



Accreditation of Study Programmes Assessment Report

Institution: State Agrarian University of Moldova

Study programme: Patrimonial Law

Assessment committee:

Dr Kristiina Tõnnisson (chair), Director of European College, University of Tartu, Estonia

Mr Adrian Ermurachi, Senior consultant, General Directorate for Policy Coordination, External Assistance and Central Public Administration Reform; PhD student; Moldova

Dr Tanel Kerikmäe, Professor, Tallinn Law School, Faculty of Social Sciences, Tallinn University of Technology, Estonia

Dr Yuliya Vashchenko, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, Faculty of Law, Administrative Law Department, Associate Professor; Ukraine

Coordinator: Mr Hillar Bauman

Dates of the assessment visit: 07.05.2015

Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA: 09.06.2015

Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation: 24.06.2015

Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 4 votes in favour and 0 votes against.

Date: 03.07.2015



I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development			х
Teaching and learning		x	
Teaching staff			x
Students		x	
Resources		х	

Short information about SAUM from the self-evaluation report:

SAUM organizational structure includes 8 faculties, 37 departments. Faculty of Cadastre and Law has 4 departments: Land Improvement and Physics, Cadastre and Geodesy, Land Organization, Law. The academic unit responsible for carrying out the study programme is the Department of Law, which activates within the Faculty of Cadastre and Law.

In 2002, SAUM founded the specialty "Patrimonial Law", 1st Cycle, where the first 109 students were enrolled. In 2005, it was approved the new education plan that took into account the new requirements for this speciality, which had to be included in education plans of all higher education institutions as the speciality - 38.1 Law. In this regard, following the origins of the speciality Law at SAUM and considering the specific profile of SAUM, it was decided to open the master degree study-programme "Patrimonial Law". Thus, in 2011, the Ministry approved the education plan for the 2nd Cycle, specialization "Patrimonial Law".



Comments: State Agrarian University of Moldova (SAUM) plans regularly its development. Unfortunately no existing document is targeting development of the study programme *Patrimonial Law*. The content of the programme is currently not devoted just to Civil Law issues and therefore its structure and content are not internationally comparable. The learning outcomes of several courses are not clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme. The number of full-time teaching staff of the programme does not comply with the teaching load of the curriculum. Currently the teaching staff is very limited, there are only 5 full-time members for the whole programme. There is no evidence of visiting teaching staff members, including those from foreign higher education institutions. The research as such is not clearly defined and the faculty members are not guided to the international standard-based research world. No student from Patrimonial Law has ever participated in any international mobility programmes.

The school's library supports the conduct of studies on limited level. The literature in the field of patrimonial law is very limited. There are only very few international textbooks translated into Russian or Romanian languages. The study materials need to be updated and the syllabi shall include the clear information on the forms for the interim and final assessment. The financial resources of SAUM on university level are adequate for conducting studies throughout the university, but the financial resources on departmental/programme level are inadequate. The financial support mechanisms for the particular master programme at the university managerial level are neither visible nor clearly articulated.

Students at SAUM are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the university. The students have possibility to elect and be elected as student representatives in the governing structures of the faculty, university, other governing bodies and committees created within faculties and university. From 66 students which graduated the Patrimonial Law programme during the period 2011-2014 only 26 are working based on the obtained qualification.

Commendations:

- SAUM as a solid academic institution is financially sustainable;
- Physical study rooms meet the requirements for the studies;
- The school is providing opportunities for participation in international mobility programmes;
- Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels throughout the school;
- The school has a valid register for monitoring the graduates' employment.
- Active usage of the Moodle by the teaching staff and students of the MA programme;
- Strong practical component of the programme.



Recommendations:

- to consider changing the title of the programme to "Legal protection of property" (as a variant "Legal protection of property in Agricultural sector", considering the main profile of the SAUM) or the establishing the master programme in the relevant fields more directly related to the Agricultural Sector, e.g. "Land and Agricultural Law", "Land, Agricultural and Environmental Law", etc.;
- to focus on legal issues of property protection in Agricultural sector in the titles and the content of the study disciplines;
- to back up the system of self-development of the staff by strategic budgeting and valid motivation scheme;
- to plan and monitor research activities as a part of the departmental/faculty strategy;
- to connect the base of internship directly to the topic/title of the master thesis;
- to consider the possibility of broadening the cooperation with the institutions from private/agricultural sector;
- to involve master students in internal and external mobility;
- to improve the involvement of the students in the research activity;
- to involve more qualified practitioners in the study process.

II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'			X

Collected evidence:

- Self-evaluation report;
- Annexes to the SER;
- Internal regulations;
- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.

EKKA STATES

Template for Assessment Report

General comments:

SAUM plans its development both at the university and faculty levels. Unfortunately none of the available documents mentioned the goals, targets or actions on the development of the MA programme in *Patrimonial Law*. According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship in general support the achievement of the objectives of this study programme. However, the content of the MA programme demonstrates that the majority of disciplines/courses (9 from 11) deal with the different legal issues of property, not just Civil Law Issue. Considering that the Property rights is part of Civil Law, the title of the study programme is not consistent with its content. Also there is no clear programme's profile (the programme is too eclectic) and its connection with the main profile of the SAUM. The structure and content of the study programme is not internationally comparable. According to the information presented in the SER development the study programme takes into consideration the major trends and needs of the labour market. However, it is recommended to strengthen the connection of the MA programme in Property Law with the agricultural sector.

Currently the major drawbacks of the programme are the following:

- the study programme and its development are not in correspondence with the main requirements;
- the title of the programme is not consistent with its content;
- the content of the programme is too eclectic and does not reflect the special profile of the institution;
- the content and learning outcomes of several courses within the Master programme are not clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.

Commendations:

• The management and the teaching staff contribute to further development of the institution and strengthening of its market position.

Recommendations:

- to consider changing the title of the programme to "Legal protection of property" (as a variant "Legal protection of property in Agricultural sector", considering the main profile of the SAUM) or the establishing the master programme in the relevant fields more directly related to the Agricultural Sector, e.g. "Land and Agricultural Law", "Land, Agricultural and Environmental Law" (recommended option);
- to focus on legal issues of property protection in Agricultural sector in the titles and the content of the study disciplines;



- to define the actions in the development plans in more details, stipulate the timetable for the completion and persons responsible for the relevant action, and to establish the process of progress monitoring;
- to amend the syllabi with the information of the organization and supervision of the independent work of the students; to strengthen the relations of the institution with the potential employers, in particular, via establishment of partnership with the stakeholders from the agricultural sector.
- 1.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development period.

Comments:

The university plans its development both at the university and faculty levels. The mission, goals and main actions are in correspondence with the common requirements and modern trends in the field of Higher Education. According to the SER (p.1) the objectives of SAUM development strategies are reflected in the following internal acts:

- SAUM policy and objectives in quality, approved by Senate Decision of October 3, 2014;
- The institutional development plan for the period 2017.

