



## Accreditation of Study Programmes Assessment Report

Institution: "STEFAN CEL MARE" ACADEMY OF MIA

Study programme(s): Criminal Law

**Assessment committee:** 

Stephen C. Shute (chair)	Professor, School of Law, Politics and Sociology,
	University of Sussex; United Kingdom
Andres Parmas	Judge in the criminal chamber, Tallinn Circuit Court,
	PhD student; Estonia
Stela Buiuc	Deputy director, Centre of Legal Approximation,
	Ministry of Justice; Moldova
Mihai Floroiu	Professor, Faculty of Legal, Social and Political Sciences,
	"Dunarea de Jos" University of Galati; Romania

**Coordinator:** Birgit Vilgats

Dates of the assessment visit: 04.05-05.05.2015

 $\label{preliminary report to EKKA: 18.06.2015.} Assessment committee sent the preliminary report to EKKA: 18.06.2015.$ 

Assessment committee received the comments of the institution under accreditation: 06.07.2015.

Assessment committee approved the final version of component assessment with 4 votes in favour and 0 votes against.

Date: 20.07.2015.



#### I Summary of the assessment (mark with 'X'):

	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
Study programme and its development	х		
Teaching and learning	х		
Teaching staff		X	
Students		X	
Resources	X		

#### **Comments:**

National Police Academy "Stefan cel Mare" of MIA with University status was founded in 1990 to train highly qualified staff for the Internal Affairs Bodies of the country. Faculty of Police Sciences has two domains of professional training: a) general domain of study "Law", professional training domain "Law", specialty "Law" and "Law. Border security"; b) general domain of study "Protection, safety and security" professional training domain "Protection, safety and security", specialty "Civil security and public order".

The Expert Team's (ET) comments below with regard to the five assessment criteria are mainly common to all programmes the Team evaluated, and this because there were no significant issues that needed to be pointed out in the reports for each programme separately.

The SER was thorough and helpful. However, the ET's work was hampered by the fact that, apart from the mandatory annexes, the other annexes in the report were not available in English language version. Furthermore, some of the annexes were incomplete or were of no obvious relevance. For example Annex 3 only presented some of the relevant disciplines in the programme. Nonetheless, on request during the site visit all the relevant material was made available for ET.

#### **Commendations:**

- 1. The compulsory internship was well organized through the Ministry of Internal Affairs.
- 2. 100% of those admitted to programme graduated which is highly commendable.
- 3. The graduates' employment rate is above 90%.

# EKKA

#### **Template for Assessment Report**

#### **Recommendations:**

- 1. The Academy should take steps to make sure that all relevant information about programmes is available and accessible on its website.
- 2. The Academy should ensure that ECTS related information in the Diploma Supplement corresponds exactly to the number of ECTS of the study programme.
- 3. The Academy should ensure that MA students are more actively engaged in research activities in the Academy.
- 4. The Academy should involve its students more to improve the quality of the content and delivery of programme.
- 5. The Academy should review the content of all three MA programmes in Law under accreditation to ensure that they contain the most relevant and contemporary courses so as to serve the needs of Moldova as the country continues to develop.
- 6. The Academy should further develop the mechanism it has in place for career development of its students.
- 7. The Academy should strengthen the processes and procedures that it has in place for detection of plagiarism and academic fraud.
- 8. Greater opportunities need to be made available both to staff and to students for engagement with universities and relevant employers in other countries.



#### II Assessment areas and requirements

1. STUDY PROGRAMME AND ITS DEVELOPMENT	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	X		

#### Collected evidence:

- Development plan of the Academy Stefan cel Mare 2014-2016 (Annex 7)
- Activity plans of the Departments (during on-site visit)
- Order of Moldovan Ministry of Education No. 389 from May 30, 2008 on authorization of the "Stefan cel Mare" Academy to carry out the training at specified MA programmes
- BA study programme in Law (Annex 2)
- MA study programme in Criminal Law (Annex 1)
- The syllabi of courses belonging to the assessed Programme (Annex 3)
- Information on PhD studies within the academy (http://academy.police.md/doctorat ro)
- Documents on the organisation of Internship
- Grading sheet from academic year 2014/15
- Documentation on the admission quotas
- Documentation on employment of the graduates of the assessed programme
- Explanatory Note regarding the study outcomes
- Charter of the Academy
- Information obtained during the on-site visit and available in the SER

#### **General comments:**

The study programme has been authorized by the Ministry of Education and functions in accordance with the national and internal regulations. The objectives and the learning outcomes of the master study programme are generally coherent with EQF, its structure and content being comparable with the study programmes of some universities from Romania. However, those are not the best references and more study programmes of foreign high rank universities shall be considered. The real level of students' scientific research competences raises concern and more efforts are needed to improve the research skills, including a specialised course within the study programme.

