaching and learning environment as a whole. ICT devices are available for both Faculty members and students. The computer rooms look modern and meet the basic contemporary standards. The staff and the students are relatively motivated to use ICT techniques. The positive trend is the using of *Moodle* platform providing the students with information regarding the courses online. Still, the existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

There is almost no foreign literature in the field of law and the books available are rather outdated. The University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German. It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.

### Commendations:

- The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.
- Good employment rate of the graduates;

### Template for Assessment Report

- Teaching staff is balanced by age and there is a sign of academic continuity;
- Teaching staff finds time to publish teaching materials for their courses;
- Internship is well organised and the University helps the students with a place of internship due to specific agreements or good cooperation with many employers;
- The ratio between master students and supervisors is favourable and due to this, the workload of academic staff is well-balanced.
- Budget planning has sustainable character;
- The usage of Moodle platform providing the students information regarding the courses online;
- Teaching staff is well experienced;
- Students' satisfaction with the study programme is high.

### Recommendations:

- In the composition of the curriculum, it is recommended to pay more attention to the international rules of trade, e.g. disciplines dealing with International Economic Law e.g. WTO rules, EU economic relations with non-member countries, International Arbitration etc.
- **It is highly recommended to increase the cooperation between the master of law programmes in MSU regarding both the content and conduct of studies.** For example, the subjects relating to international commercial/business law currently taught on the “International Law” study programme should also be included in the “Business Law” curriculum.
- In order to better meet the needs of the employers, it would be advisable to introduce more disciplines developing the interdisciplinary skills and transferable competences into the curriculum, e.g. management, teamwork and programme coordination. Also, a need was voiced for a more global and internationally comparative approach regarding certain disciplines, e.g. comparative taxation law, banking and financial system.
- It is advisable to pay more attention to developing the students’ English language skills (e.g., include in the curriculum more foreign language materials) and also offer the students some special course(s) on the methodology of legal research.
- It is recommended that all members of the academic staff involved in the study programme finalize their PhD studies as soon as possible.
- It is advisable to implement a clear system of gathering and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders.
- Syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire, as the first step, some well-known up-to-date textbooks covering the study programme related European or international regulations in English, French and German.
- When replenishing the library, attention should be paid to the modern sources of information, especially investing in international academic databases and training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. At the

## Template for Assessment Report

University, access should be enabled to legal literature databases (e.g. WestLaw, LexisNexis, HeinOnline, BeckOnline etc). In the study processes, the use of such databases should be promoted, as there are numerous journals which are openly accessible and provide high quality articles.

- It is recommended to consider the possibility to increase the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It would provide more choices to students, but also increase the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility, and therefore again make academic mobility more attractive to the students.
- In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of business law.
- It would be advisable to provide students with personal feedback regarding their performance in order to support student development.
- Master students should be involved in broader research and development activities.
- from foreign institutions;
- At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.
- It is recommended to increase the international experience for teaching staff, also outside Romania. In order to achieve that, it is advisable to promote academic mobility among the teaching staff and actively seek opportunities to participate in international cooperation.
- Compared to internationally acceptable standards, the participation in the international research projects and other international scientific activity needs to be much more active. In order to achieve that, more resources should be found and allocated to research activities. **It is highly recommended to apply for the EU funding already available to Moldova, e.g the Erasmus + programme.**
- It is recommended to encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).
- In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.
- MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists and also provide some sort of psychological counselling services for the students. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.
- It is recommended to adapt unified and systematic approach towards detecting plagiarism and seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, seminars etc).
- The University should seek ways how to formally strengthen their ties with graduates (alumni club, events for graduates, satisfaction surveys for alumni etc).
- It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.

### Template for Assessment Report

- It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.
- The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

### Recommendation to the Ministry of Education

- According to the Framework Plan for higher education (Order of the Ministry of Education no 455 of 2011 § 62) for the master studies, a course shall have 5/10/15 credits and subsequently one semester shall plan 6-2 courses/modules. This means that all courses on master's level must have the same amount of ECTS (5 ECTS) with the same number of contact hours and hours for individual work. Some courses also are "combined courses" and they offer 10 ECTS. The assessment committee recommends considering changing this rule in order to enable the universities offering master's level programmes some additional flexibility and to support the academic mobility.

### II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		
<b>Collected evidence:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Self-evaluation report (SER);</li> <li>• Annexes of SER;</li> <li>• Internal regulations;</li> <li>• Additional documents received during the site visit;</li> <li>• Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.</li> </ul>			
<b>General comments:</b>  Based on available documents and on the discussions during the assessment visit the assessment committee is convinced that the professional master programme in Business Law substantially conforms to requirements.  The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. Considering the majority of the study disciplines within the programme as well as the learning outcomes of the curriculum the title of a study programme is consistent with its			



## Template for Assessment Report

content.

The objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme are in correspondence with the European Qualifications Framework. The courses and study disciplines taught within the master's programme are distinguishable from those offered on the bachelor's study programme. The main objective of the master programme is to supplement the theory acquired by the students during the first cycle of studies with judiciary cases and practical aspects provide a more in-depth and focused object of study. The study disciplines are presented in a logical succession.

Although the development of the study programme takes into consideration the trends of the labour market, there is some room for improvement regarding the more internationally comparative and interdisciplinary focus of the study disciplines. Also, there is a certain lack of systematic approach in collecting and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders.

The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

### Commendations:

- Development structure ensures sustainability and continuous development.
- The academic staff has a strong sense of mission and is well aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.
- Graduates acquire skills necessary to succeed in the labour market

### Recommendations:

- In the composition of the curriculum, it is recommended to pay more attention to the international rules of trade, e.g. disciplines dealing with International Economic Law e.g. WTO rules, EU economic relations with non-member countries, International Arbitration etc.
- **It is highly recommended to increase the cooperation between the master of law programmes in MSU regarding both the content and conduct of studies.** For example, the subjects relating to international commercial/business law currently taught on the "International Law" study programme should also be included in the "Business Law" curriculum.
- In order to better meet the needs of the employers, it would be advisable to introduce more disciplines developing the interdisciplinary skills and transferable competences into the curriculum, e.g. management, teamwork and programme coordination. Also, a need was voiced for a more global and internationally comparative approach regarding certain disciplines, e.g. comparative taxation law, banking and financial system.
- It is advisable to implement a clear system of gathering and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders.

## Template for Assessment Report

- It is recommended to consider the possibility to increase the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It would provide more choices to students, but also increase the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility, and therefore again make academic mobility more attractive to the students.
- It is advisable to pay more attention to developing the students' English language skills (e.g, include in the curriculum more foreign language materials) and also offer the students some special course(s) on the methodology of legal research.