The Institutional development plan consists of actions divided into four key areas: the improvement of the teaching activity, the increased competiveness of the agricultural science; the education of the young generation; the stimulation of the university extension. The following study program-related actions defined by the Institutional development plan should be stressed as well: SAUM aims e.g. to modernize and refer educational plans and curricula to the European conditions, to pay more attention to the involving methods of knowledge transmission, to introduce PowerPoint presentations as a mandatory tool to deliver all lectures, etc.

The Strategic Development plan of the Faculty of Cadastre and Law 2013-2017 is approved on the basis of the Institutional Development Plan. However, the majority of actions presented in the Faculty Development Plan are the same as defined already in the Institutional Development Plan. The goals reflected by both development plans were approved at the Meeting of the Department of Law on September 2nd 2013. The additional action plans are included in the development plans. Unfortunately the actions are defined in a rather descriptive manner. It is recommended to define the actions in more details, stipulate the timetable for the completion and persons responsible for the relevant action, and establish the process of progress monitoring.

However, none of the documents mentioned above defines the goals, targets or actions on the development of the MA programme under the



evaluation. Taking into account that the Institutional Development Plan mostly concentrates at the development of the university and agricultural sciences, it is highly recommended to specify the goals, tasks and actions of the Faculty of Cadastre and Law with the consideration of the needs of law studies and research.

Recommendations:

- to define the actions of the school in more details in the development plans, stipulate the timetable for the completion and persons responsible for the relevant actions, and establish the process of progress monitoring;
- to specify the goals, tasks and actions of the Faculty of Cadastre and Law with the consideration of the needs of law studies and research.

1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER and during the site visit the MA Programme in Patrimonial Law was authorized in 2011 by the Ministry of Agriculture of Moldova and the Ministry of Education of Moldova. The Department of Law of the Faculty of Cadastre and Law is responsible for the implementation of this programme. The study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.

1.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.

Comments:

There are different variations of the programme's title mentioned in the documents provided by the Institution. For instance, the title "Patrimonial Law" is used in the SER. However, the course syllabi mention the title "Property Law" for the Programme. It should be considered that there are different approaches to the understanding of the term "Patrimonial Law" and it is not very common term for the legislation and the doctrine of Civil Law. For instance, Patrimonial Law is defined like Law consisting of Law of obligations, Property Law and Intellectual Property Law

(https://books.google.com.ua/books?id=ho FBAAAQBAJ&pg=PA163&lpg=PA163&dq=patrimonial+law+consists+of&source=bl&ots=PyYmxz5Wa 8&sig=sSUrZ7xtvDNLO2c6Svr29K76tyY&hl=ru&sa=X&ei=fxQ5VZ3kM6T4ywPHsoGQCg&ved=0CDYQ6AEwAw#v=onepage&q=patrimonial%20law %20consists%20of&f=false), or Law of obligations, Property Law and Special Contracts (Civil Code of the Netherlands). The usage of this term in the legal practice in France presented in the SER demonstrates another approach: legal issues of planning the transfer of assets among family, preparing and settling estates in France and abroad, choosing marriage contracts and protecting family and relatives, dealing with the consequences of divorce on property in France or abroad, organising, structuring and managing your assets (http://www.cms-bfl.com/Patrimonial-Law). It should be mentioned that the Civil Code of the Republic of Moldova does not use the term "Patrimonial Law".

EKKA EKKA

Template for Assessment Report

The content of the MA programme demonstrates that the majority of disciplines/courses (9 from 11) deal with the different legal issues of property (e.g., Actual aspects of the Property Law, Legal Liability of Property – current issues, Actual problems of the Copyright Law, Practical approaches of the Inheritance Law, Legal and Cadastral Issues, Business Law in the Process of EU integration, Criminal Law protection of property, legal regulation of taxes and duties, Aspects of dealing with the real estate property). Thus, there are not only Property Law issues (Property rights issues as part of Civil Law) covered by the Programme. Considering the international experience the master programmes can cover legal issues refer to different fields of Law. However, such complex master programmes usually focus on some special areas/fields (for instance, fields of economy, like Agricultural Law, Energy Law, Maritime Law, etc.). Thus, the programme's profile (goals, target audience etc.) should be clearly understandable. It should be stressed that legal issues of property have peculiarities in different fields, in particular, depending of different types of property or other aspects (e.g., real estate property, private property, family property). However, the master programme under evaluation is too eclectic. Therefore, currently the title of the study programme is not consistent with its content.

Recommendations:

Taking into account the main profile of the University as a leader of preparation of high-qualified specialists for agricultural sector of Moldova and real opportunity to establish the competitive and nationally visible MA Programme in Law within this Institution the following options are recommended for the consideration:

- to change the title of the programme from "Property Law" to "Legal protection of property in Agricultural sector" and to focus on legal issues of property protection in Agricultural sector in the titles and the content of the study disciplines; however, such programme will be too narrow and will not provide an opportunity to use all strengths of such specialized institution as SAUM;
- to establish the master programme in Law directly related to the Agricultural Sector, e.g. "Land and Agricultural Law", "Land, Agricultural and Environmental Law", etc. The facilities of the university can provide the basis for the establishment of the contemporary master study programme in Agricultural Law based on the interdisciplinary approach. In this case it is recommended to consider the following international experience: LLM in Agricultural and Food Law implemented by the University of Arkansas School of Law (http://law.uark.edu/academics/llm/), Master of Food and Agriculture Law and Policy implemented by the Vermont Law School (http://www.vermontlaw.edu/academics/degrees/masters/master-of-food-and-agriculture-law-and-policy-(mfalp). Such master programme can cover, in particular, issues of legal protection of property in Agricultural sector. Therefore, the second variant is more recommended. Also the SAUM can benefit from the cooperation with national and international agricultural law associations, in particular, in the process of the development of the MA programme in Agricultural Law.
- 1.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the conduct of studies, including the student workload of



independent work and internship in general support achievement of the objectives of this study programme. However there are several suggestions on enhancement presented in this and other paragraphs of the evaluation report. In particular, according to the educational plan for this MA study programme there are 5 credits ECTS per each study discipline/course. There are 150 total hours that include 115 hours of independent work per each course. However, there is no information on the organization and supervision of the independent work of students in the syllabi. Therefore it is recommended to amend the syllabi with such provisions.

1.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.