#### Commendations:

1. The development and the action plans have to take into account the plans of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and therefore they are considering the ongoing reforms and needs of the employer.



#### Recommendations:

- 1. More tailored actions plans for the implementation of the Strategic Development Plans' objectives and a system in place for analysing the degree of implementation to ensure that it is taken into account for the future planning.
- 2. Ensure that the content of the MA programme corresponds to its title and that there is a clear and even understanding of the purpose and the expected learning outcomes of the MA programme among students, teachers and employers.
- 3. Improve the international comparability of the study programme by analysing similar study programmes of other foreign high rank universities.
- 4. Enhance students' research skills and introduce a specialized course for that purpose.
- 1.1. REQUIREMENT: A higher education institution regularly plans its development: the higher education institution has a development plan accompanied by an action plan to ensure sustainability both in the institution and in a given study programme. The implementation of the action plan is analysed and forms the basis for planning of the next development period.

#### Comments:

The Academy systematically plans its activity and adopts strategic development documents for medium and long term (2-4 years) and annual actions plans. The current strategic development plan is based on the strategic development plan of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and covers the period 2014-2016. The representatives of the academy explained that the short period of the strategic plan – 2 years is due to the reform process of the Ministry of Internal Affairs that took place recently and in order catch up with the reform it was necessary to adopt a short period, targeted development plan. The development and the action plans have to take into account the plans of the Ministry of Internal Affairs.

### 1.2. REQUIREMENT: A study programme is authorized and functions in accordance with the normative acts in force.

#### Comments:

The study programme has been authorizes by the Ministry of Education (Order no 389 of 30 May 2008) and functions in accordance with the national legislation.

In the SER it is stipulated that the study programme functions according to specific regulations, *i.e.* decrees of the Ministry of Education and of Internal Affairs and the study programme under evaluation was duly authorized by the Ministry of Education, the curriculum being approved by the Senate of the Academy in 2014, after different modifications. All modifications have been approved by the Senate.

## 1.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The title of a study programme is consistent with its content.

#### Comments:

Based on the SER and the documents provided by the Academy (such as the syllabi of courses) the title of the study programme is consistent with its content.

1.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The conduct of studies, including the student workload of independent work and internship, support achievement of the objectives of the study programme.

#### Comments:



From the analysis of the curriculum and the Explanatory Note, but also from the information provided during the site visit one can state that the courses, the independent work and the internship mostly support achievement of the develop specific skills and competences in relation to the study domain, the study outcomes in general and the overall objectives of the study programme.

1.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The objectives and learning outcomes of a study programme are in coherence with the European Qualifications Framework (EQF). The structure and content of the study programme is internationally comparable.

#### Comments:

The objectives and the learning outcomes of the master study programme is generally coherent with EQF, its structure and content being comparable with some study programmes of certain Romanian universities. However, the study programmes of the Romanian universities which were chosen for comparison do not seem to be coming from very prestigious institutions, so the references could be improved (including universities from countries other than Romania). The academy might consider improving the content of its master study programme by introducing more specialised courses as suggested during the interviews by students and employers (to cover, for example economic, cyber, tax offences, etc.) At the same time, the team is concerned by the real level of the scientific research competences of the students and graduates. The main reasons for concerns reside in the quality of the master theses in terms of the used resources, citations and footnotes which are rather limited and the topics of the research units which are quite general and simple. Likewise, the master programme does not contain any course focused on developing research skills that would be useful for the master and doctoral studies.

1.6. <u>REQUIREMENT</u> The objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.

#### Comments:

Based on the information from the curriculum of the cycle I study programme, the syllabi and the Explanatory Note it can safely be concluded that the objectives, content and learning outcomes of the Master's study programme are clearly distinguishable from those of the Bachelor's study programme.

## 1.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession.

### **Comments:**

Study disciplines of the study programme are presented in a logical succession by covering fundamental and specialized courses during the first year of study and the work on thesis and the internship during the 3<sup>rd</sup> semester (second year of studies). The internship takes place during June-July for a period of 5 weeks. The examination of the Master thesis takes place in December, thus the students have the opportunity to acquire empirical, statistical data, etc. for their thesis.

## 1.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Development of a study programme takes into consideration the needs of the labour market.

#### Comments:

National Police Academy was created based on the Government Decision no 276 of 17 August 1990 and is subordinated to the Ministry of Internal Affairs, which main purpose is to prepare high qualified lawyers for the national internal affairs authorities. Thus, the main beneficiary is the Ministry of Internal Affairs, its territorial subdivisions and the Police General Inspectorate. The admission to the study programme is made in



compliance with the quotas approved by the Government and is in correlation with the needs of the labour-market. Bearing in mind that basically all the graduates are employed within the internal affairs authorities, it can be concluded that from the quantitative point of view, the study programme takes in consideration the labour-market needs.