**1.1. REQUIREMENT: A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development period.**

### Comments:

According to the information obtained during the assessment visit, the new strategic plan of SUM for years 2015 – 2020 shall be established after the election of the new Rector which takes place in October, 2015. In terms of development, the Rector informed the committee that the priority issues for SUM are quality assurance, scientific research and also, modernizing the infrastructure of the University.

Concerning the level of the law programmes, the management found it important to have more impact on local level and create a competitive framework for new talents. Fighting counterfeit and corruption was underlined as a key issue regarding the development of the law programmes.

According to the management (the Rector and Vice-Rector), in the interests of more profound studies, the master programs in law should be consolidated, as there is currently a surplus of the programmes. The committee was informed that starting from June 1<sup>st</sup> 2015, there shall only be 5 law departments at SUM.

There is a Strategic Development Plan in place for the Faculty of Law for years 2012 – 2017 (see annex 7). According to SER, the master programme "Business Law" is one of the priorities of the Strategic Development Plan of the Business Law Department for the years 2010 – 2015 that is in line with the aforementioned strategic plan of the Faculty.

The master's programme under question was developed by the Department of Business Law who is also responsible for the monitoring and continuous improvement of the programme. The programme is continuously monitored and regularly evaluated by the quality management structures: SUM Senate, SUM Quality Council, Committee for Quality Assurance of the Faculty of Law and the Business Law Department. Monitoring and evaluation is coordinated by the section "Quality Management: curriculum development and evaluation" (p 11 SER).

## Template for Assessment Report

<b>1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.</b>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The curriculum of the professional master programme "Business Law" with 90 credits was developed by the "Business Law" department in 2008, approved by the Council of the Faculty and by SUM Senate and authorized by Order No. 385 of 30.05.2008 of the Ministry of Education (Annex A.10).</p> <p>The Order no. 455 of the Ministry of Education issued on June 3, 2011, establishes requirements for the study plans at Master's level. It is the requirement for the professional Master's programmes (90 credits) to be structured in the following way: Master thesis (30 ECTS), Internship (10 ECTS), Fundamental disciplines (15-25 ECTS), and Specialized disciplines (25-35 ECTS) among which there should be up to 20% alternative disciplines.</p> <p>The structure of the Master's programme "Business Law" is as follows: Master thesis (30 ECTS), Fundamental disciplines (15 ECTS), Specialized disciplines (35 ECTS) including two optional/alternative disciplines (10 ECTS), Internship (10 ECTS). and Disciplines to free choice (15 ECTS)</p> <p>The Assessment committee finds that the Business Law master's programme substantially functions in accordance with the normative acts in force. The curriculum also respects the impact of the Bologna Higher Education System and is based on the ECTS transfer system.</p>	
<b>1.3. REQUIREMENT: The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.</b>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information presented in the SER and the curriculum and considering the majority of the subjects/ study disciplines within the programme as well as the learning outcomes of the curriculum the title of the study programme "Business Law" is consistent with its content.</p> <p>The study disciplines included in the programme all deal with legal norms that directly or indirectly regulate the area of business activity – for example, the rules governing the legal status of sole proprietors and the legal regime of entrepreneurial activity.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> In the composition of the curriculum more attention to the international rules of trade, e.g. WTO rules, EU rules related to relations with third countries etc. would enable the graduates to also participate in the international business activities.</li> <li>• <b>It is highly recommended to increase the cooperation between the master of law programmes in MSU regarding both the content and conduct of studies.</b> For example, the subjects relating to international commercial/business law currently taught on the</li> </ul>	

## Template for Assessment Report

<p>“International Law” study programme should also be included in the “Business Law” curriculum.</p>	
<p><b>1.4.REQUIREMENT: The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship support the achievement of the objectives of this study programme.</p> <p>The available study plan and the detailed curriculum support the objectives of the study programme. Contact hours with academic teaching staff and individual work are integrated and compulsory and mandatory subjects are offered.</p> <p>The internship is organized in a professional manner and students gain support from the University as well as from the Department of Business Law. The internship is conducted according to the Framework Regulations on practical training in higher education and based on curriculum of the internship (Annex B.1.3.) and an internship portfolio (Annex B.1.4.). According to the alumni, although some of the places are designated, most of the students find the internship places for themselves.</p>	
<p><b>1.5.REQUIREMENT: The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the SER the objectives and learning outcomes of the programme take in consideration the regulations of the Ministry of Education and the requirements of the Bologna Process (ECTS credit-transfer-system). The objectives of the curriculum (content and learning outcomes) are in accordance with the requirements of the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The learning outcomes are comparable with other programmes of HEIs in Moldova.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> <p><b>Recommendation to the Ministry of Education:</b> The system of distributing the amount of ECTS is only partially internationally comparable because according to the Framework Plan for higher education (Order of the Ministry of Education no 455 of 2011 § 62) for the master studies, a course shall have 5/10/15 credits and subsequently one semester shall plan 6-2 courses/modules. This means that all courses on master’s level must have the same amount of ECTS (5 ECTS) with the same number of contact hours and hours for individual work. Some courses also are “combined courses” and they offer 10 ECTS. The assessment committee recommends considering changing this rule in order to enable the universities offering Masters level programs some additional flexibility and to</p> </li> </ul>	

## Template for Assessment Report

support the academic mobility.	
<b>1.6. REQUIREMENT</b> The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master’s study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor’s study programme.	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The SER and the discussions during the assessment visit allow the committee to confirm that the objectives, content and learning outcomes of the study programme Business Law are clearly distinguishable from those of the bachelor’s study programme (“Law”). According to SER and the teachers, the main objective of the master programme is to supplement the theory acquired by the students during the first cycle of studies with judiciary cases and practical aspects and “go deeper” with the subject, provide a narrower object of study. On master’s level, more practical aspects are added to the programme, e.g for IP law (taught also on the bachelor’s level), the basis is still the same, but on master’s level, the emphasis is on the digital aspect of this discipline. Therefore, the disciplines on master’s level do not overlap with the disciplines of the first cycle of studies.</p>	
<b>1.7. REQUIREMENT:</b> Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The curriculum as well as the additional documents clearly show a logical structure of the master programme. The study programme begins with introductory disciplines to the field, such as Company Law and Fundamental Principles of Property Law followed by specialized courses on Telecommunications law and Media Law, etc. However, the study programme would be even more efficient and focused if there would be more disciplines dealing with International Economic Law e.g. WTO rules, EU economic relations with non-member countries, International Arbitration etc.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> In order to add some international dimension to the curriculum, is recommended to add to the curriculum more disciplines dealing with International Economic Law e.g. WTO rules, EU economic relations with non-member countries, International Arbitration etc. Also, It would be advisable to consider the possibility to increase the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It would provide more choices to students, but also increase the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility, and therefore again make academic mobility more attractive to the students.</li> </ul>	
<b>1.8. REQUIREMENT:</b> Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p>	