Comments:

Based on the international experience it should be noticed that the establishment of wider MA programme in Civil Law is the most common practice at the foreign universities (e.g., Masters in Civil Law at the University of Leiden (http://en.mastersinleiden.nl/programmes/civiel-recht/nl/introduction), even if there are evidences of some specialized MA Programmes devoted to some parts of Civil Law (e.g., MA Programme in IP Law (at Uppsala University, Sweden (http://www.uu.se/en/admissions/master/selma/program/?pKod=JIM2N&lasar=15/16), MA Programme in Family Law (at Loyola University of Chicago (http://www.luc.edu/law/centers/childlaw/degrees/llm/index.html), etc. Therefore the MA programme devoted to a part of Civil Law – Property Rights issues – is consistent with the international experience and can be attractive for the applicants. However, the content of this programme is not devoted just to Civil Law issues. It covers different legal issues of property (e.g. referring to Civil Law, Criminal Law and Financial Law). However, the programme's profile is not clear, the programme is too eclectic (see comments to section 1.3 of this Report). Therefore the structure and content of the study programme is not internationally comparable.

General approach to formulation of the objectives and the learning outcomes of the MA study programme corresponds to the European Qualification Framework. However, the objectives and learning outcomes of the programme have to reflect the main focus of the programme – legal aspects of property. Currently the objectives of the programme formulated in the Explanatory note for the Master's Programme "Patrimonial Law" are very general and do not reflect the specific character of the programme. Thus, according to the Explanatory note mentioned above "the programme aims to develop Bachelor's degree holders and teach them to cope with complex problems of the civil law." However, the MA Programme is not a classical Master programme in Civil Law. The content partially refers to the specific issues of the Civil Law – Property rights issues. It is also stated that "master's students that complete the program will be prepared to work/for working in the field of private law, economic, monetary and trade policies in order to have necessary skills and knowledge so that they can apply them in practice directly in the Republic of Moldova". However, the MA Programme is not a multidisciplinary programme. The purpose and expected competences are formulated mostly for legal specialists in general with some emphasis on civil / private law issues.

Recommendations:

- to put the objectives and the learning outcomes of the Programme and its content into correspondence.



1.6. <u>REQUIREMENT</u> The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.

Comments:

In general the disciplines taught within the MA programme are logically arisen from the disciplines included in the Bachelor's study programme. However, additional clarification regarding some disciplines from the 1st circle of studies is needed. In particular, there are the following pears of disciplines that are quiet similar, considering the content of the syllabi analyzed during the site visit:

Tax Law (1st circle of studies) – Legal Regulation of taxes and duties (Master Programme)

Inheritance Law (1st circle of studies) – Practical approaches of the inheritance law (Master Programme)

Cadastrial Legislation (1st circle of studies) – Legal and cadastral Issues (Master Programme)

Recommendation:

To distinguish the current study programme more from the one at Bachelor level.

1.7. <u>REQUIREMENT</u>: Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.

Comments:

In general the disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession. However, it is recommended to make some changes in order to enhance the logical structure of the programme.

- 1) Taking into consideration that the majority of courses taught during the 1st semester are directly devoted to the substantive issues of Property Law, it is recommended to follow this approach and to move the discipline "Legal liability of property current issues" to the second semester;
- 2) Considering that the discipline "Legal and cadastral Law" (1st semester) is connected to the discipline "Aspects of dealing with the real estate property" (2st semester) it is recommended to move the latter to the 1st semester (and replace it with the discipline "Legal liability of property current issues" mentioned above.)
- 3) The discipline "Criminal investigation" seems to have a very limited connection to the MA Programme.

1.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER development of the study programme takes into consideration the major trends and needs of the labour market. However, taking into the consideration the main profile of the university as a leading higher education institution in the field of agricultural science, the establishment of this MA study programme by the Ministry of Agriculture, the participation of the representatives of the Ministry of Agriculture and Food Industry in the study process at the University, in particular, via participation in the External Evaluation



Committee and master thesis defence, it is recommended to strengthen the connection of the MA programme with the Agricultural sector. Currently issues related to the agricultural sector are included only in the syllabus through the course "Legal and Cadastral Issues" (the legal framework of the agricultural reform; the legal regime of agricultural lands). Recommendations on the development of the Master programme presented in previous sections of this Report. The usage of the Agricultural sector-oriented approach for the Master programme development will create wider opportunities for the market needs consideration and future employment of the graduates.

1.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.

Comments:

Study programme development at SAUM is a process which involves feedback from relevant stakeholders. According to the SER (p.7) the university involves students in the process of reviewing and improving educational plans and curricula (through surveys where the students can express their opinions or deliver their proposals). It is also stated that SAUM implements a feedback system through questionnaires and surveys evaluation sheets on teachers' activity. It is stated (SER, p.7) that the institution seeks for employers' opinion vis-à-vis their level of satisfaction on the quality of graduates and proposals to improve the programme. It is mentioned in the SER that this MA programme has also undergone the evaluation by such professional organizations as: Associated Office of Lawyers "Botanica" and Botanica Court. The representatives of the employers confirmed the participation in the process of programme development during the interview.

According to the SER some well-known and established personalities from the field of Law are involved in the process of the development of the study programme through their participation in the activity of the external quality assessment committees within SAUM. Such activity is regulated by the Regulation on the work of the External Assessment Committee on the quality of specialist training at State Agrarian University of Moldova approved by the General Assembly of the Committees (the Minutes Meeting nr.1 of March, 24, 2006). According to this Regulation the purpose of the Committee is to improve the specialist training at SAUM by consulting the administration of SAUM and faculties as a result of the special academic monitoring. It is stipulated that Committee proposals may be made mandatory based on the decision of the University Senate, Faculty Councils, the order of the Rector or the decree of the Dean.

However, the expert team was informed during the site visit that this Committee has its meeting only after the master theses defence. Therefore it is recommended to strengthen the relations of the Institution with potential employers, in particular, via establishment of partnership with the stakeholders from the agricultural sector.

1.10. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

Comments:



The members of the teaching staff are generally aware of the objectives of the study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives. According to the information presented in the SER (p.7) the syllabi development can be considered as a common process of giving input by the members of the teaching staff.

1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.

Comments:

The study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level. The expert team commends the adequate level of preparation of master theses. Both the research and practical components of the master theses are developed in accordance with the main requirements. Therefore the graduates of the Programme have necessary knowledge and skills to continue their research activity within doctoral studies in Law. According to the information presented in the SER, graduates of the master's degree programme offered by SAUM have free access to doctoral schools in the Republic of Moldova. Master's graduate will have access to all scientific specialties approved in the country, but nonetheless, the chosen scientific research directions will be determined mainly by the specialization obtained in the 2nd Cycle – Patrimonial Law, and namely the following two scientific specialties of the nomenclature provided by NCAA: General Theory of Law and Private Law.

2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	requirements	X	requirements

Collected evidence:

- Self-evaluation report;
- Annexes to the SER:
- Internal regulations;
- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.