However, the academy might consider introducing more specialized coursers that would respond appropriately to the new developments and the needs of the employers and students. This conclusion is based on the information obtained during the interviews where coursers on cyber or tax offences where suggested.

## 1.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study programme development is a continuous process which, among others, involves feedback from students, employers and other relevant stakeholders.

#### Comments:

With the view to determine the directions of the training programme the Academy staff analyses collegially and systematically. For that reason, also the feedback from students, graduates and employers is taken into account. The employers and students are members of the Academy Senate and Faculty Council where they participate in the deciding on the study programme's approval. The Academy also conducts surveys (in the form of questionnaires) for students which are distributed at the end of the coursers and at the end of the study programme.

It appears that the development of the study programme is driven more by the initiative of the teaching staff and no clear understanding was achieved as to how the results of the questionnaires are analysed and how they impact the development of the study programme.

## 1.10. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff are aware of the objectives of a study programme and of their role in achieving these objectives.

### Comments:

The staff members are broadly aware of the objectives and their role related to the study programme and they have a leading role in its improvement and development.

The documentation provided reveals a clear distinction between the learning outcomes, content and objectives of the MA level study programmes and the bachelors programme in law. However, there did not seem to be an embedded understanding across staff and students of the concept of learning outcomes and more could be done by the institution to promote a better recognition of their meaning.

### 1.11. REQUIREMENT: Study programme provides opportunities for further education at doctoral level.

#### Comments:

The PhD studies are organized by academy since 1997. The areas of research of the PhD studies cover Criminal Law (criminal law, criminology, criminal procedure, forensics, criminal investigation activities) and Public Law (constitutional law, administrative law, police law, military law, financial law, customs law, informational law, environmental law). From the interviews with the graduates, it appears that the academy is encouraging the graduates who are young members of the academy's staff to pursue doctoral studies. Moreover, the representatives of the academy informed that in order to comply with the provisions of the new Education Code requiring that whole staff shall have a PhD degree by 2018, the members of the academic staff involved in the bachelor programme are encouraged to pursue their doctoral studies and obtain a PhD degree. Currently, about 80% of the whole academic staff have either of PhD degree or are enrolled in doctoral studies.



Though the master study programme is a professional one, it is highly recommended that it contains a specialized course that would develop research skills that would help the students with their work on the master thesis and further doctoral studies.

2. TEACHING AND LEARNING	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	Х		

#### Collected evidence:

- Framework plan for high education (cycle I, cycle II, integrated studies) approved by the Ministry of Education no 455 of 3 June 2011
- MA study programme in Criminal law (Annex 1)
- Syllabi of courses
- Explanatory notes for each course of the study programme (available onsite)
- Diploma Supplement (available during the visit)
- Teaching timetables
- Regulation on the organisation of the master studies (approved by Government's Decision no 1455 of 2007)
- Regulation on internships activities
- Agreements signed between the Academy and institutions that facilitate the organization of internships
- Grading sheet from academic year 2014/15
- Master theses from academic year 2014/15
- Strategy for quality assessment (http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/strategie-asigurare-calitatii.pdf)
- Quality manual (<a href="http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/manual-management-calitatii.pdf">http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/manual-management-calitatii.pdf</a>)
- Facilities and resources seen during the visit: mock court-room, forensic laboratory, crime scene investigation room, library
- Information obtained during the on-site visit and available in the SER
- Website of the Academy

#### **General comments:**

The programme fulfils the requirements set below, as it respects both normative and technical criteria. The teaching methods and materials used could be somewhat more interactive and up to date, but generally they still enable to achieve the study outcomes of the programme. The ET finds that based on the interviews conducted during the site visit and on documentation presented the assessed programme is generally appropriate to prepare specialists for MIA structures. There is however room for improvement when it comes to the suitability of the assessed programme as the basis for III cycle studies.

#### Commendations:

1. There is a modern forensic laboratory at the Academy and a good crime scene investigation room.

#### Recommendations:

- 1. Some disciplines in programme should be adapted to the specificity of the study programme;
- 2. Further implication of students in research activities;
- 3. More transparency through the website;
- 4. Further improvement of the quality manual in order to tackle more directly the issues of learning outcomes;
- 5. The academic level of maters' theses is in obvious need of improvement.
- 2.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Study management is regulated, publicly available, and supports the achievement of learning outcomes. In course of study management development, the results of feedback surveys and the analysis of learning activities are taken into account.

#### Comments:

As for the public availability on the institution's website, there are no mentions regarding the study programme on the website, except for courses timetable for the period 16.09.2014 – 21.05.2015. At the same time, regarding the public character of those information, from the analyses of the website, one could conclude that the latest references date from 2013.

From the documents provided, the Explanatory Note regarding the study outcomes are present and accompanies the Curriculum, as per pt. 14 of the Master Plan from 2011.