## Template for Assessment Report

According to the SER, the Business Law programme is oriented on training professional lawyers specializing on providing legal services in the areas of finance, investment, realty, circulation of securities, corporate relations etc., to create competent workforce for entrepreneurship (such as various companies, cooperative organizations, state enterprises) as well as law firms and central and local public authorities. To achieve that, the study programme is regularly adjusted to the major needs of the society/labour market. The content of the study program is continuously improved to assure that the graduates acquire necessary skills to find professional employment in the current labour market. . For example, in the plan of studies for 2014 – 2016 in the module „Economic Sector Law. Telecommunications Law”, the discipline „Economic Sector Law” was after a profound comparative analysis substituted with the discipline „Media Law”.

It is stated in the SER that the Department, at the suggestion of representatives of potential employees, had a proposal of including in the master program disciplines that relate to: regulating financial activities, including banking, guaranties of the fulfilment of the obligations, advertising business and public procurement. However, it was not quite clear whether the Department has already taken any concrete action regarding these suggestions.

During the discussions with the employers and the alumni, there were some polarizing opinions regarding the rather narrow focus of the study programme. On the one hand, it was considered useful to hire graduates with a somewhat wider knowledge basis, as they can be engaged in different subdivisions. On the other hand, a more narrow specialization in a certain specific field was also appreciated. Some employers expressed the need to introduce more disciplines developing the interdisciplinary skills and transferable competences into the curriculum, e.g management, teamwork and programme coordination. Also, a need was voiced for a more global and internationally comparative approach regarding certain disciplines, e.g comparative taxation law, banking and financial system. The Department was encouraged to be open-minded and embrace a wider approach in economic issues.

- **Recommendation:** In order to better meet the needs of the employers, it would be advisable to introduce more disciplines developing the interdisciplinary skills and transferable competences into the curriculum, e.g management, teamwork and programme coordination. Also, a need was voiced for a more global and internationally comparative approach regarding certain disciplines, e.g comparative taxation law, banking and financial system.

**1.9. REQUIREMENT: Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.**

### Comments:

According to the SER, the study programme is developed continuously according to the feedback from students, staff and employers. The students are asked to fill in the questionnaires that allow the Department to identify the areas of improvement of the study programme and

## Template for Assessment Report

make necessary improvements. The Department organizes once or twice a year meetings for discussion and also takes the students' feedback into consideration in the ongoing process. The academic staff is informed about the development plan and there are meetings to discuss the plan and to design further activities to innovate or restructure the study programme according to the action plan as well as the current needs of the labour market.

During the assessment visit, the committee was informed that sometimes suggestions for the introduction of new courses or for the improvement of the skills of graduates are not fully integrated in the development process of the curriculum.

- **Recommendation:** Although the feedback of students, employers and other stakeholders is to some extent taken into account when developing the study programme, it is advisable to implement a clear system of gathering and taking into account the feedback from all the important stakeholders,

<b>1.10. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.</b>	
---	--

Comments:

The interview with the academic employees conducted during the site visit proves the strong awareness of the teaching staff of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives. Being practitioners themselves, the teachers consider the domain of business law very important for the societal and economic development of Moldova and thus have a strong sense of mission. The teaching staff makes considerable efforts for the assimilation of master students' knowledge, by using various modern methods of teaching (role play, group assessments, modelling of situations, solving test cases etc.). The teaching staff elaborates the course learning outcomes in accordance with the general objectives of the study programme.

<b>1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.</b>	
---	--

Comments:

In general, the study programme provides the students with opportunities for further education at doctoral level. The students gain some experience in academic writing while preparing their master's theses and therefore obtain necessary skills to continue their research activity within doctoral studies in Law.

Still, there is some room for improvement regarding both the foreign language skills of the students (inevitably required for advanced scientific research) and their overall experience in academic writing.

## Template for Assessment Report

- **Recommendation:** It is advisable to pay more attention to developing the students' English language skills (e.g, include in the curriculum more foreign language materials) and also offer the students some special course(s) on the methodology of legal research.

2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	
<p><b>Collected evidence:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Self-evaluation report (SER);</li> <li>• Annexes of SER;</li> <li>• Internal regulations;</li> <li>• Additional documents received during the site visit;</li> <li>• Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.</li> </ul>			
<p><b>General comments:</b></p> <p>The Faculty and Department regularly conduct surveys to evaluate learning process and outcomes. However, the Department should have a clearer procedure to engage the students, alumni and employers in the development process. The teaching staff is enthusiastic and prefers to use active teaching methods. As a good starting point for independent learning, some courses have a textbook written by the instructor. The teaching staff is well aware of the need to keep up with the changes in legal regulations and recent court practice. Still, in order to provide a wider, comparative perspective, it is essential to include non-Moldovan, non-Romanian and non-Russian literature in the syllabi.</p> <p>The University has agreements or good cooperation with many public and private institutions, where the students can perform their internship. Students in general expressed satisfaction with organisation of internship. In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of business law.</p> <p>It remains unclear how exactly the assessment methods are chosen and matched to learning outcomes and whether the students receive personal feedback regarding their performance at different assessments in order to support student development.</p> <p>The necessary regulation appears to be in place for the recognition of prior learning, but there is no actual experience. The Department should consider the possibility of increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It provides more choices to students, but also increases the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility and therefore again makes academic mobility more</p>			



## Template for Assessment Report

attractive.

Although the students are already being encouraged to participate in scientific conferences and publish articles, the Department should find more ways to involve master students in current or future research projects (also in development activities).

As described above, the study programme has both strengths and areas of improvement in this assessment area. Some problems are significant and require substantial effort to improve the situation (e.g. availability and use of foreign legal literature, involving master's students in broader research and development activities, increase comparative perspective). As a result, the study programme fulfils the following requirements partially. The Committee understands that some areas of improvement are on Faculty or University level, and thus demand action on Faculty or University level, but still inevitably affect the specific study programmes and their quality.

### Commendations:

- Teaching staff finds time to publish teaching materials for their courses.
- Internship is well organised and the University guarantees the students a place of internship due to specific agreements or good cooperation with many companies.
- The ratio between master students and supervisors is very favourable.