General comments:

The study management is regulated by the internal regulations available publicly on the SAUM's website. Often up-to-date teaching materials are used within the education process, though in many cases there are also major drawbacks in materials. Full-time members of the teaching staff have developed their own materials on the disciplines, which are available also electronically to students. Modern and interactive teaching methods are applied. The teaching staff has got special training both concerning the teaching methodology as well as concerning counselling, monitoring and facilitating the learning processes. During the internship the trainee is supervised both by the supervisor from the university and by the supervisor form the internship partner. The meeting with the representatives of the potential employers indicated the efficiency of the internship. From time to time students are involved in some research activities, in particular, via participation in the student scientific circles, scientific conferences, and conference workshops. While the majority of students are already employed and they are not interested in the research activity, the promotion "for research" should get special attention from the staff and management.

The teaching and learning within the programme are partially corresponded to the main requirements. In particular, the study materials need to be updated; the syllabi shall include the clear information on the forms for the interim and final assessment.

Commendations:

- usage of the Moodle by the teaching staff and students of the MA programme;
- strong practical component of the programme.

Recommendations:

- to amend the syllabi with the recent references, as well as with references to the materials prepared by the teaching staff involved in the teaching process;
- to provide the base of internship directly in accordance with the topic/title of the master thesis;
- to consider the possibility of broadening the cooperation with the institutions from private agricultural sector;
- to amend the syllabi with the clear information on interim and final assessment forms;
- to include in the syllabus the requirements for the internship completion documents (e.g. daily notes, characteristics, reports, etc.) and to define the requirements on the final exam;
- to involve more qualified practitioners in the study process;
- to improve the involvement of the students in the research activities.



2.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER and according to the information received during the site visit, the study management is regulated by the internal regulations, they are publicly available on the SAUM's website and they support the achievement of learning outcomes. MA programme's ongoing schedules area also available on the faculty website. The feedback system is implemented. The results of the surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into consideration during the study management development.

2.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, teamwork-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.

Comments:

In general SAUM applies rather efficient teaching strategies and the school is oriented towards active learning of the students. As it is mentioned in paragraph 1.1 in the Institution Development Plan – the school is trying to introduce the PowerPoint presentations as a mandatory tool to deliver all lectures, to turn from traditional education to the formative one and to pay more attention to the involving methods of knowledge transmission. It is stated in the SER that the University's Board has established as a mandatory requirement the usage of modern methods of presentation, Prezi software etc. when teaching the courses (theoretical courses). For this purpose, all the departments have been provided with the necessary equipment.

According to the SER (p.8) "within the educational process modern and interactive teaching methods are applied. They are embodied in methodological works, guides and guidelines developed by the teachers. There is also some information on such methods in syllabi of the programme's disciplines (e.g. methods like interactive courses, debates, problematisation for lectures and case study methods for seminars, etc.)". It is also stated in the SER that the teaching staff is specially prepared in the field of teaching at the University level within the Pedagogical Laboratory of continuous training for SAUM teachers, which operates based on the decision of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Moldova. These courses involve methodological seminars focused on the discussions concerning the teaching methodology. In addition to training / teaching skills, these courses include counselling, monitoring and facilitating skills of the learning processes. The interview with the students of the MA programme proved the usage of modern teaching methods by the teaching staff of the programme. The expert team commends the usage of the *Moodle* throughout the school.

2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER up-to-date teaching materials are more or less used within the education process of the



study programme. According to the information presented in the SER the full-time members of the teaching staff have developed their own materials on the disciplines, which are available electronically to students. Also they use materials prepared by other authors. However, it was explored that the syllabi need to be improved regarding recent academic materials, as well as materials prepared by teaching staff involved in the teaching process. In particular:

- 1) Syllabus of the discipline "Actual problems of the Copyright Law":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - There are only 2 optional materials included in the list of references. It is recommended to add more;
 - The latest material is from year 2010; it is recommended to add more recent materials (monographs, manuals, scientific articles);
 - There are no references to the legislative acts except of the Law on the copyright law and associated rights.
- 2) Syllabus of the discipline "Business Law and Law of European integration":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - Does not include the list of recommended (optional) readings;
 - Does not include the list of legislative acts.
- 3) Syllabus of the discipline "Criminal protection of property":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - Does not include the list of recommended reading;
 - It is recommended to shorten the list of mandatory readings (27 positions);
 - The latest scientific/educational material is from year 2006;
 - It is recommended to add scientific articles.
- 4) Syllabus of the discipline "Legal and cadastral issues":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - The list of optional reading consists just of 2 positions; it is recommended to add more;
 - The list of legislative acts includes just 3 Laws; considering the content of the course there should be more important regulations that are recommended to add to the references;
 - The latest material is from year 2006.
- 5) Syllabus of the discipline "Legal liability of property current issues":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - Does not include the list of legislative acts;
 - The latest material is from year 2004.
- 6) Syllabus of the discipline "Legal regulation of taxes and duties":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - The list of mandatory readings does not include textbooks, monographs etc., just legislative acts (several laws; it is recommended to add regulations as well);



- The latest scientific / educational material is from year 2007.
- 7) Syllabus of the discipline "Practical approaches of the inheritance law":
 - Does not include the references to the materials prepared by the author;
 - The latest scientific / educational material is from year 2009.
- 2.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.

Comments:

Organization of internship is regulated by the legislative acts and internal regulations of the school. The requirements for the completion of the internship are determined and the instructions for conducting the internship are available. The internship (practical training) is included in the curriculum with 10 ECTS of 300 total hours in the second semester. The final assessment of internship is an exam. According to the information presented by the Institution, there is a Regulation on the practical training at State Agrarian University of Moldova approved by the Decision of the University Senate of 27 June 2014 (http://www.uasm.md/images/stories/acte_normative/Regulament_Practica_UASM.pdf) and practical methodological guide developed within the Tempus Project. Master degree students are approved to do internships by the Rector's Order, obtaining a special internship placement letter approved by the Dean. During the internship the trainee is supervised both by the supervisor from the university and by the supervisor form the internship partner. According to the Curriculum on Practical training elaborated by the teaching staff of the Department of Law the instructions for conducting the internship are available. The meeting with the representative of the potential employers conducted during the site visit proved the efficiency of the internship. The expert team supports the suggestions provided by the representatives of the potential employers that the base of internship will be directly connected to the topic/title of the master thesis in the future.

2.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.

Comments:

SAUM has a solid network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes. According to the information presented in the SER the university has a network of partner organizations that provide internship opportunities for Master degree students, in particular with State Enterprise "Cadastru"; Associated Office of Lawyers "Botanica", The Union of Lawyers of the Republic of Moldova, State Chancellery, Chisinau Office, "Truseni" Mayoralty, "Ecofin-Audit-Service" Ltd., Prison No4, "GSS Securitate" Ltd, etc. The expert team had the possibility to meet with the representatives of some of the partner organizations mentioned above, as well as with the representatives of the organizations that are going to establish partnership agreements with the SAUM in the future in order to provide the bases for students' internship within the MA programme. The expert team commends the



efforts of the management to broaden the network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for the students and recommends considering the possibilities of broadening the cooperation relations with the institutions from private agricultural sector as well.