At the same time, one can see some material inconsistencies in the curriculum (teaching plan), despite the fact that internship is granted the legal number of credits, stipulated by the Master Plan, those credits are not found in the final calculation of credits, the actual number of credits being 100 instead of 90.

Also, when looking at the Diploma Supplement, the ET could notice the fact that the total amount of ECTS was 90, with internship being granted 5 ECTS instead of the 10 stipulated in the Master Plan and in the Teaching Plan, while the final thesis is granted 25 ECTS instead of the 30.

With regard to the analysis of learning activities, despite the fact there was no reference in that matter in the relevant chapter of the SER, from discussions with relevant stakeholders and analysis of the provided annexes (Regulation of the Department, Regulation of the Police Faculty), one could conclude that this is implemented, including through feedback surveys, including feedback from the major employer.

2.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Within the education process of study programme, efficient teaching strategies are applied (modern, interactive, team-work-based, etc.) and oriented towards active learning of the students.



#### Comments:

The SER stipulates basically that efficient strategies are applied, without further details. From discussions with relevant stakeholders, one could conclude the fact that students are involved in teamwork-based activities, including research papers, the teaching staff using modern techniques such as brainstorming and idea-gathering mechanisms. At the same time, a mock court-room for simulated trials is an interesting tool that allows students to get involved in the reality of the legal activities.

2.3. REQUIREMENT: Within the education process of study programme, up-to-date teaching materials are used.

#### Comments:

The SER states that "lectures and seminars are conducted using modern teaching tools (video-projector, laptop, interactive whiteboard, video surveillance cameras, tablets, computers, multimedia shooting, microscopes; modern methods: e-mail, web page for topics, bibliography, educational resources in electronic form".

The Academy has a forensic laboratory. However the library would need improvements. There is even a system similar to the concept of Crime Scene Investigation room, where students can perform investigative activities in specially organized and monitored environment, allowing their tutors to analyse the way in which they conduct investigations.

However, from discussions with students and alumni, they mentioned the fact that, despite the resources available are rather updated, some improvements of the existing infrastructure could be made.

2.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Organisation of internship is clearly regulated, the requirements for the completion of internship are determined, the instructions for conducting the internship are available and the supervision of students in work environment is ensured.

#### Comment:

Internship is organized accordingly to the Master Plan and stipulated in the curriculum, with proofs in the annexes (Regulation on internships activities, Teaching Plan).

On the website one can find an internal regulation regarding the organization of internships at the level of the Academy.

Although, there are no concrete curricular supports, internships functioning under regulations can be proved, as all students have written characterisations from their internship tutors, which outline how objectives and knowledge were implemented during the internship sessions. As a general conclusion, one could say that the process is monitored by a tutor transmitting methodic practice and individual tasks to the students.

At the same time, as mentioned under point 2.1, in the curriculum (teaching plan), despite the fact that internship is granted the legal number of credits, stipulated by the Master Plan, those credits are not found in the final calculation of credits, the actual number of credits being 100 instead of 90.

2.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution has a network of partner organisations offering internship opportunities for students and supporting the achievement of learning outcomes of study programmes.



#### Comments:

In the curriculum is stipulated the fact that internships are organized within MIA divisions and other relevant institutions.

However, despite the fact that there are no real internship networks, there are agreements signed between the Academy and some institutions that facilitate the organization of internships.

One matter that emerged from discussions with students and alumni is the fact that those internships are organized at their working place, as they are already employees of MIA. This would generate, in most cases, the impossibility to leave their work for five weeks for internships within other sub-structures of the Ministry or in other institutions. For this reason, almost all internships are in the students' current work places.

At the same time, as stated above under 2.4, in the curriculum (teaching plan), the respective credits are not found in the final calculation of 90 credits, the actual number of credits being 100 once 10 credits for internship are taken into account.

Also, as stated above under point 2.4, all students have written characterisations from their internship tutors, which outline how objectives and knowledge were implemented during the internship session, thus supporting the achievement of learning outcomes.

## 2.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Assessment of learning outcomes of students is performed in accordance with the existing requirements. Assessment methodology is consistent with learning outcomes and includes feedback supporting student development.

#### Comments:

There is an internal Regulation regarding the Master Studies (from 2008), available on the website, which contains an evaluation section which stipulates how the evaluations are performed.

The specific fiches for each discipline stipulate how the learning outcomes are evaluated. These stipulations are adequate and in accordance with specific learning outcomes. Also, based on own QA procedures Regulations and strategies, the Academy performs every two years an internal evaluation of the study programme in order to keep it adapted to the quality standards and students said their feedback is taken into consideration.

The evaluation allows to check the way in which students have achieved their goals.

Students are informed about their grades and they have the possibility to be re-evaluated by a new committee, which is appointed yearly. However, the number of appeals is rather low, therefore this committee didn't meet very often. From the analysis of grades catalogues, the ET could see that this is rather generous (the vast majority of grades are 8, 9 or 10), no overall failures were observed, with a 100% success rate for the students that took the examinations.