### Recommendations:

- It would be advisable to include more comparative perspective in different areas of the study programme.
- The syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire, as the first step, some well-known up-to-date textbooks covering the study programme related European or international regulations in English, French and German.
- In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of business law.
- It would be advisable to provide students with personal feedback regarding their performance in order to support student development.
- In connection with the recognition of prior learning, it is recommended to consider increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum in order to (1) provide more choices to students and (2) make academic mobility more attractive.
- Master students should be involved in broader research and development activities.

**2.1. REQUIREMENT: Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.**

## Template for Assessment Report

### Comments:

The SER is short and general on this issue.

However, the annexes of the SER, and additional information and materials received during the meetings (including those from other programmes) proved that the study management is regulated by national and internal normative documents, which are publicly available (although mostly in Romanian).

The SER and the meetings with the Dean, the Head of the Department and teaching staff (including those from other programmes) showed that the Faculty and Department regularly conduct surveys to evaluate learning process and outcomes. In the context of courses, students give their feedback on how course was delivered, what were their expectations, whether they achieved their objectives, etc. The results are taken into account when planning and implementing improvements. Teaching staff told the Committee that the study programme is adjusted also according to the practical needs/expectations from the society. The proposals for changes to the study programme are first approved by the Department, then sent to the Faculty and finally to the Senate.

The Committee received mixed information on whether and how students, alumni and employers are actually involved in the development process: some said that they are involved, some regretted that they are not, some were not aware of how they could contribute.

- **Recommendation:** The Department should have a clear procedure to engage the students, alumni and employers in the development process.

**2.2. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, teamwork-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.**

### Comments:

The SER is very short on this issue.

However, the meeting with the teaching staff indicated that different teaching methods are used, and they prefer to use active teaching methods. Lectures are meant to provide introduction to the course and to explain basic concepts of the subject matter. Seminars are for practical teaching and learning, to develop teamwork, to solve cases, to conduct debates, etc. Seminars demand active participation from the students and prior preparation at home. As a good starting point for independent learning, some courses have a textbook written by the instructor (member of the teaching staff). Teaching staff decides which teaching methods they wish to use and adjust the choice of teaching methods as needed.

**2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.**Comments:

The SER is short on this issue and mostly lists the courses, their instructors and names the annexes which contain the syllabi. There is almost no information about the “teaching materials”.

However, the meetings with teaching staff, students and alumni gave more information regarding teaching materials. The use of up-to-date teaching materials is inevitable for providing high quality education. It is commendable that teaching staff publishes practical journal articles and teaching materials for their courses. Teaching staff is well aware of the need to keep up with the changes in legal regulations and recent court practice.

Syllabi and meetings with the teaching staff showed that a very limited number of foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) is used during the studies. The Committee notes that syllabi contain literature published in Romania or in Russia, but the situation is troubling when it comes to literature in English, French, German, etc. It is understandable that the study programme focuses on Moldovan law, giving Moldovan sources a priority, but in order to provide a wider, comparative perspective, it is essential to include non-Moldovan, non-Romanian and non-Russian literature.

The programme contains courses which are related to European or international regulations (e.g. Company law: The harmonization of national legislation to European Union standards, Telecommunication Law) or could benefit from comparative perspective, but their lists of literature contain almost no foreign materials. Teaching staff admits that a very limited amount of foreign legal literature is available and even what is available tends to be outdated. Employers emphasised that the study programme should include more the practice of other states (again demanding foreign materials). It is also useful if students worked with foreign legal literature as well as authentic texts of treaties or judgments (Romanian versions are usually translations) to improve their foreign legal language skill. The fact that the instructor has used foreign legal literature to prepare his/he textbook does not mitigate this issue. The Committee saw that legal literature databases (e.g. WestLaw, LexisNexis, HeinOnline) are not available at the University, but there are numerous journals which are openly accessible and provide high quality articles. The library should acquire, as the first step, some well-known up-to-date textbooks covering the study programme related European or international regulations in English, French and German.

- **Recommendation:** The syllabi should include foreign legal literature (journal articles and books) in addition to literature in Romanian and Russian and library should acquire, as the first step, some well-known up-to-date textbooks covering the study programme related European or international regulations in English, French and German.

## Template for Assessment Report

<p><b>2.4. REQUIREMENT: Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The internship is regulated by national and internal normative documents. The curriculum contains a compulsory five-week internship (10 credits). The objectives of internship are defined in the regulation of internship and also available in the blank portfolio of internship that is given to each student performing the internship. Each student is officially assigned to a place of internship and is appointed a supervisor from the University and a tutor from the place of internship. At the end of internship, students complete a portfolio of internship.</p> <p>Students in general expressed satisfaction with organisation of internship. The alumni found the internship reasonable mainly for those students who do not work, but there are quite many students who are working. The majority of students do seek the internship places for themselves and the students who already work can perform their internship at their current workplaces. This opportunity involves a risk. If the current workplace is not related to Business Law, the internship may not achieve its learning outcomes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> In order to achieve the necessary learning outcomes, all the internships should be conducted in the field of business law.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>2.5. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The University has agreements or good cooperation with many public and private institutions, where the students can perform their internship. According to SER, SUM has signed collaboration agreements (renewable in every four years) with the Ministry of Justice, the National Anticorruption Center, the Superior Council of Magistrates, etc. that provide internship possibilities for the students.</p>	
<p><b>2.6. REQUIREMENT: Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The assessment of learning outcomes is regulated by the national and internal normative documents. The assessment as a whole is comprised of the initial assessment at the beginning of study process, the current assessments during the semester (60%) and the final assessment at the end of the semester (40%). The SER lists different assessment methods that are used (formative-continuous and formative-periodic evaluations, etc.). Students are informed at the beginning of the semester how the course will be assessed (methods) and what are the criteria.</p>	

## Template for Assessment Report

The committee understands that the instructor of the course may choose the assessment methods. It remains unclear how exactly the assessment methods are chosen and matched to learning outcomes, especially when considering the fact that all courses are of 5 credits and the contact hours are quite similar per 1 credit. The content of assessment methods (e.g. exam questions) are regularly updated. The SER states that the quality of applied assessment method (e.g. specific questions, tests, exams) are assured by the head of the Chair, of the Department and of Quality Management. If they are not subject matter experts, it is questionable, how do they assess and ensure the substantial quality questions, tests, exams, etc. in question?

The committee found no evidence whether students receive personal feedback regarding their performance at different assessments in order to support student development.

- **Recommendation:** It would be advisable to provide students with personal feedback regarding their performance in order to support student development.

### **2.7. REQUIREMENT: The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.**

#### Comments:

The SER is short and general on this issue.