2.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.

Comments:

Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed at SAUM in accordance with the normative legal acts and the internal regulations of the university. These requirements are stipulated in the Regulation on the organization and development of the educational process at SAUM based on the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS), the Institutional Regulation on the assessment of students' learning outcomes at SAUM (http://www.uasm.md/en/faculties/cadastre-and-law). There are various assessment forms available:

- ongoing assessment (tests, including computer-based tests, reports, case studies, annual thesis/project, current results etc.) and
- final assessment (reports on internship, exams, master theses).

The assessment results are regularly discussed at the meetings of the Department and the Faculty Council.

Remarks and recommendations:

According to the information presented in the SER the assessment of learning outcomes is also implemented while using computer assisted tests. However, none of the syllabi mentioned below included the information on such form of evaluation. The syllabi of these courses do not include comprehensive information on the assessment of learning outcomes of students. In particular:

- 1) Syllabus of the discipline "Actual problems of the Copyright Law":
 - Defines the written exam with 100% as a final assessment, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment;
- 2) Syllabus of the discipline "Business Law and Law of European integration":
 - Defines the oral exam as a final assessment (70%), 30% for seminars, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment;
- 3) Syllabus of the discipline "Criminal protection of property":
 - Defines the written exam with 100 % as a final assessment, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment;
- 4) Syllabus of the discipline "Legal and cadastral issues":
 - Defines the written exam with 100 % as a final assessment, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment;



- 5) Syllabus of the discipline "Legal liability of property current issues":
 - Defines the oral exam with 100 % as a final assessment, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment;
- 6) Syllabus of the discipline "Legal regulation of taxes and duties":
 - Defines the written exam with 100 % as a final assessment, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment;
- 7) Syllabus of the discipline "Practical approaches of the inheritance law":
 - Defines the written exam with 100 % as a final assessment, however, there is no information available on the forms of interim assessments, as well as on exam requirements / criteria of assessment.

Considering the suggested points above it is recommended to amend the syllabi with the clear information on interim and final assessment forms.

The final assessment of the internship provided within the relevant syllabus is clear and includes:

- report writing and defence of the practical training (20 hours);
- daily notes during the practical training, signed by the professional supervisor;
- acceptance of the characteristics regarding the practical training;
- writing the report on the practical training;
- final exam.

Recommendations:

- to include into the syllabus also requirements for the internship completion documents (e.g., daily notes, characteristics, reports) and define the requirements on the final exam;
- to establish the system of monitoring of the residual knowledge of students In order to avoid possible overassessment of students' progress.

2.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.

Comments:

In accordance with p. 48 of the Regulation on the organization of Master degree studies, the students with at least 2 years proven practical experience in the given field will be assigned with the necessary number of credits based on the assessment of competences and recognition of the practical experience by the specialized department/departments. Therefore there is a legal basis for the recognition of the prior learning and work experience. Currently there is no such a system in place that recognizes prior learning and work experience.





Recommendations:

- to establish the system of recognition of prior learning and work experiences based on the legislative provision mentioned above.

2.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are undertaken.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER and obtained during the site visit the systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is conducted and improvement measures are undertaken. During the discussions on the results of the examination period there are considered the encountered problems and identified the appropriate solutions in order to improve the situation. Also, the results of the examination period for the 1st and 2nd semesters are discussed at the end of each semester at the Cadastre and Law Faculty Council. The solutions for improving the situation are examined and included in the Decision of the Faculty Council.

2.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is high.

Comments:

According to the information presented in the SER students are involved in research activities, in particular, via participation in the student scientific circles, scientific conferences, and conference workshops. The best three reports are published in a special collection called Theses of the Scientific Conference of undergraduate and master degree students which represents an important stimulus for students. Therefore, the Institution encourages the research activity of students. However, the interview with the students demonstrated the necessity of the improvement of the involving the students in the research activity. While the majority of students are already employed and they are not interested in the research activity, this promotion "for research" should get special attention from the staff and management.

According to the study plan of the MA Programme the master thesis is a form of final assessment with 30 ECTS. The Guide on development and defence of master theses was prepared within the Tempus project (2010). It is stated in the SER that in order to detect and prevent fraud, it has been implemented the system of the preliminary defence of master's theses by initial and anti-plagiarism checking software. The plagiarism of master's theses is punished by cancelling the theses. The master theses evaluated during the site visit are corresponded to the main requirements, in particular, due to the adequate organization of the supervision conducted by the teaching staff.



3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'			X

Collected evidence:

- Self-evaluation report;
- Annexes of SER;
- Internal regulations;
- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Interviews with the management, teaching staff, students, graduates, employers.

General comments:

The number of full-time teaching staff of the programme and their qualifications is not sufficient to achieve the learning outcomes of the programme. Currently the teaching staff is very limited, as there are only 5 full-time members for the whole programme. The existing members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and they tend to improve their teaching methods constantly. The university provides limited financial support to every faculty member for making business trips within the country or abroad for the purpose of professional development. However, this opportunity is provided only once in every five years. Thus, the theoretical possibilities are there, but in reality not much could be undertaken. There is no evidence of visiting teaching staff members, including those from foreign higher education institutions. Currently the members of teaching staff of the programme do not develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions nor participate in international networks. Teaching staff are involved in some national research projects and they participate in forums, but there is no evidence of their international involvement. The current publications are too country-oriented and there are few international papers, rendering the overall academic contribution unbalanced. The management of the faculty could not prove any sustainable academic policy in providing support to the academic staff in their research activities. The research as such is not clearly defined and the faculty members are not guided to the international standard-based research world.

Commendations:

• Despite the very limited number of the teaching staff, the general feedback to teaching (content, methods, supervisions, etc.) was very positive.

Recommendations:

• The system of self-development of teaching staff exists in theory, but it needs strategic budgeting and a well-developed motivation



scheme for faculty members elaborated at the managerial level.

- The teaching staff should improve their knowledge of and find international self-improving opportunities to guarantee their competitiveness within the university and also at national level.
- The programme leaders should plan and monitor research activities as a part of strategy, not dependent on the particular individuals working in the faculty. Furthermore, the establishment of individual career model should be considered.
- The programme leaders should develop academic concept for combining the research and teaching activities to improve the level of the master programme.
- The programme leaders should use university international cooperation agreements to involve the faculty members to international research networks.
- The management of the programme should take steps in motivating the faculty members to become proactive in conducting international research, to raise the quality of teaching, as well as positioning the programme more strongly within the university.

One method for raising the motivation of faculty members and students to be engaged in international networks is to encourage them to improve their English language skills.

3.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.

Comments:

Although the teaching staff is very limited, all of the 5 full-time members hold a PhD degree and all members are motivated to improve the quality of the master programme. General qualification of full-time teaching staff is sufficient for the programme.