## 2.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The higher education institution recognizes prior learning and work experiences.

### **Comments:**

As far as 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle is concerned, a general regulation issued by the Ministry of Education stipulates recognition of prior competencies in IT and linguistic areas. Prior learning is in theory recognized, as per point IV of the Regulation regarding the Master Studies, it is stipulated that graduates of other domains than law at BA level can be admitted to the master programmes of the Academy, provided they prove the existence of 30 ECTS for compensating studies. There was no evidence however that any student requested this.

## 2.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Systematic analysis of achievement of learning outcomes is performed and improvement measures are



#### undertaken.

#### Comments:

The SER stipulates that "In the Academy is regularly carried out a systemic analysis of learning outcomes, this being done in the ordinary meetings of the chairs, as well as in the meetings of the Faculty Council, Faculty Senate and the Board of Directors".

In the Strategy for QA, available on the website (<a href="http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/strategie-asigurare-calitatii.pdf">http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/strategie-asigurare-calitatii.pdf</a>), there are some references regarding the improvement measures that should be taken, with no emphasis on learning outcomes. At the same time, there is a Quality Manual, available on the website (<a href="http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/manual-management-calitatii.pdf">http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/manual-management-calitatii.pdf</a>), which contains only general dispositions.

The specific Regulations of the Department and the Faculty stipulate the fact that learning outcomes have to be periodically analysed.

2.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in research and development activities, the supervision of student research papers (seminar papers, applied projects, final thesis) is well organised and the satisfaction rate with the quality of supervision is high.

#### Comments:

In the SER there are general statements regarding the students' involvement in research activities, being stated in the SER the fact that student involvement in research and development activity is an area for improvement and measures will be taken with that regard. They are involved in drafting research projects on different disciplines, besides the final thesis. These papers, drafted according to specific research rules, are quite consistent (20 pages) and their authors have the possibility to present them at scientific events and also publish them partially or entirely. The master theses were presented in their integrality for the last year. From their analysis one could conclude that the system is organized, as all master theses respect the legal requirements at formal level. However, from a content point of view, the master theses are rather limited in terms of studied resources, citations and footnotes. Also, with some exceptions, the research themes are rather general. From discussions with students and stakeholders regarding the anti-plagiarism practices, there is a high level of supervision.

3. TEACHING STAFF	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		X	

#### **Collected evidence:**

- CVs of the full-time members (Annex 6)
- Teachers' qualifications and teaching workload (Annex 5)
- Information on teachers' participation in national and international conferences and seminars (Annex 72, made available during the visit)
- Docmentation on psycho-pedagogy modules compulsory for academic staff
- Evaluation sheets of professional performance of academic staff
- Information obtained during the interviews and available in the SER

#### **General comments:**

The number and the qualifications of the teaching staff complies with the legal requirements and the sustainability of the programme is ensured by an age balance of the staff. The number and the qualification of the teaching staff is sufficient and adequate for achieving objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme. However, the workload of the lecturers is rather high and more efforts are needed from the ministry of internal affairs and academy to seek ways of insuring that staff can travel in order to keep their knowledge up-to-date and their skills at an international level.

#### Commendations:

- 1. The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the legal requirements and the age balance is promoted in order to ensure the sustainability of the programme.
- 2. A mandatory module of 30 ECTS on psycho-pedagogy and a system of supervision of the new lecturers.

#### Recommendations:

- 1. Both the ministry of internal affairs and the academy should seek ways of insuring that staff can travel in order to keep their knowledge up-to-date and their skills at an international level.
- 2. Engage positively and proactively with any opportunities to participate in international research projects.
- 3.1.<u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The number and qualification of full-time teaching staff complies with the requirements established by legislation. At least 60% of the study programme is covered by full-time staff. 100% of full-time staff involved in the study programme have PhD degree or equal.

#### Comments:

The teaching staff involved in the three assessed study programmes consists of 22 members, 16 out of which are full-time employees. This constitutes about 70% of the total staff. 100% of the full-time staff have a PhD.

3.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Distribution of full-time teaching staff by age, and the percentage of young members of the teaching staff, ensures the sustainability of studies in a higher education institution and a study programme.

#### Comments:



The Academy promotes age balance. The average age of the teaching staff involved in all three study programmes is 43 years.

3.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The total number and qualification of teaching staff is – based on their responsibilities, workload and the number of supervised students – sufficient and adequate for achieving the objectives and learning outcomes of the study programmes at MA level.

#### Comments:

The number and the qualification of the teaching staff is sufficient and adequate for achieving objectives and learning outcomes of the study programme. All members have a PhD degree and the workload is distributed based on the number of students enrolled for the programme, maximum allowed teaching load depending on the category of the employee, etc.