The recognition of prior learning and work experience is mainly regulated by the national normative documents. The meetings showed that there is confusion as to what the recognition of prior learning and work experience actually means. The Committee was interested if the students can transfer the credits earned, individual courses taken in other Moldovan or foreign higher education institutions at master's or higher level to the MSU as part of their studies at the MSU. The Committee understands that according to national regulation, work experience is recognised only in the framework on vocational higher education. After the meetings, the Committee believes that necessary regulation is in place for the recognition of prior learning, but there is no actual experience. The recognising prior learning is closely connected to academic mobility, i.e. if the credits earned during academic mobility are recognised without unduly difficulties, students have one more incentive to take advantage of academic mobility.

- **Recommendation:** The Department should consider the possibility of increasing the proportion of elective courses in the curriculum. It provides more choices to students, but also increases the amount of credits that could be transferred after the end of academic mobility and therefore again makes academic mobility more attractive.

### **2.8. REQUIREMENT: Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are**

Template for Assessment Report

<p><b>undertaken.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The evaluation of study process has clearly defined purposes and its results are used to improve curriculum, courses, teaching methods etc. and to select teaching staff. There are several organs or officials who are involved in the analysis of the achievement of learning outcomes, e.g. Dean, Quality Assurance Commission, Quality Management Department, and the Pro-rector responsible for didactic activity. The SER and meetings showed that teaching staff and students are asked for feedback and their feedback is considered by appropriate organs and officials.</p> <p>However, the Committee received mixed information on whether and how alumni and employers also participate in the evaluation of study process. If they are not involved, the Department should involve them as they can provide useful feedback.</p>	
<p><b>2.9.REQUIREMENT: Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is high.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Each student has a supervisor appointed by the Department. The study programme involves 14 instructors and has 16 master students (enrolled in 2013). When considering the number of teaching staff and students, the ratio is very favourable (see criteria 3.3 of the Report) and students should receive very good supervision. Students have the freedom to choose the topics for their master’s theses. Master students are encouraged to participate in scientific conferences and to publish scientific articles. The meetings with students and alumni showed that students actually participate in conferences.</p> <p>However, the Committee found no evidence that students are involved in broader research and development activities (beyond their individual research), e.g. participating in a research project led by a member of teaching staff. True, there are examples where professors and students/alumni have co-authored a publication. The SER and supplementary materials show that teaching staff is participating in research projects.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> The Department should find ways to involve master students in current or future research projects (also in development activities).</li> </ul>	

Template for Assessment Report

3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	
<p><b>Collected evidence:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Self-evaluation report (SER);</li> <li>• Annexes of SER;</li> <li>• Internal regulations;</li> <li>• Additional documents received during the site visit;</li> <li>• Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.</li> </ul>			
<p><b>General comments:</b></p> <p>At the moment, the qualification of full-time teaching staff does not fully comply with legal requirements as not all of them hold a PhD degree and only a few have had some international experience. However, the fact that some members of the teaching staff are also involved in practical legal activities related to the disciplines taught can be considered positive. Provided that there is no major overlapping of the same individuals in many of the master programmes under evaluation and the teaching staff involved in this master's programme do not have a significant involvement also in the bachelor's programmes, this should assure some consistency to the teaching process. Still, in order to meet the requirements established by legislation, all members of the academic staff involved in the study programme should as soon as possible finalize their PhD studies.</p> <p>The members of the teaching staff have adequate teaching competence - the fact that most of them are involved also in practicing legal activities in field similar to disciplines taught is a positive as they can combine the practical experience with their teaching activities.</p> <p>At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.</p> <p>The management should continuously support and encourage the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their knowledge and skills and participate in international mobility and networks. Measures should be taken to encourage and support the teaching staff to participate in the international research projects and other international scientific activities. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff. The Department of Business Law should also actively seek possibilities for involving visiting professors in the teaching process.</p> <p>Compared to internationally acceptable standards, the participation in the international research projects and other international scientific</p>			

## Template for Assessment Report

activity needs to be much more active. In order to achieve that, more resources should be found and allocated to research activities. **It is highly recommended to apply for the EU funding already available to Moldova, e.g the Erasmus + programme.**

Considering all those facts, as well as the general findings from the SER and provided annexes, the general conclusion of the committee is that this criterion is partially compliant with the requirements.

### Commendations:

- Teaching staff is also involved in practical activities in the field of law (lawyers, judges);
- Teaching staff participates in scientific conferences.

### Recommendations:

- All members of the academic staff involved in the study programme should finalize their PhD studies;
- The Faculty in general should be more actively participating in the academic mobility programs and also invite more visiting professors from foreign institutions;
- At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.
- At the Faculty management level a system should be created to support and encourage the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their knowledge and skills and participate in international mobility and networks. Measures should be taken to encourage and support the teaching staff to participate in the international research projects and other international scientific activities. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.
- Compared to internationally acceptable standards, the participation in the international research projects and other international scientific activity needs to be much more active. In order to achieve that, more resources should be found and allocated to research activities. **It is highly recommended to apply for the EU funding already available to Moldova, e.g the Erasmus + programme.**

**3.1. REQUIREMENT:** The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.

### Comments:



## Template for Assessment Report

<p>From Annex B2.1 it appears that the “Business Law” programme is covered by 14 staff members, out of which 12 are full-time (85%) and 2 part-time. From the 12 full-time staff, only 7 hold a PhD degree (59%) which means that the number and qualification of full-time teaching staff does not at the moment fully comply with legal requirements.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> In order to meet the requirements established by legislation, all members of the academic staff involved in the study programme should as soon as possible finalize their PhD studies.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>3.2. REQUIREMENT: Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>From Annex B2.2 it results that the age average of full-time staff is around 45 years. The oldest staff member is 80 years old and the youngest is 31. As there are 9 members of staff between years 30 and 40, it can be concluded that the distribution of the staff by age is at least on medium term sustainable.</p>	
<p><b>3.3. REQUIREMENT: The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at MA level.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Taking into account the fact that 14 members of teaching staff are responsible of supervising an average of 15-20 students, every member of the teaching staff has a maximum of 2 students to supervise, which means that their workload is adequate for achieving the learning outcomes on this particular programme. However, the committee understands that this figure should be considered only as an estimate, as some of the members of the teaching staff involved in this study programme are also involved in the bachelor’s programme and in other master programmes, and thus the real workload is likely to be bigger in their cases.</p> <p>According to the CVs presented to the committee, the qualification of the teaching staff is adequate for achieving the objectives of the study programme. However, there is still some room for improvement regarding the international comparability and competitiveness of the substantial qualification of the staff (e.g regarding research activities) that should be further measured against international performance indicators and continuously developed.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