3.2. <u>REQUIREMENT</u>: Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.

Comments:

Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, seems to be appropriate for the sustainability of the programme at SAUM. The age of the staff is sufficiently diverse (between ages 28-58 – accordingly 28, 39, 40, 47, 56 Annex 12 of the SER).

3.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study

programmes at MA level.

Comments:

The number of full-time teaching staff of the programme does not comply with the learning outcomes of the curriculum. Annexes 11 and 18 include information stating that the qualified teaching staff can manage teaching of the students in this master programme. Still, the total number of the teaching staff cannot be considered as sufficient for quality implementation and improvement of the programme. Corresponding to positive feedback given by the students the current system could be considered more or less as "functioning". For achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme still much more emphasis should be put on attracting new additional staff.

Still the major challenge of the programme is a very small number of teaching staff members responsible for the programme. The distribution of the work-load among the teaching staff is explained in details by SER and its Annex 18, ensuring logical implementation of the programme.

Recommendation:

- To increase the number of qualified full time teaching staff.

3.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching methods.

Comments:

The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and they tend to improve their teaching methods constantly. Most of the members of teaching staff have solid experience both in teaching and in practice in the respective fields. All of them could be considered as recognised professionals in the field. The university provides limited financial support to every faculty member for making business trips within the country or abroad for the purpose of professional development. However, this opportunity is provided only once in every five years.

3.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.

Comments:

The basic principles of the staff development system are in place. The members of the teaching staff have very limited opportunities for self-improvement as described above. It is mentioned in the SER, that the university requires academic staff to be self-developed. However, there is no clear evidence on how the process of monitoring of self-development is organised. By the SER, USAM supports each faculty member to conduct business trip to improve him- or herself once in every five years. Also the university is providing opportunities for improving teaching staff's English language skills. The University has the Code of Education and a University Chart which provide the rights for professional development and access to self-development opportunities. However, in reality these opportunities are not supported by budgeting or they are supported on a very limited level. Thus, the theoretical possibilities are there, but in reality not much could be undertaken.



Recommendations:

- to improve the knowledge of teaching staff and find international self-improving opportunities to guarantee their competitiveness within the university and also at national level;
- to develop academic concept for combining the research and teaching activities to improve the level of the master programme.

3.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.

Comments:

There is no evidence of visiting teaching staff members, including those from foreign higher education institutions. There have been only few alumni members invited to the meetings with the students but it cannot be considered as systematic and sustainable involvement of visiting academic staff or practitioners into the programme. This fact is also mentioned by the SER on their "activities planned for improvement" and "areas that could be improved" (p. 14).

Recommendation:

- to invite foreign visiting professors to enrich the study environment in the master programme.

3.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.

Comments:

Currently the members of teaching staff of the programme do not develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions nor participate actively in international networks. Rather few teachers occasionally happen to visit some foreign institutions/ happen to be abroad. These are rather random situations and these visits do not take place due to special conditions at SAUM, but mostly based on personal contacts. The international research has not been a priority for the teaching staff.

The lack of strong existing concept for teaching and research skills development is caused by the fact that the programme is rather young and the development of the vision takes time. Regardless, it cannot be a justification for a programme that has existed for several years. The limitations of didactic skills of the teaching staff is proved by the fact that there is anti-plagiarism policy but no clear understanding of how to frame plagiarism that causes the sanctions for the students. The fact that faculty members are not involved in international networks further influences the attitude of the students who are not aware of international mobility programmes – the latter is based on the discussions with the students upon meeting them.

The few internships of teaching staff in Romania and Russia are not sufficient evidence of continuous and sustainable strategy for developing



the skills of academic staff at foreign higher education institutions.

Recommendations:

- to find more resources for staff development (including training abroad, time for research and publishing, etc.).

3.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.

Comments:

Teaching staff are involved in some national research projects and they participate in forums, but there is no evidence of their international involvement. The current publications are too country-oriented and there are few international papers, rendering the overall academic contribution unbalanced. Although the research topics are selected individually (Annex 20) and the academic freedom is appreciated, the lack of strategic planning for research by faculty management demotivates the faculty members to aspire for high-level research goals to enrich the teaching environment within the particular programme. The student conferences cannot be regarded as strong evidence of conducting research by the staff members. The overall ideology of the programme leaders is very practice-oriented and the relevance of the research has not been prioritised.

Recommendation:

- to focus more on promoting research activities and research skills among the staff.
- to motivate the faculty members to become proactive in conducting international research, to raise the quality of teaching, as well as positioning the programme more strongly within the university.

3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

Comments:

Pursuant to SER, the research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored effectively. The evaluation committee is familiar with individual research plans, but they did not witness "effective planning or monitoring". In addition, the requirements for research and strategic goals are not clear and indirectly derivable only from the regulation that refers to the ranking of academic positions. This is the individual choice, whether to make academic career — the programme leaders should plan and monitor research activities as a part of strategy, not dependent on the particular individuals working in the faculty. Furthermore, the establishment of individual career model should be considered. The management of the faculty could not prove any sustainable academic policy in providing support to the academic staff in their research activities. The research as such is not clearly defined and the faculty members are not guided to the international standard-based research world. The statement of management team about unwillingness of the teaching staff to conduct research in the field of patrimonial law cannot be a reason for giving up the research in the field of master programme initiatives at the faculty level. In addition, also the argument



that "...monitoring of the learning process at master level is not relevant because the students at master level are independent adults and responsible for themselves" is not supporting the academic excellence of the programme.

Recommendation:

- To plan and monitor research activities as a part of strategy, not dependent on the particular individuals working in the faculty. Furthermore, the establishment of individual career model should be considered.

4. STUDENTS	conforms to	partially conforms to	does not conform to
	requirements	requirements	requirements
mark with 'X'		X	

Collected evidence:

- Self-evaluation report;
- Annexes of SER;
- Internal regulations;
- Additional documents received during the site visit (e.g. BA and MA diploma of a student which doesn't have BA in law; bilateral agreements with other institutions, register of monitoring the graduates' career, etc.)
- Interviews with the students and graduates.

General comments:

The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. SAUM offers opportunity for students to participate in different mobility programs like ERASMUS MUNDUS, CEEPUS, ERASMUS +, TEMPUS, FP 7, Work and Travel, etc. Unfortunately the number of students participating in international mobility programmes is rather low. No one from the patrimonial law specialty has ever participated in any international mobility programmes. Students at SAUM are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the university. The students have possibility to elect and be elected as student representatives in the governing structures of the faculty, university, other governing bodies and committees created within faculties and university.

For the last 2 years the university has applied the system for prevention of academic fraud. The current system is applied only for final theses in order to be admitted for the defence. The record of graduates' employment in the labour market is produced through the Service of Career



Guidance and Counselling, as well as through the students' own departments that keep a special register which records the following information: workplace, function, place of residence, contact telephone of the graduate. The competitiveness of the graduates of the study programme is not too well demonstrated by employment rate. From 66 students which graduated the Patrimonial Law programme during the period 2011-2014 only 26 are working based on the obtained qualification.