Despite the fact that the Academy stated in the SER that it complies with the rule – maximum 1.5 workload and 250 hours for each member of the staff, regardless of the place of employment, the provided information clearly illustrates that most of the staff members have a load exceeding 1 (up to 1.75), one full-time lecturer has a load of 1,5 and additional 150 hours at another university, one part-time member has 1 load and additional 180 hours, and another part-time member has 330 hours, which is more than the threshold of 250 hours.

3.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the teaching staff have an adequate teaching competence and improve their teaching methods.

#### Comments:

New members of the teaching staff have to pass the module of 30 credits on psycho-pedagogy, organized by the Academy. The academy ensures the supervision of the teaching skills and methods of the new assistant lectures by appointing observers who are\_experienced lecturers for supervising and assisting periodically the new academic staff, at least once or twice a month. And from the information obtained during the interviews with the lecturers it can be concluded that the new staff found such kind of assistance very helpful.

3.5. <u>REQUIREMENT</u>: The staff development system is effective: the members of the teaching staff have opportunities for self-improvement, staff development methods are applied by the higher education institution.

#### Comments:

According to SER and as corroborated by the faculty staff, all new members of the teaching staff have to pass the module of 30 credits on psycho-pedagogy, organized by the Academy.

It was also established by the ET from the interviews during the site visit that the Academy ensures the supervision of the teaching skills and methods of the new assistant lectures by appointing observers who are experienced lecturers for supervising and assisting periodically the new academic staff, at least once or twice a month. And from the information obtained during the interviews with the lecturers it can be concluded that the new staff found such kind of assistance very helpful.

There were some indications that some staff was able to travel to abroad conferences in order to develop their skills and participate in international conferences and build international networks. However, some of the academic staff said that foreign travel required the permission of MIA and Academy, and that this was not a straightforward because of their positions as civil servants within the ministry. It is recommended therefore that both the ministry and the academy seeks ways of insuring that staff can travel in order to keep their knowledge



up-to-date and their skills at an international level.

Staff was involved in national research projects, but involvement in international research projects appears to be much more limited. This conclusion is based on the information provided in meetings with academic staff and on the information contained in Annex 72 only a small number of international research projects as distinct from conferences and seminars were listed. The academy is therefore encouraged to continue to be outward looking and to engage positively and proactively with any opportunities to participate in international research projects.

## 3.6.REQUIREMENT: Visiting members of the teaching staff (including from foreign higher education institutions) are involved in teaching in a study programme.

#### Comments:

We were told that some occasional lectures and seminars were given by visitors from overseas for students in the academy. Nevertheless, there was no evidence of regular visiting academics or practitioners involved in teaching credit bearing coursers.

3.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The members of the full-time teaching staff of a higher education institution regularly develop their skills at foreign higher education institutions and participate in international networks.

#### Comments:

There were some indications that some staff were able to travel to abroad conferences in order to develop their skills and participate in international conferences and build international networks. However, some of the academic staff said that foreign travel required the permission of MIA and Academy, and that this was not a straight foreword because of their positions as civil servants within the ministry. It is recommended therefore that both the ministry and the academy seeks ways of insuring that staff can travel in order to keep their knowledge up-to-date and their skills at an international level.

## 3.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching staff are involved in national and international research projects and participate in forums, national and international scientific conferences.

#### Comments:

Staff were involved in national research projects, as witnessed by the CV-s of the faculty members, but involvement in international research projects appears to be much more limited. Based on the information provided in meetings with academic staff and on the information contained in Annex 72 only a small number of international research projects as distinct from conferences and seminars were listed. The academy is therefore encouraged to continue to be outward looking and to engage positively and proactively with any opportunities to participate in international research projects.

There were some indications that some staff were able to travel to abroad conferences in order to develop their skills and participate in international conferences and build international networks. However, some of the academic staff said that foreign travel required the permission of MIA and Academy, and that this was not a straightforward because of their positions as civil servants within the ministry. It is recommended therefore that both the ministry and the academy seeks ways of insuring that staff can travel in order to keep their knowledge up-to-date and their skills at an international level.



## 3.9. REQUIREMENT: Research activities of the teaching staff are planned and monitored efficiently.

The Senate of the Academy is the ultimate body responsible for planning and monitoring research activities of the teaching staff.

For each member staff a document, approved by the rector and prepared annually, set out the teaching and research targets for each academic year. These targets included publications targets which were set individually for each academic. Overall, this provided a mechanism for monitoring and for planning the research activities of the staff.