<p><b>3.4. REQUIREMENT: The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching methods.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>From Annex B 2.3 it appears that members of the teaching staff have adequate teaching competence. The fact that most of them are involved also in practicing legal activities in field similar to disciplines taught is a positive as they can combine the practical experience with their teaching activities. From annex B 2.4 it also results that members of teaching staff have attended various national scientific events, thus allowing them to improve their research and teaching methods.</p>	
<p><b>3.5. REQUIREMENT: The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The SER states that the University Department of Continuing Education and QA departments of SUM periodically organize training sessions and provide methodological support for members of the academic staff. Also, it appears that some of the members of the teaching staff who also act as judges, magistrates or other professionals in the legal area attended some special trainings for the respective lines of work, contributing thus to their self-improvement.</p> <p>The Faculty Development Plan for the 2012-2017 period (Annex D7) states that until 2012, self-improvement was the only existing way for improvement of the teaching staff. In the respective plan it is stated that the University should embark into developing cooperation links with foreign institutions, mainly from Romania, allowing professors to be invited to teach on a reciprocity basis. The assessment committee can only agree with the latter. Moreover, it is necessary to contribute at the University and Faculty management level to the creation and development of the opportunities for the members of the academic staff to develop their knowledge and skill within the foreign academic institutions.</p> <p>Concerning other staff development activities besides continuing education, the committee did not receive any evidence concerning the broader staff development plan, including conducting systematic appraisal interviews with the staff and other methods of staff development.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> At the Faculty management level, it is recommended to establish a comprehensive staff development system that includes also other important elements of staff development, like the implementation of regular appraisal interviews with the teachers.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>3.6. REQUIREMENT: Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.</b></p>	

## Template for Assessment Report

<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>The committee found no evidence about the involvement of any foreign visiting professors in this programme.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> The Department of Business Law should actively seek possibilities for involving visiting professors in the teaching on the study programme.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>3.7. REQUIREMENT: The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the information given in SER and during the assessment visit, the members of the academic staff involved in this programme do not regularly participate in teaching activities in other foreign institutions. From the CV-s presented it appears that only a few of the academic-staff members have had real international experiences. Annex 2.4 and a table at page 17 of the SER state the fact that some members of teaching staff were involved in research projects of an international nature. Therefore, the programme in this aspect only partially meets the requirements.</p> <p>The Faculty in general should be more actively participating in the academic mobility programs. According to the teaching staff, they have a thirst for improving their knowledge but don't have any support from the University and believe that it is a question of a lack of resources.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> The committee recommends that at the Faculty management level a system will be created to support and encourage the members of the full-time teaching staff to regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks. Regular goals for the international cooperation should be set and the achievement of those goals should be measured regularly e.g. during quarterly performance reviews of the members of the academic staff.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>3.8. REQUIREMENT: Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>From the SER and annex B.2.4 it appears that over the last five years there has been participation in national research projects and also some attendance in international conferences organized both in Chisinau and abroad, which led, in some cases, to the publication of scientific papers. However, according to the SER and the discussion with the teaching staff, the publication of articles is a non-paid activity, which means that this activity is quite uncertain and largely dependent on the willingness and possibilities of the persons involved in research.</p>	

Template for Assessment Report

- **Recommendation:** Compared to internationally acceptable standards, the participation in the international research projects and other international scientific activity needs to be much more active. In order to achieve that, more resources should be found and allocated to research activities. **It is highly recommended to apply for the EU funding already available to Moldova, e.g the Erasmus + programme.**

**3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.**

Comments:

The SER stipulates that the research activity of each member of the academic staff is planned and monitored, as each of the academics has to annually fill in an individual work plan, with research tangible result, which becomes part of the Department's yearly plan, the real achievement of such results being monitored by the head of the Department, based on reports and evidences provided by each member of the teaching staff.

At the same time, the Development Strategy presented in Annex D7 stipulates for the period 2012-2017 the creation of two research centers: Centre for Public Law and Private Law Center, that will organize scientific activities (sessions and conferences, debates, round tables, practical workshops, case studies, experimental processes, methodological seminars, international schools, summer schools and essay contests), with emphasis in organizing international scientific conferences every two years.

At the visit, proofs of individual plans for teachers, as well as reports by head of Department were presented to the evaluation team.

4. STUDENTS	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	
<p><b>Collected evidence:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Self-evaluation report (SER);</li> <li>• Annexes of SER;</li> <li>• Internal regulations;</li> <li>• Additional documents received during the site visit;</li> <li>• Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.</li> </ul>			

## Template for Assessment Report

### **General comments:**

Although the committee was pleased to meet many satisfied students who all assured the positive image of the Business Law study programme there is also plenty of room for improvements. Main reasons for regarding the decision to assess the area as partially conforming to requirements were insufficient academic mobility (internal and external) and also the lack of systematic approach towards anti-plagiarism and academic fraud issues.

At the moment, mobility options on the Business Law study programme are very limited and the academic mobility is virtually non-existent. It is recommended to encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility). In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.

To further support the students, MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists and also provide some sort of psychological counselling services for the students. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.

The committee welcomes the use of modern software by MSU in order to discover plagiarism, yet this approach is only one aspect of plagiarism detection. Therefore, the committee urges the Faculty to adapt a unified and more systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and actively seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, master's seminars etc).

Although the graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements, it would be in the Faculty's best interests that the causes for dropping out would also be formally collected and analysed.

### Commendations:

- Students' suggestions and feedback is considered a valuable input to the University and Faculty.
- Students' satisfaction with the study programme is high.
- The preparation of students in the Business Law study programme is in coherence with the labour market needs.