Commendations:

- The school is providing opportunities for participation in international mobility programmes;
- Students are involved in the decision-making process;
- The school has a valid register for monitoring the graduates' employment.

Recommendations:

- to improve the actual capacity of the Department of Guidance and Career Counselling;
- to involve master students from the Patrimonial Law in internal and external mobility;
- to promote students' representation schemes among students;
- to extend the possibilities of antiplagiarism systems;
- to increase the employment rate based on obtained qualification;
- to monitor more closely legal requirements for graduation.

4.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.

Comments:

The admission of students at masters' studies is conducted based on methodology, approved by Government Decision No.1455 dated December 24, 2007 (http://lex.justice.md/viewdoc.php?action=view&view=doc&id=326588&lang=2) and implemented according to the SAUM methodology, giving equal opportunities to all candidates. The candidates for the master's degree studies in Patrimonial Law may be the holders of license degree or master's degree diplomas in the same field or related field (6 from 8 students whom the expert committee met were from another field than law). The applicants are passing, in written form, a complex test at field subject (civil law) and are passing the verification tests of language skills at one of the foreign languages and computer skills.



Meanwhile, according to the Government Decision No. 477 dated June 6, 2014 on plans of admission in secondary education, vocational and higher education for the 2014 degree year and completing the Nomenclature on occupations (professions) for training and preparation teaching in secondary vocational education (http://lex.justice.md/viewdoc.php?action=view&view=doc&id=353536&lang=2), the SAUM doesn't have possibility to offer studies in law at master's level financed from the state budget. In this context all master's students in Patrimonial Law pay study fees.

4.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.

Comments:

According to the information provided during the interview process with the academic staff (including Rector and Dean), there is the Department of Guidance and Career Counselling (DGCC) operating within the university. This unit is responsible for offering support to the students concerning studies as well as career and psychological counselling. Before establishing/reorganization of this unit, DGCC had been responsible only for recruiting new students. The additional tasks added to the responsibilities of DGCC are unfortunately known by the Head of the DGCC/ Rector, but not by other colleagues or students. No one of the interviewed students have had heard about DGCC and the possible support/ counselling provided by this department. At the same time all of the students knew the Head of DGCC, but in the capacity of "someone from the school". It would be useful for the university to focus more on implementation of the tasks for what purposes the department was reorganized and to share respective information among the students. Regarding the study process, all the teachers offer support to their students in the study process and have a schedule of the consultations days.

Recommendation:

- to improve the actual capacity of the Department of Guidance and Career Counselling.

4.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.

Comments:

The University applies all the normative acts regarding the internal and external mobility and the students have possibility to move from one university to another university. SAUM offers opportunity for students to participate in different mobility programs like ERASMUS MUNDUS, CEEPUS, ERASMUS +, TEMPUS, FP 7, Work and Travel, etc. In order to organize internships for undergraduate, master's and PhD students, the



University has several agreements between SAUM and other higher education institutions, research institutions and specialized foreign enterprises. Based on this, the University provides the possibility for the students to participate in mobility programmes by doing internships and/or studying for a semester / a year in universities in Belgium, Great Britain, Czech Republic, Germany, Italy, Finland, France, Poland, Portugal, Spain, etc.

Basic information regarding mobility opportunities are available on the SAUM webpage (http://www.uasm.md/ro/relatii-internationale-si-surse-de-finantare/290-programe-internationale, http://www.uasm.md/ro/relatii-internationale/cooperarea-si-parteneriatul-international-a-uasm/280-acorduri-de-cooperare-internationala). The university is also organizing information days about study possibilities for all students. These events taking place regularly were also confirmed by the students. Still, the general knowledge level about mobility opportunities is not high enough.

4.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in student mobility is stable or growing.

Comments:

The number of students participating in international mobility programmes is rather low. In the academic year 2012-2013, 6 masters' degree students and teachers of SAUM have won academic mobility in the popular EU programme Erasmus Mundus / Erasmus +. In the academic year 2013-2014, altogether 13 undergraduate, masters' degree and PhD took advantage of the scheme. In 2014 the number of beneficiaries of the academic mobility programmes increased a bit more, but considering the size of SAUM the number is still very limited. For the University it is financially very beneficial to be part of the programmes bringing in additional resources in the amount of 45800 EUR in 2012-2013 and 140100 EUR in 2013-2014.

Even when the university is providing opportunities to participate in mobility programmes, unfortunately no one from the patrimonial law specialty have participated in any international mobility programmes. It would be recommended for the university to find more opportunities for promoting international mobility programmes to guarantee involvement of students from the patrimonial law specialty as well with the purpose to enrich their study experience.

Recommendation:

to involve more master students from the Patrimonial Law in internal and external mobility.

4.5. REQUIREMENT: Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education



institution.

Comments:

Students at SAUM are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the university. The students have possibility to elect and be elected as student representatives in the governing structures of the faculty, university, other governing bodies and committees created within faculties and university. Based on this, the students have their representatives at the level of the Senate of University (25 % of the senate is compound by the students) and the level of decision making bodies of Faculty (15 % are students) from whom at least one student is involved from each specialty (including patrimonial law). They participate in the following activities: e.g. elaboration and implementation of student development projects/programs; improvement of regulations, distribution of scholarships; distribution of accommodation places in dormitories; organization of various scientific, cultural and sport events, etc.

Unfortunately the students don't know who exactly represents their voice in these bodies. Only some students participating in the interview with the expert committee knew student representatives of some of the decision making bodies. It is very important that the ones not personally participating in the decision making processes still know about their representatives, the activities of these bodies and have periodical communication with them. It is recommended for the school and for the students themselves to promote the possibilities to be involved and to follow decision making processes within the school.

4.6. REQUIREMENT: A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.

Comments:

For the last 2 years the university has applied the system for prevention of academic fraud. The current system is applied only for final theses in order to be admitted for the defence. All theses must be passed to the evaluation committee through the antiplagiarism system. One weakness of the system is that it doesn't compare theses with other books or journals and it also doesn't check international sources written in other languages (English, French, etc.). Even if the system does not check too many sources (no internet sources, articles, books, grey papers, etc.), it is having a very strong psychological effect on the students who all know about the system and who are "positively afraid of it". If the case of plagiarism is proved, the committee sanctions the student by warning and by giving a lower grade. In more serious cases or in the case of repeated plagiarism the grade will be decreased proportionally up to the cancellation of the theses (in practice the university has until now never taken such extreme measures like cancellation of the thesis). For the future development it would be even more useful if the system could be extended so that variety of the sources to compare with would be higher (books, journals, student works, etc.).