4. STUDENTS	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'		х	

#### Collected evidence:

- Regulation regarding the Master Studies (approved by Government Decision no 1455 of 2007)
- Charter of the Academy (http://academy.police.md/assets/files/pdf/CARTA-UNIVERSIATRA.pdf)
- Information on the tracking and monitoring mechanism for the graduates (Annexes 60, 61, 77, 78 provided during the visit)
- Data on the employment rate (Annex 76 provided during the visit)
- Psychological counselling facility (laboratory) (visited onsite)
- Charter of the Academy
- Information obtained during the on-site visit (interviews) and available in the SER

#### **General comments:**

In period 2010-2014 there are maximum of 90-110 students annually admitted to MA programme, the graduation rate varies between 90-98%. Drop-out rate vary within the limits of 8.8% - 1.1% for the period 2010 - 2014 as well the average marks on series of studies reflect a positive environment without emphasizing a tendency that would endanger the academic progress.

The Academy needs to find a way to allow academic mobility for both its students and staff. Lacking this opportunity seriously decapacitates the Academy as an academic institution and does not allow to consider this section to be regarded as fully conforming to requirements.

#### Commendations:



- 1. 100% graduation rate;
- 2. Reduced drop-out rate;
- 3. Involvement of students in decision-making process, at least at declaratory level.

#### Recommendations:

- 1. Development of mechanisms for fraud detection;
- 2. Even if mobility is not possible, due to specific status of students and institutions, a mechanism of visits/exchange of good practice should be put in place.
- 4.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The admission requirements for student applicants are based on qualities necessary for completing the study programme. The admission of students is performed by procedures stipulated in the normative acts.

#### Comments:

Admission of students is regulated by a Regulation regarding the Master Studies (from 2008) and different other normative acts drafted by MIA in accordance to the applicable legislation. In order to be admitted, candidates need to have specific qualities in terms of ECTS obtained at BA level (240). It was observed by the ET during the site visit that the Academy in fact follows these admission criteria. Graduates of other domains than law at BA level can in principle be admitted to the assessed master programme, provided they prove the existence of 30 ECTS for compensating studies. There was no evidence however that any student has requested this.

4.2.<u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The counselling system of students (including study, career and psychological counselling) is planned/targeted and effective.

#### Comments:

The SER stipulates the fact that there is a counselling system put in place for the students at Dean's office level. Given the fact that students are also employees of the MIA and can be involved in activities with high psychological impact, this mechanism is completed by a psychological counselling facility (laboratory), offering assistance to all students and graduates that need such help. A laboratory was set for this purpose. Also, from a discussion with the representative of the HR department of MIA, a career training institute is being created in order to further support the process of counselling students and graduates.

4.3. REQUIREMENT: Students are provided with internal and external mobility opportunities.

#### Comments:

There are no mobility opportunities, given the special status of those students, as stated in the SER. However, students stated that they were interested in having such opportunities, as this would help them benefit from good practice from other colleagues.

The representative of the HR department of MIA stated that, as far as the ministry is considered, given the fact that the academy is doing a good job in training the students, the education process is fit for its purpose, hence the mobility are not necessary.



At the same time, officials of the Academy stated that they participated with groups of students at trainings organized abroad by partner institutions, such the Police Academy from Bucharest and Munich, on a regular basis.

The best law schools in Europe make overseas exchange possibilities available for their students and the Academy is encouraged to do what it can to open similar opportunities to its students.

Without those opportunities, the students will, over time, be disadvantaged in the global market place for work.

4.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students participate in international mobility programmes. The percentage of students participating in student mobility is stable or growing.

#### Comments:

No students have partciapated in International mobility programmes.

This is a draw-back mentioned by students, as MIA employees cannot go abroad as easily as regular students. This is a disadvantage, as they could go abroad and benefit from good practices of foreign institutions.

4.5. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Students are involved in the decision-making process at different levels of the higher education institution.

#### Comments:

As per the Charter of the Academy, available on the website, students are part of the Council of the Faculty and of the Senate. This aspect was confirmed by students and alumni, whom mentioned the fact that they have the possibility to elect their representatives in the governing bodies of the Academy.

At the same time, from discussion with students, it resulted that they have been consulted about the disciplines in the curriculum.

4.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A system has been established for the detection and prevention of academic fraud.

#### Comments:

The Regulation regarding the Master Studies stipulates that students that intended to fraud their exams are expelled from the examination room, with right to repeat the exam based on a fee. From discussions with the students, it was stipulated that a verification system is implemented for all thesis/papers elaborated within the Academy and destined to be presented or published.

As far as final thesis are concerned, the coordinator assures also the fact that the papers respect the anti-plagiarism principles and papers are verified, as they are submitted also in an electronic format which is submitted to verifications.

4.7. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Higher education institution has a tracking mechanism of graduates' employment and is monitoring the evolution of graduates' career.

#### Comments:

As the students are also employees of the MIA and as stated in the SER, there are such evidences in the annexes provided (60, 61, 77, 78). They were also confirmed by students and alumni.

4.8. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The competitiveness of the graduates of a study programme is demonstrated by employment rate according to obtained qualification; unemployment rate; employment rate in other fields than the one studied within the



#### programme.

#### Comments:

The SER states a 100% employment rate, as students are already employees of MIA upon their admission. From the annex provided this information is correct (Annex 76).