## Template for Assessment Report

<p><u>Recommendations:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is recommended to encourage master students to participate in academic mobility and focus on informing them about the mobility opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).</li> <li>• In order to help the University in its internationalization (and academic mobility) processes at the University and also at the Faculty level, it is advisable to consider updating and revising the webpage's content in English in order to attract foreign students.</li> <li>• MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists and also provide some sort of psychological counselling services for the students. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.</li> <li>• It is recommended to adapt a unified and systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, master's seminars etc). Implementing anti-plagiarism software is a positive step forward but there is room for further improvements.</li> <li>• It is advisable to seek ways how to formally strengthen the ties with graduates (alumni club, events for graduates, satisfaction surveys for alumni etc).</li> <li>• The causes for dropping out should be formally collected and analysed.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>4.1. REQUIREMENT: The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>In general, the admission requirements for students in the study programme Public Law are in accordance with the normative acts and are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme.</p> <p>According to the SER, admission to the "Business Law" master program is governed by the rules of organization and development of admission to higher education master cycle II, adopted and approved annually (<a href="http://usm.md/admitere/">http://usm.md/admitere/</a>) under the Rules for Admission to higher education master cycle II, approved by Government Decision nr.1455 of 24.12.2007. The Dean informed the committee that annually, the the criteria for enrolment of students is approved annually by the Senate.</p> <p>Admission to master's degree studies is in accordance with the rules of the institution and is organized in two sessions. The admission examination for master's degree studies consists in a written or oral test for the profile subjects, also test for one foreign language and test for IT skills. According to the Dean, starting with year 2015, there shall be an online test as an entrance exam to the master's level studies.</p>	

## Template for Assessment Report

<p>The national admission criteria include a specialty exam and evaluation of the IT and foreign language skills (English/French). <b>Regarding the general lack of foreign language skills among the master students encountered by the committee, a question can be raised whether the language test serves its purpose adequately or is there some room for improvement.</b></p>	
<p><b>4.2. REQUIREMENT: The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Although the SER claimed that study and career counselling is available to students, the committee was not able to witness the awareness of the students or the alumni of other formal counselling services than career counselling. It is recommended for the Faculty to consider delegating the responsibility of study counselling from professors to a trained specialist. All of the professors are not prepared to provide effective study counselling. A separate study advisor can provide more professional counselling and could also ease the professors' workload. The committee received no information about any psychological counselling services available to the students in MSU.</p> <p>There seems to be a lack of information regarding other counselling services besides career counselling.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> <b>Recommendation:</b> MSU should establish a formalized and effective counselling system for the students – e.g consider to delegate the responsibility of study counselling from professors to trained specialists and also provide some sort of psychological counselling services for the students. Also, students need to be more informed about the additional counselling services Moldova State University (and also the Faculty) is offering.         </li> </ul>	
<p><b>4.3. REQUIREMENT: Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Mobility options on the Business Law study programme are very limited. Although there very few options exist, the students are still not aware about the opportunities they might have. The committee encourages the Faculty to seek more academic mobility opportunities and to raise the awareness amongst students.</p> <p>In the Moldova State University operates the Department of International Relations, which is responsible for implementing the internal and external mobility mechanism. The Ministry of Education provides external mobility through cooperation and assistance programs with other universities. Furthermore, The Faculty has signed cooperation agreements with the Faculty of Law of the "Babes-Bolyai" University, Cluj-Napoca</p>	

## Template for Assessment Report

(Romania) and the Faculty of Law of the „Alexandru Ioan Cuza” University, Iași (Romania), and the Faculty of Law of the Vilnius University (Lithuania).

Despite of the above, the level of awareness of the students about the mobility possibilities and the actual availability of the financial, organisational and academic support is very low. The committee understands that this is mainly not a question of the financial or organisational abilities but rather the lack of considering the participation of students in international programs - an activity worthy of supporting and encouraging.

- **Recommendation:** It is recommended to provide master students with internal and external mobility possibilities and focus on informing them about such opportunities (for example, hold classes or seminars to introduce the opportunities for academic mobility).

### 4.4. **REQUIREMENT:** Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in student mobility is stable or growing.

#### Comments:

Although master students can apply to international mobility programs, the academic mobility is virtually non-existent. The committee recommends the Faculty members actively seek possibilities to support and encourage students to participate in international mobility programmes.

- **Recommendation:** Master students should be encouraged to participate in academic mobility (of which an important part is the improvement of English language proficiency).

### 4.5. **REQUIREMENT:** Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education institution.

#### Comments:

As stated in the SER and also confirmed during the interviews, students are involved in the decision-making processes at various levels of the University. Furthermore, they are not only formally involved but they also assured the committee that the management of the Faculty and the University considers their feedback and also implements their suggestions.

The students are involved in the activity of Faculty Council and Faculty Syndicate, Alliance of MSU Students of the Faculty of Law Council, Self-



## Template for Assessment Report

government of the MSU students (ASUSM), and also ad-hoc committees. Master students express their opinions through questionnaires, and through representatives in the composition of the Committee for Quality Assurance of the Faculty of Law.	
<b>4.6. REQUIREMENT: A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.</b>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the SER and information provided to the committee during the assessment visit, an ethics committee operates in MSU with a purpose to discover and penalize any academic fraud. In order to prevent and exclude plagiarism in master thesis, MSU is testing a special program that determines whether the master thesis overlap with other existing works and to what extent it overlaps. In this order the master thesis is presented with a CD copy which, after inspection, shall be kept in the archives of MSU. The purpose of this program is to prevent academic fraud, and copyright protection. The committee welcomes the use of modern software by MSU in order to discover plagiarism, yet this approach is only one aspect of plagiarism detection.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> <b>Recommendation:</b> All of the study programmes under evaluation lack a systematic approach towards academic fraud. In many cases the discovery of academic fraud lies upon academic staff (for example thesis supervisors). Therefore, the committee urges the Faculty to adapt a unified and more systematic approach towards preventing plagiarism and actively seek opportunities how to teach students about anti-plagiarism and academic ethics (e.g course for academic writing, master's seminars etc). </li> </ul>	
<b>4.7. REQUIREMENT: Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates' employment and is monitoring the evolution of graduates' career.</b>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>Although in MSU there is the Centre for Career Guidance and Employment that is responsible for tracking professional development, the assessment committee was not able to confirm that there actually was a system in place for keeping touch with the graduates. Much of the communication with graduates and the monitoring of graduates career is taking place informally and is based on individual connections and relationships between the alumni and the (teaching) staff.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li> <b>Recommendation:</b> The committee recommends to consider organising annual events e.g. conferences, seminars or other types of networking meetings with the alumni of the Faculty. Also the collecting feedback from graduates could be more regular and systematic. </li> </ul>	
<b>4.8. REQUIREMENT: The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the</b>	

**Template for Assessment Report**

<b>programme.</b>	
<p><u>Comments:</u>          According to the SER, students involved in "Business Law" master program in 2013-2015, including those who continue to study, are employed in 67%, all working in the legal field, although the percentage of students who are working in accordance with their obtained qualification is satisfactory. The unemployment rate amongst graduates also needs to be monitored.</p>	
<p><b>4.9. REQUIREMENT: There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u>          According to SER, a system is implemented for monitoring academic progress. The master students' performances are fixed in report cards, also each lecturer shall complete a group journal where they will also register exam results. The responsible Methodist completes a register which lists all the final evaluations. Moreover, in the MSU there is a centralized database, which includes all academic performances of each program.           The documents presented to the committee demonstrated an unusually high average grade of the students. Here, a question might be raised whether the grading system is adequate in its current form for effectively measuring the performance of the students or should it be somewhat modified and improved in order to really support the development of the students.           The SER states that the main reasons for dropping out have not been specifically analysed but among them are allegedly largely different external conditions, e.g the change of living place, working in another town or abroad, lack of financial resources. The committee concludes that the graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements, but would like to underline that it would be in the Faculty's interests that the causes for dropping out would also be formally collected and analysed.</p>	

5. RESOURCES	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	

## Template for Assessment Report

### Collected evidence:

- Self-evaluation report (SER);
- Annexes of SER;
- Internal regulations;
- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.