4.7. REQUIREMENT: Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates' employment and is monitoring the



evolution of graduates' career.

Comments:

The University as well as the Faculty and Department, they all have a mechanism of tracking graduate employment statistics and career development. The record of graduates' employment in the labour market is produced through the Service of Career Guidance and Counselling, as well as through the students' own departments that keep a special register which records the following information: workplace, function, place of residence, contact telephone of the graduate. In order to monitor the professional evolution and career development of graduates, the department annually updates the register contacting the students directly or by phone.

4.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the programme.

Comments:

The competitiveness of the graduates of the study programme is not well demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification. From 66 students which graduated the Patrimonial Law programme during the period 2011-2014 only 26 are working based on the obtained qualification. The highest level of employment based on the obtained qualification was in 2013 (68 %), the lowest level was in 2011 (8.33 %). In 2014 the rate was 47 % being lower than in 2013. 19 students from 66 are employed in other areas than studied and 7 are unemployed, 14 work abroad. The latter figure could be considered also as a positive sign of the programme and of competitive graduates.

Recommendations:

- to increase the employment rate based on obtained qualification.
- 4.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.

Comments:

In order to monitor academic progress school's official policies provide the following measures: permanent control of compliance with the regulations of the University and the legal provisions related to the accumulation of the required number of credits at each stage of the study process; identifying the students who obtain insufficient success and providing them with individual work; periodic checking of academic groups tally sheets by the deans and representatives of the Department of Studies; ensuring the transparency of evaluation results by discussing them during a public meeting with students, within faculty meetings and meetings of the Senate Bureau.



At the same time not all of the students who have graduated from the programme meet the legal requirements. Taking into consideration that the university accepts into the master programme in patrimonial law also students from other specialties than law, the evidences provided by the Faculty (BA diploma and MA diploma of a concrete student) shows a big irregularity on this issue. According to the art. 39 of the Government Decision no. 1455 on 24 December 2007 on approving the Regulation on the organization of higher master studies, cycle II (http://lex.justice.md/viewdoc.php?action=view&view=doc&id=326588&lang=2), duration of master studies will be set so that the overall cumulative duration of studies in cycles I and II is at least 300 transferable study credits. In the case of this certain student being graduated from BA in Ecology (which according to the Nomenclature of professional training areas and specialties for training in higher education institutions (http://lex.justice.md/viewdoc.php?action=view&view=doc&id=312972&lang=2) has only 180 credits) and being graduate of the patrimonial law programme he has cumulatively gained only 270 credits (30 credits less than regulated by the Government Decision mentioned above).

Regarding the 15% drop-out rate, the management of the programme and the faculty don't consider it a problem at all and they qualify it as a "normal phenomenon". Even if it might not be a major problem, some reflections about the situation and about possible remedies might be still useful both for the programme quality and the future graduates.

Recommendations:

- to monitor more closely legal requirements for graduation.

5. RESOURCES	conforms to	partially conforms to	does not conform to
	requirements	requirements	requirements
mark with 'X'		X	

Collected evidence:

- Self-evaluation report;
- Annexes of SER;
- Additional documents received during the site visit;
- Site visit tour to the library and facilities, including study rooms;
- Interviews with management, teaching staff and students.



General comments:

The financial resources of SAUM on university level are adequate for conducting studies throughout the university, but the financial resources on departmental/programme level are inadequate. The support mechanisms of the particular master programme at the university managerial level are neither visible nor clearly articulated. This particular master programme has a limited number of students but according to the SER and data presented, the number is slightly increasing. The faculty has 11 lecture and seminar rooms. Every classroom is equipped with presentation technologies. The working environment for the academic staff could be improved but meets the requirements. The ICTs are available for students. The university uses the *Moodle* system. The school's library supports the conduct of studies on limited level. The literature in the field of patrimonial law is very limited. There are only very few international textbooks translated into Russian or Romanian languages.

Commendations:

- SAUM as a solid academic institution is financially sustainable;
- Physical study rooms meet the requirements for the studies.

Recommendations:

The university should pay more attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, investing in national databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources.

5.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.

Comments:

The financial resources of SAUM on university level are adequate for conducting studies throughout the university, but the financial resources on departmental/programme level are inadequate. Although SER presents optimistic numbers indicating the increase of financial resources (p. 19) it is only referring to the financial situation on the university level. The overall assessment cannot be positive as the programme Patrimonial Law has no clear allocation of resources. The feedback given by faculty members and management does not support a vision of a sustainable and positively transforming centre for research and studies. The support mechanisms of the particular master programme at the university managerial level are neither visible nor clearly articulated.

Recommendation:

- to have a clear and adequate budget for the programme/department established by the University management, according to their



procedure.

5.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.

Comments:

This particular master programme has a limited number of students but according to the SER and data presented, the number is slightly increasing. The correlation between admitted and graduated students is balanced (2012-2014 accordingly equal number of students 19/16/19). Taking into account the aforementioned, the financial resources deriving from the number of students are rather stable. Still, even if the budget of SAUM indicates sustainability in the last three to five years, there is not enough evidence of enough available resources for the programme. According to tables 5.1.1. and 5.1.2. of SER, the budgetary resources are increasing, however, the figures are insufficient to support the programme considering the number of students, teaching staff, the situation of the library as well as non-diversification of budgetary resources.

Recommendation:

- To find additional resources for the programme in order to ensure long-term sustainability.
- 5.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).

Comments:

As witnessed by the evaluation team, the State Agrarian University has adequate capacity for conducting the studies for the students enrolled to the particular programme. The faculty has 11 lecture and seminar rooms. Every classroom is equipped with presentation technologies. The working environment for the academic staff could be improved but meets the requirements. The faculty strategy includes the goals related to modernisation of teaching methods, e.g., using IT techniques for every course.

5.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by up-to-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.

Comments:

Studies and other academic activities are supported by information technology solutions. The computer classes are equipped by hardware and software corresponding to the current needs of the students. The ICTs are available for students. The university uses the *Moodle* system. Even when the system does not yet support the e-studies, it still provides the opportunity for receiving the information concerning the study



programmes, materials and deadlines via the Internet.

5.5. REQUIREMENT: The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.

Comments:

There are dormitories and medical service available for the students, including the students of the given master programme.

5.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.

Comments:

The school's library supports the conduct of studies on limited level. The literature in the field of patrimonial law is very limited. There are only very few international textbooks translated into Russian or Romanian languages. Electronic library includes merely databases that are anyway publicly available (e.g. Jurist and MOLD-Lex). International databases are missing, except Agora, which, however, does not include much legal literature. Based on the feedback from the students and alumni this database is almost never used. The library includes the European information centre which, however, based on the discussions with the students, is not widely used.

Recommendation:

- to pay more attention to the modern sources of information when replenishing the library, to invest in national databases, training the librarians, teaching staff and students of being able and motivated to use the resources.