4.9. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> There is a system in place for monitoring academic progress. Graduation of students per each year meets the legal requirements. Effective measures are implemented to reduce the drop-out rates.

#### Comments:

The SER states that such a system exists and in 2013 a survey was performed within the divisions of the MIA, as graduates were already employees of MIA upon their admission. However, as also stated in the SER, there is no subdivision that would perform an activity of career guidance, despite the fact that at the Dean's office level there is a counselling system put in place for the students. The drop-out rates decreased from 8.8% in 2010 to a mere 1.1% in 2014.

5. RESOURCES	conforms to requirements	partially conforms to requirements	does not conform to requirements
mark with 'X'	Х		

#### Collected evidence:

- Number of enrolled and graduate students (Annex 27 provided during the onsite visit)
- Facilities visited onsite: auditoriums, libraries, laboratories (forensic, CSI Lab facilities, mock court-room), wi-fi network
- Moodle platform, EBSCO database and two other legal and jurisprudence databases
- Information obtained during the on-site visit (interviews) and available in the SR

#### **General comments:**

The ET was convinced that the Academy operates on a solid financial footing. The institution has a clear vision of its place in Moldovan higher education system and it is suitable as well as able to fulfil their role. The facilities and other infrastructure of the Academy allow it to perform its functions.

### **Commendations:**

- 1. Good facilities;
- 2. Solid financial ground.

#### Recommendations:



- 1. Constant update of library;
- 2. Further development of IT-capacities;
- 3. Purchase of access to more relevant research databases.

## 5.1. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> The financial resources of a higher education institution are adequate for conducting studies, development activities related to studies and supporting the development of the teaching staff.

#### Comments:

From the SER it appears that the Academy has adequate financial resources to conduct studies in a stable way.

At the same time from the SER one notices the fact that the Academy has adequate logistics, both in term of housing as in terms of equipment. The visit confirmed the fact that resources are adequate, although improvements could be made (additional budget for the library, finances for mobility programmes). From discussions with the rector, the annual budget is around 2 million US Dollars.

5.2. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Trends in the number of students and graduates, and the budget of a higher education institution in the last three to five years indicate sustainability.

#### Comments:

From the data provided in the SER, the number of graduates was increasing in terms of percentage related to the enrolled students. Annex 27 confirms the sustainability of this process.

5.3. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Teaching and learning environments have been developed according to the teaching and learning objectives, include all facilities necessary for conducting studies in a given study programme and are of adequate capacity considering the number of students (auditoriums, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for students independent work and recreation, video projectors, internet etc.).

#### Comments:

The SER states that there are such facilities. At the visit the ET could see some auditoriums, libraries, laboratories (forensic, CSI Lab facilities, mock court-room for simulated trials). In the whole building (except the areas with restricted/confidential regime) there is a wi-fi network that students can access through their own identification given by the Academy.

5.4. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> Both the conduct of studies and other activities of a higher education institution are supported by up-to-date information technology solutions, including the study information system, e-learning opportunities, and communication portals for students and teaching staff.

#### Comments:

Although the SER stipulates that IT technology and facilities are up-to-date, the website is not updated and many of the minimum information regarding the study programs are not available.

However, as stated under point 5.6, there is a Moodle platform, as well as subscription to EBSCO database and two other legal and



jurisprudence databases that students can access through their own identification given by the Academy.

However, from discussions with students, there seem to be an appetite for greater computing power to be made available. The Academy should keep its IT provisions under constant review and update-it appropriately in order to ensure it keeps pace with the fast moving area. This is especially true as the Academy is training police officers to work in areas where cyber enabled crime is becoming increasingly sophisticated.

#### 5.5. REQUIREMENT: The students are provided with dormitories and medical service.

#### Comments:

There are dormitories for the master students that remain in the Academy to teach, as most of dormitories are destined to BA students and master students have already housing. Within the Academy there is a medical service.

Also, students, as they are employees of MIA, benefit from the services of the Polyclinic of MIA, located in the vicinity of the Academy.

5.6. <u>REQUIREMENT:</u> A library supports the conduct of studies ensuring that up-to-date information sources are available, and provides students with the opportunities for independent work.

#### Comments:

From the analysis of the available resources on the website and the list of volumes in the library, teaching materials are rather scarce. The details available on the website are apparently not in accordance with the details provided in the SER. At the same time, the capacity of the library is for only 6.2% of the students, which is a rather low number.

At the visit the ET learned that the Academy has purchased a subscription to access EBSCO database and has access to two other electronic legal resources, namely the databases of the Ministry of Justice with regard to the jurisprudence of Moldovan courts, as well as a general database with all normative acts drafted by all institutions within central administration. At the same time, students, mentioned the fact that, despite they have access to different other libraries and have enough bibliographic resources at their disposal, improvements could be made.