### General comments:

The budget planning in general is sustainable. However, the Faculty seems underfinanced, which according to the understanding of the committee is the reason for many shortcomings described above, e.g. the general salary level of the academic staff, the state of library and the general infrastructure of the Faculty, the low level of academic mobility etc. It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.

The trend of student numbers is decreasing.

As the Faculty in general was at least partially under renovation, it was not possible for the committee to assess the conformity to the requirements of the teaching and learning environment as a whole. ICT devices are available for both Faculty members and students. The computer rooms look modern and meet the basic contemporary standards. The staff and the students are relatively motivated to use ICT techniques. The positive trend is the using of *Moodle* platform providing the students with information regarding the courses online. Still, the existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

There is almost no foreign literature in the field of law and the books available are rather out-dated. The University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German. It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.

### Commendations:

## Template for Assessment Report

- The classrooms are equipped sufficiently, the equipment is being renewed.
- The use of *Moodle* platform is providing the students with information regarding the courses online.

### Recommendations:

- It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.
- The University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources. The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German.
- It is recommended to increase the awareness of students and academic staff of international databases and motivate them to use the few available.
- The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.

**5.1. REQUIREMENT: The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.**

### Comments:

According to the SER, in regards to the financial resources, SUM does not keep separate accounts for the "Business Law" programme, just having a single account for all the master programmes in law. SUM provides the "Business Law" program with the financial resources necessary to carry out the studies. Less resources are allocated for the development of courses, comments, research of practice of law and in general for the development of master studies. The dynamics of Department's income and expenditure (for 2010-2014) is presented compendiously in Annex B.5.1., the trend is that the numbers are slightly increasing.

From year 2010 to 2014, the revenues have increased by approximately 10% and so have the expenditures - by approximately 16%. The committee is confirmed that these numbers clearly show the sustainable character of budget planning.

However, in general the Faculty seems underfinanced, which according to the understanding of the committee is the reason for many shortcomings described above, e.g. the general salary level of the academic staff, the state of library and the general infrastructure of the Faculty, the low level of academic mobility etc.

Template for Assessment Report

- Recommendation:** It would be advisable for the University to try to find some additional resources in order to mitigate the possible risks to the financial sustainability and also upgrade the infrastructure and the library of MSU and also support the mobility of both teaching staff and the students.

**5.2. REQUIREMENT: Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.**

Comments:

The trends of admission and graduation of students per each year are presented below:

Year of enrolment	No. of enrolled students	Year of graduation	No. of graduates	Difference
2008	47	2010	38	9
2009	37	2011	28	9
2010	75	2012	52	23
2011	21	2013	22	+1
2012	19	2014	16	3
2013	16	2015	11	5

According to SER, the number of students in "Business Law" master program, as in other master programs, is decreasing. In 2009 the program was preferred by 47 students, in 2010, 75 persons were admitted, but in the years 2013 and, 2014 , only 16 people each year were enrolled (SER p 20). The assessment committee believes that the current student numbers are still sustainable, but the department should try to maintain the current number of students. If the number of students continues to drop, the department should consider redesigning the master's programme to be covering a slightly wider range of subjects and the Faculty in general should consolidate the master's programmes in the field of law.

**5.3. REQUIREMENT: Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).**

## Template for Assessment Report

<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the SER, SUM has allocated for the masters programme classrooms equipped with enough space for conducting classes and seminars. For the 2014/15 academic year, the master program "Business Law" was conducted in classes and seminars in the auditorium 10 Block I of SUM, which has 60 seats and 72.2 m<sup>2</sup> of space.</p> <p>The committee witnessed that the Faculty in general was at least partially under renovation, therefore it is currently not possible to assess whether the outcome of the works will meet all the requirements.</p>	
<p><b>5.4. REQUIREMENT: Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by up-to-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to the SER, the students have access to computers in the library reading rooms and to free and unlimited Wi-Fi. During the observations made by the committee during the assessment visit, the number of computers is sufficient. ICT devices are available for both Faculty members and students. The computer rooms look in general modern and meet the basic contemporary standards. The staff and the students are relatively motivated to use ICT techniques.</p> <p>However, the availability and the knowledge of Faculty members regarding electronic legal databases should be increased. The committee found no evidence during the assessment visit that the basic legal databases are available for use from Faculty computers. The positive trend is the using of <i>Moodle</i> platform providing the students with information regarding the courses online.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> The existing ICT solutions should be further developed in order to guarantee the existing resources to be fully utilised and to take the usage of modern technologies to the next level, e.g., full e-courses, webinars, video lectures and comparable.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>5.5. REQUIREMENT: The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.</b></p>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According to SER, SUM has dormitories for students (Annex B. 5.5.1.). The master students in law stay in the dormitory no.19 on Flower Street 4/2, Chisinau. Law Faculty students receive medical services at University Medical Center located on Pan Halippa str. 6/5 Chişinău.</p> <p>During the discussions with the management, the committee was assured that the dormitories are currently being modernized by MSU.</p>	

## Template for Assessment Report

<b>5.6. REQUIREMENT: A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.</b>	
<p><u>Comments:</u></p> <p>According the SER, the library is equipped with 1,809,725 of books, 1445 PhD thesis; 4074 rare rooks, 523 places for reading rooms (capacity that can simultaneously serve more than 20% of the students of the Faculty of Law of USM) and 4359 m<sup>2</sup>of functional space.</p> <p>However, in the light of this data, the most significant problem related to library is that there is almost no foreign literature in the field of law. The books available are rather out-dated. The visit to the library proved that the literature in the field is inadequate and needs fundamental strategic re-planning. The students and academic staff are not aware of international databases and therefore not motivated to use the few available. Also, the librarians need training to give advice to the students on how to access electronic academic materials.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Recommendation:</b> The library needs major investment, especially regarding field specific legal literature in English, French or German. The University should pay attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in international academic databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources.</li></ul>	